UNIVERSITY OF WAH
JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron
Prof. Jameel - Un Nabi
Vice Chancellor

Editor-in-Chief
Prof. Mushtaq Ahmed
Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities

Editors
Dr. Wajiha Kanwal
Assistant Professor, Department of Education
Dr. Jamil Ahmed Sheikh
Lecturer, Department of Sociology

Advisory Board

National

Prof. Anila Kamal
Vice Chancellor
Rawalpindi Women University, Rawalpindi

Prof. Sikandar Hayat
Dean Faculty of Social Sciences
FC University, Lahore

Prof. Muhammad Zaman
Chairman Department of Sociology
Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad

Prof. Aliya H. Khan
Former Dean Social Sciences
Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad

Prof. Amna Mahmood
Former Dean Faculty of Social Sciences
International Islamic University, Islamabad

Prof. Wasima Shahzad
Professor of English
Air University, Islamabad

Prof. Hidayat Khan Burki
Chairman Department of Sharia
Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad

International

Prof. Aslam Syed
Professor Emeritus of History
Bochum University, Germany

Dr. Muhammad Faizal bin A. Ghani
Associate Professor
University of Malaya, Malaysia

Prof. Ghazala Rehman
Chairperson Psychology
Redhill Surrey University, UK

Prof. Hanita Hasan
Chairperson, Language Academy
University of Technology, Malaysia

Dr. Seema Gul
Chairman, Department of Psychology
Prince Sultan University Riyadh, KSA

Dr. Muhammad Tahir Jan
Associate Professor
International Islamic University, Malaysia
### UNIVERSITY OF WAH
Journal of Social Sciences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Volume 6, Issue 1, June 2023</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Wah Journal of Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim and Scope</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaf Culture as Locus of Religious Identity: Ethnographic Study of a Residential School for DEAF in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naureen Altaf alias Taniya Shah &amp; Dr. Muhammad Ilyas Bhatti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Problems Faced by Migrant Workers in Country of Destination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faiz Rasool, Majid Hussain Alis Ghalib Hussain &amp; Shahnaz Bano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-compassion and Hardiness as Protective Factors for Mental Health: Exploring the Relationship and Demographical Differences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samina Rashid, Sehrish Iqtedar &amp; Hābiba Shaheen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the Social Stigma Surrounding Mental Health and Suicides in District Ghizer, Gilgit-Baltistan, Pakistan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zubair Ahmed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing Pakistan’s Responses towards Covid-19: A Policy Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Summar Iqbal Babar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship of Self-Esteem and Personality Traits and their Impact on Academic Achievement among University Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamid Ali Nadeem, Arshad Mehmood Qamar &amp; Farkhanda Bashir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Writing Problems Faced by ESL Learners in Higher Education Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amna Umar, Dr. Muhammad Ajmal &amp; Dr. Fouzia Ajmal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary School Social Studies Curriculum: Comparison of National Curriculum (NC) 2006 and Single Nation Curriculum (SNC) 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rabia, Dr. Syed Abdul Waheed &amp; Dr. Nadia Gilani</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers’ Beliefs and Practices Regarding their Feedback to Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>at Elementary Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Analysis of Attitudinal Resources in Noam Chomsky and Shah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmood Qureshi’s speeches at United Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quest for separate space: Prospects and Challenges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
UNIVERSITY OF WAH JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

The 'UW Journal of Social Sciences' (UWJSS) is a bi-annual publication of the University of Wah duly recognized by the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan in the category of Y. As an international journal, it is dedicated to understand the intricacies of research through empirical investigations and theoretical descriptions. UWJSS is a double-blind peer-reviewed journal that publishes quality articles in the field of Social Sciences.

AIM AND SCOPE

The main purpose of the UWJSS is to invite the novel work of policymakers, practitioners, professionals, educationist, university teachers and post-graduate research scholars in seeking excellence in the field of Social Sciences at national and international levels.

Consequently, the aim of the UWJSS is to publish articles that contribute significantly to the body of knowledge in the field of Social Sciences. It publishes articles and case studies relating to all fields of Social Sciences and Humanities.

The Editorial Board of UWJSS welcomes quality research articles from all areas of Social Sciences. The board encourages quality research from the new scholars seeking to advance in their academic careers. Therefore, UWJSS welcomes research articles in the areas of:

- Anthropology
- Economics
- Education
- English Literature and Linguistics
- International Relations
- Islamic Studies
- Mass Communication
- Pakistan Studies
- Political Science
- Psychology, and
- Sociology
EDITORIAL

Dear Readers

Another issue of UWJSS is in your hands, which is filled with innovative ideas and critical thinking to generate constructive academic debate. We have been able to retain the HEC recognition in Y category for the period 2022-23, which manifests our standards and hard work. However, we still aspire to be flying high to mark our recognition internationally.

We have brought changes in the Editorial Board to make it more inclusive and reputed. The direction and input of esteemed members are the real essence of our success. The sustained patronage of vice chancellor and financial support of HEC are the backbone of our continuous upward strides. And the devotion of our editorial team is remarkably outstanding. We are grateful to our national and international reviewers for their valuable quality time to uphold the standards and reputation of UWJSS.

We have made sure that our contributing authors have worked hard to make their research worth publishing, yet scores of papers have not been able to find space due to rigorous blind review process and editorial discretion. However, we hope that these authors would continue to bring innovation, critical thinking and incorporate fast-changing academic landscape to mark their presence yet again.

The feedback of our valued readers; researchers, practitioners and policy makers, is always welcome to make the UWJSS more competitive and reputed. We wish to produce better and better publications.

Have happy reading.

Editor-in-Chief
**UW Journal of Social Sciences (UWJSS)** is a bi-annual, open access research journal published by University of Wah and recognized by the HEC. It is committed to serve as a key resource for providing facts and figures to the scholars related to the field of Social Sciences at state level as well as globally.

**Copyright:** All rights are reserved. No part of this journal may be reproduced or translated in any form or by any means without prior permission of UW journal publication authorities.

**Disclaimer:** The expressions in articles published by the UWJSS are specific to those of the authors and are not necessarily the opinions and reflections of the journal authorities, editorial board, advisory board, or the University of Wah. The publication is subject to the peer blind review by the subject specific reviewers. Neither University of Wah, nor the editorial board is responsible for errors or any concerns ensuing from the information provided in research articles, instead all the errors must be reported to the corresponding authors directly.
Deaf Culture as Locus of Religious Identity: Ethnographic Study of a Residential School for DEAF in Pakistan

Naureen Altaf alias Taniya Shah
Ph.D scholar, Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.
Email. taniya.anthro@gmail.com

Dr. Muhammad Ilyas Bhatti
Assistant Professor, Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.
Ilyas_bhatti@hotmail.com

Abstract

This research paper builds upon ethnographic fieldwork carried out as doctoral research at Pakistan’s largest public sector Special education premises for the Deaf at its capital Islamabad. Sign Languages at large defines the identity and representation for the Deaf communities round the globe, which makes them the largest minority of the world comprising 72 million people communicating through more than 300 sign languages. The relationship of Religion and language has gained repute in anthropological literature since the early developments in subject but with specific reference to signing communities or deaf people, the corpus of anthropology still remains scant. In this paper, the functional domain of religion within the deaf community is explored from emic perspective through 33 Deaf narratives. The findings are carried out as analysis of themes and sub themes thus emerged from the narratives which were recorded in sign language in the presence of an interpreter. Transcription of video recorded narratives in English was later revisited by the respondents to maximize their ownership in the written expression. The themes located were causes of one’s deafness, oralism (Policy to teach deaf to do lip reading and learn to speak instead of signing), Audism (A belief that deaf are inferior to hearing ones), religion, education, community, conflict, authority, access, and continuity and change. The thick description of how abstraction of religion shifts to signed symbols and how these notions interplay in daily life of deaf residents at a deaf-space intends to add on into the existing scholarly pool on Deaf Culture.

Keywords: Deaf Culture, Deafhood, Identity, Religion, Personal Experience Narratives (PENs)

Introduction

The World Health Organization (WHO) mentions 5% of the total world’s population or above 430 million people with a disabling hearing loss. Moreover, the concentration of deaf population is projected at 80% in the developing and under-developed world. Consequently, when the 5% statistical count is implied on Pakistan’s population according to the latest Census done in 2017, we have a total population of 207.68 million and about 10 million people in the country currently have a disabling hearing loss. In sheer contrast, the census of 2017 counts the total numbers of persons with
Disabilities at 0.48% of total population which has raised a big question on its credibility by the relevant International organizations, PWDs organizations and the civil society (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2017 Census).

It became disputed to the level that the official websites and portals of government ministries and departments linked to rehabilitation of PWDs did not acknowledged census figures. Thus, projections were quoted either as per World Health Organization or the Census of 1998 which mentioned 2.38% as persons with disabilities (PWDs) out of which 7.40% comprises deaf population. Message by The President of Pakistan on International day for persons with disabilities 3rd December 2022 at Islamabad also quoted the WHO projected data of PWDs in Pakistan. By all means a significant deaf population exists in the country. However, this number transforms into a community only when their sense of belonging to one and other and the distinction from hearing world supersedes their feeling of loss and deprivation. Thus, a Deaf school consequently becomes an ideal space to study such community and its practices.

The term “deaf” denoted with small “d” is a medical terminology meaning any person who does not beholds hearing thresholds of 20 decibels or better in both ears. Such condition is referred as hearing loss which may be mild, moderate, severe and profound. However, throughout this paper, by the term deaf, only the last two categories are the reference which includes severe and profound deafness in bilateral ears. The severe hearing loss is calculated as loss of 61 to 80 decibels and from 81db onwards, it falls in the category of profound deafness. The rationale for opting only these two categories in the research is due to the criterion adopted by national Council for Rehabilitation of Persons with Disabilities (NCRDP) for issuance of disability certificate as deaf or Hearing impaired. NCRDP is the government institution working in the ambit of Ministry of Human Rights and is responsible for registration of PWDs in the country. The admission policy of a special education center where the present ethnographic study was carried out thus grants admission only to deaf students with severe and profound hearing loss.

Accordingly, children coming for admission when found with mild and moderate hearing loss through audiometric assessments done by a professional audiologist of the center, are not likely to be granted admission here and are encouraged to be main streamed along the use of hearing aids (sound amplifying devices worn inside an ear). Moreover, their parents are guided to discourage signed communication and proceed for speech therapy along mainstreaming. On the other hand, the children categorized as with severe and profound deafness are believed to require sign language as the major medium of their communication and thus get registered for admission.

Religion can be defined through multiple approaches like operational, analytical, essential or supernatural but all of these angles by large converge on its significance for mankind in their thoughts, actions, experiences and expectations. This pertinence of religion is equally relatable to the Deaf community in Pakistan. Deaf community in the present research signifies a group of Deaf people who do not have communication barrier between them and form a minority as Deaf World on basis of their shared language called Sign Language. This specific language is a route to Deaf Culture which is a distinctive way of life by deaf community and implies, “The customs, habits, ideas, beliefs, institutions, etc. which a particular group through a shared language, holds in common” (Padden, 1993).
Significance and Limitations

The present study adds up to the corpus on deaf hood and has emphasized the anthropological angle to Deaf identity. Another strength of the study is the interplay of Social Identity theory and the Framework of Deafhood as conceptual framework. From Pakistan, no previous anthropological study of deaf community is carried out thus it is a first step to unleash the potential of deaf culture to the researchers in future (Ladd, 2003). A limitation of the study is absence of the gendered perspective of the deaf community on Religion as it was specifically carried out with deaf male students.

Locale of Study

The Pakistan Sign Language (PSL) though is referred as the sign language of the country but a very scant corpus of standardized PSL is available. The wide variations of sign language do exist regionally and is also found at level of deaf education schools working in the same region in Pakistan, which is understandably prevalent due to lack of standardization.

Since 18th amendment in the constitution passed in 2010, the education sector is looked over by provinces, which was earlier a federal government business. Simultaneously, Special Education in Pakistan was also taken up by provinces post 18th amendment whereas in the Federal Capital of Islamabad, an exclusive directorate operates by name of Directorate General of Special Education. The directorate was established in 1985 as an attached department of the Ministry of Health, Social Welfare and Special Education through a Presidential Directive and was working throughout the country. At present, this Directorate is functioning under Ministry of Human Rights and is only limited to ambit of federal area. It has disability wise special education centres in Islamabad for education, rehabilitation and pre-vocational training (The Constitution of Pakistan Eighteenth Amendment Act, 2010).

Amongst the service delivery institutions, National Special Education Centre of Hearing-Impaired children in sector H-9/4 is the largest in area, student enrollment, staff strength and budget utility where at present 650 students both boys and girls are studying from kindergarten till graduation level with a staff capacity of 152 including 67 special education teachers. The centre stretches over 9 acres and the yearly budget allocation for the institution is about 120 million rupees. (six hundred fifty-nine thousand USD as per march 2022). The boarding facility upto 50 students enrolled in college wing is available for male students only. Students who seek admission to the centre after completion of maximum level of education available at their natal place, no accommodation available in federal area, age above 15 years and a character certificate from last attended educational institution are pre-requisites for the admission in hostel. A waiting list is also maintained and recorded as only few applicants gets the boarding facility.

Although separate hostel premises for deaf boys and girls are part of the building complex but the Girls hostel never became functional since construction in 1989. The ground floor of the two-story building of girl’s hostel was utilized as Boys Hostel whereas its upper floor is in occupation of another department of the ministry of Human Rights namely Transgender Protection Unit, the first of its kind in country inaugurated in October 2021 to safeguard the rights of trans-genders in the country. The hostel building which is originally designated for boys remained in a decade old occupation of another department Pakistan Bait ul Mal but even after vacation of building, shifting was never materialized because of budget constraints in lieu of repair and renovation by the Directorate.
Hostel presently operates in 10 rooms each 20x22 ft in size with 6 beds. There are 6 wooden cupboards fixed in corners and study tables besides each bed. One room is in use of warden and one is used as a Masjid\(^1\) where students offer 5 times obligatory prayers as per muslim faith. The namaz\(^2\) ritual is headed by the warden who is basically recruited to teach enrolled students as a junior teacher for Islamic studies in the centre and has been assigned an additional duty of warden without any financial perks as the centre doesn’t have any official vacancy of hostel warden or assistant hostel warden. His family stays in a village of district Sukkur in Sindh Province (1000 km apart) and the additional duty only allows him free stay and food.

The 48 boarders reside in 8 rooms which are without attached bathrooms. However, at the time of research only 33 students were residing in the hostel. The students take three times meals in the dining hall, watch TV in lounge, offer prayers in room designated as masjid and use the playground for their physical games and recreation. There are fixed timings for meals, prayers and study. Students are supposed to make rooms and do laundry by themselves. The services are free of cost except Parents Teachers Association Fund amounting roughly to eleven dollars a month.

**Theoretical Framework**

In order to provide explanations for occurrences and to study stylized patterns of social phenomenon, social scientists look upon some underlying theories that could lead the direction of inquiry and analysis. The present research was carried out bridging Social Identity theory which has roots in social Psychology, and framework of Deafhood by Ladd which views the visual language as central to Deaf interaction (Ladd, 2003).

Tajfel and his colleagues built Social Identity Theory on the construction of self through group conformity. It implies that the “we” feeling guides an individual to think, act and react in a particular way. Social identities are most potent when group membership is considered as central to one’s reflection of self and strong emotional ties are attached with the group. The process involves distinct stages. The first stage is of categorization in which a person is assigned a social group. In the second stage called identification the person adopts the identity and conforms to the norms of the group. Finally, in the stage of comparison, the person views his identity as unique and develops a sense of pride through comparison with other groups (Tajfel & Turner, 1986). Identically Deafhood is a term coined by Paddy Ladd and introduced as a process which attempts to construct and convey an affirmative and positive position of being deaf.

**Research Design**

The Maxwell’s interactive Model of Research Design consists of five main components and was adopted for the present research wherein the goal was to study the relationship and interplay of deaf culture and religious identity. First component is the conceptual framework which relies upon Social identity theory and explains that identity is a social construction and involves stages of categorization, identification and comparison. The research approach of the present study is emergent research approach thus not strictly prescribing the research plan and has a roam for flexibility (Creswell, 2014). This was also important because the corpus of PSL and deaf culture is still meager. Component two is

---

\(^1\) A place designated for religious prayers of Muslims. It can be an independent building or a room within a building to offer five time prayers a day.

\(^2\) Urdu term to denote the Arabic term Salaat, ritual prayers offered by Muslims.
of research questions. What Deaf experiences relating to religion are embedded in personal narratives? How Deaf and religious identities interplay in a deaf community? These two major research questions were framed. Maxwell third component is of methods meaning the strategies and techniques of data collection and its analysis.

![Maxwell Interactive Model of Research Design](image)

Figure 1. Maxwell Interactive Model of Research Design. (Maxwell, 2005)

The prime method adopted for the research is Personal experience Narrative (PEN) which is based on the narratives about our everyday lives. In PENs, whatever one tells about self, there are pertinent expressions and experiences central to a narrator. The narrations contain typicality; build up of knowledge based on already gained experiences. Our understanding of daily occurrences emerge from this typicality. (Schutz, 1966) Deaf and Hearing worlds are different from one and other though apparently they share the same world. This difference can be gauged well through personal experience narratives.

The 5th and last component of Maxwell’s research design is validity which is about the credibility of the research. The present study responded to the validity part through steps including the recordings of the signed data in a routine setting of narrators, seeking expertise of a trained signing interpreter who is familiar to participants, revisiting the narrators along translated transcriptions of signed data to discuss and review.

**Ethical considerations**

Research ethics kept in consideration included explaining the purpose of study, seeking consent, clarity on usage of data in future, confidentiality, protecting the wellbeing and autonomy of narrators, reciprocity and reflexivity particularly to the “Backyard Research” as coined by Creswell (2014) to mention research carried out in one’s own community. It is important that deaf community doesn’t only consist of deaf members nevertheless it also includes the persons who are given the right of membership by the deaf themselves like their signing teachers and associated staff, CODA3 and social advocates working along.

---

3Acronym for Child of a Deaf Adult, the term coined by Millie Brother.
Nevertheless, researcher’s background of working with Deaf for more than a decade in capacity of a social case worker and acquaintance with PSL was one strong factor to opt personal experiences narratives as master tool of data collection and, the absence of this bond could possibly yield controlled narrative. Besides this, communicating fluently in sign language with the narrators facilitates rapport building and was found to be positive attribute of insider research. Being from staff of the centre, it also facilitated access to the boarding complex.

**Methodology**

All the 33 students availing the boarding facility at the time when research was conducted consented for participation. Each narrator was asked to narrate his experience being a deaf. The one-time narration was up to three minutes. This sharing of visual narratives took place in a consistent eye contact between the interlocutors as to avoid a feeling of signing for recording purpose in front of a camera only. The availability of fellow mate along a familiar interpreter and researcher also helped in avoiding a more restrict and formal research setting. PENs by deaf community are not only a composition of signs but these are rich capsules of emotions as gestures and symbols accompanied along the signing experiences. The endorsement of these gestures, flow of emotions as laughter or tears, and pauses were also made a part of transcription. In sign language, there is little possibility of Verbatim transcription and thus translated transcriptions are constructed. Qualities of hand and body movement and facial expression of a signer are visual characteristics equivalent to “voice” that don’t transfer easily into writing. (McKee 2011)

A thematic analysis was carried out to document the deaf experiences in relation to religion. This allowed tracing the commonalities, frequency, differences and also explored meaningful contexts in which experiences are shared by the narrators. The data Analysis framework included sorting experience, typicality and designation of a theme to the experience. The data was initially segregated either as culturally specific which is exclusive to deaf world or interactional where deaf and hearing worlds meet each other. For instance, depending on visual clue for keeping silence in respect during Adhaan\(^4\) is a culturally specific experience of deaf world whereas visiting a mosque for Friday congregation is an interactional experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Narrative topic</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Sub theme</th>
<th>Cultural content</th>
<th>Interactional content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HIC 1-A</td>
<td>Friday congregation at Jamia Masjid</td>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>Dependence on visuals, feeling</td>
<td>tap on shoulder as a physical clue</td>
<td>Deaf didn’t know what the sermon was all about</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: template of data coding and analysis.

Very few of research studies focused on the religious practices of the deaf among Muslim community. Furthermore, the existing studies found the deaf as falling low on religious obligations and also impassive in learning the topics and issues related to religion. Zalihah Isa deduced that the deaf are unsuccessful in developing their spirituality and religious practices. Further studies reveal the challenges in religious theory, teachings, interpretation of religious texts, and

---

\(^4\) call for the ritual Prayers made from the minaret of Masjid by a muezzin on speaker
understanding of Friday sermons, and explanation on ways to perform the Hajj, all of which include the issues that have not been fully resolved for the deaf in the effort to increase religious understanding within the deaf community.

Three distinct studies carried out over a decade span by Hashim, Isa, Salleh and Huzairi converge on a conclusion that deaf students were interested in learning and considered the learning of religious rituals as significant but at the same time they considered the religious education sessions less useful and thus students did not pay attention to religious teaching sessions. Whereas another study by Ismail in 2009 emphasized evangelization to the deaf at Kualumpur Malaysia, which proposed that understanding the deaf from the angle of behaviour, character, taboos, and their interests is essential for religious preaching to the deaf. The present research conflicts with the inference that Deaf community is low at religious beliefs and practices, and finds the deaf community as very responsive to religious identities. It instead emphasizes that the way they perceive and experience religion needs to be understood in their emic perspective (Mohad, Mokhtar & Omar, 2018).

Findings and Discussion

Themes of cause of deafness, religion, oralism, audism, community, religion, education, access, continuity and change, conflict and authority emerged from the data. The focused coding as suggested by Merten and Wilson (2012) lead to sub themes growing like lateral branches of a tap root which included dependence on visuals, missed information, finding peace, swear upon Allah and Prophet Muhammad SAW, feeling ignored or taken for granted, deliberate isolation, religious functions and feasts, confidence in group, conflict resolution, sacred and profane, life after death, surveillance by the writing angels, need of written expression for explaining to others and physical clues like tapping were located.

Narrators have religious explanations for their deafness, most frequent of which is the will of Allah who is God, Creator of all as per muslim faith. Out of 33 only 2 narrated their deafness because of their parents being first cousins and only one mentioned high-grade fever and seizures in early years of life as his cause of deafness.

The transfer of religious knowledge and religious experiences in deaf is primarily carried out through the deaf space in contrast to their natal homes. This deaf space in present study implies to the Deaf school and their hostel. During religious festivals and sacred days, the religious identity suppresses the deaf identity and the group solidarity is somewhat shaken on sectarian lines; however, this suppression is very brief and momentary. It also operated in the sacred and profane realm of religion for deaf including their daily cuisine. For instance, there is only one Non-Muslim boarder who belongs to Hindu faith. His religion prohibits slaughter of cow and thus consuming beef is against the faith, nevertheless beef is staple meal consumption of Muslim students residing at hostel. Whenever beef is cooked as per menu, a separate meal is given to the student belonging to Hindu faith. However, he takes his distinctive meal on the same table with rest without any situation of conflict. The Hindu deaf student shares the room with 3 Muslim students but the religious identity does not confront to their deaf identity as a community.

---

A person belonging to faith called Hinduism also known as Sanatana Dharma, one of the world's oldest living religion and a belief in many gods.
Three students of hostel belong to Shia sect. They offer nimaz individually in the same room designated as Mosque 3 times a day. In the month of Muharram, they visit Imam bargah for maajlis e AZA and nimaz and are often accompanied by their deaf friends who are not shia. In the fasting month of Ramazan, the 3 shia deaf students observe sehri and aftar timings according to their sect although they dine in collectively. Their other deaf friends help the 3 to observe their fasting timings which are almost ten minutes earlier at sehri and ten minutes later at aftar.

The deaf narratives saw the establishment of trans-gender protection unit in the upper part of their building as a threat to their religious and deaf identity. They view the colorful and shimmery women’s attire, heavy makeup, cat walk like gait and weird gestures of trans-genders as un-ethical and against their religious norms. Few narratives included visual mockery of trans-gender as well.

Religion enables to observe the fluidity of deaf identities in a group particularly in a kin-based society in Pakistan. Deaf understanding of religion is primarily performance based like ablation, standing for prayers, dressing up for Friday sermon, preparing for religious festivals, and explaining religion through Quranic stories mentioning actions. The narrators view deaf not as persons with disabilities in terms of religious obligations whereas their view of physically challenged, visually impaired and intellectually challenged persons is of the dependent ones who are not able to follow religious obligations. In comparison, they were appreciative in their narratives to the Creator for being deaf but not disabled like the others. The day to day life experiences by deaf floats between deaf and hearing worlds. This interaction deepens their sense of identity because in the hearing world, the deaf have individual experiences of isolation, missing information, alienation, oralism, audism, lack of understanding, lack of confidence and lack of authority and autonomy. Nevertheless, whenever deaf community interacts as majority with a member of hearing world, the frame is reversed and same feelings of isolation and alienation are reported by the hearing person.

Not a single deaf narrative was found without mentioning a religious experience. Prayer is a community experience and there is pressure of group conformity to offer prayer ritual collectively but on the same time sectarian difference is respected. The religious experiences of Deaf as narrative are accompanied by emotions apparent as gestures and upper torso movements. The religious identity also contributes to group solidarity as was narrated in case of the practices in the Islamic month of fasting. The conflict resolution in the deaf community is facilitated by religious notions of good and evil, reward and punishment, their constant surveillance by angels deputed to write down deeds, life after death, and the day of judgment.

The signs like Allah knows everything; Beginning in the name of Allah; expressing Last Prophet Muhammad (Peace be Upon him) as the most sacred being to swear upon by gestures and action of touching tips of fingers of both hands joined together to their lips and then to eyes and forehead as sign of extreme reverence; Satan as rival of humans and

---

6 One of the two branches of Islam. Shia sees Hazrat Ali (son in law of the Prophet Muhammad Peace be upon Him) and the Imams (Male progeny of Hazrat Ali) as the only rightful successors of the last Prophet of Islam.
7 First month of the Islamic calendar in which grand son of last Prophet of Islam was martyred along his retinue.
8 A Congregation hall or a complex for Shia Muslims.
9 Congregations held in Muharram for mourning the Karbala incident, 680AD.
10 The 9th month of Islamic calendar, in which muslims do fasting for whole month.
11 Morning meal eaten by Muslims in Ramazan before sun rise to begin their fast.
12 Meal held at sun set to break the fast by Muslims in Ramazan.
responsible for their anger, evil thoughts, actions and bad dreams; Promise of reward and punishment in the life after ;and sorry are the most common practices recorded in narrations.

**Conclusion**

Personal Experience Narratives offer a promising strategy to study the place of religion in a deaf world. Data gathered by deaf narrators and the repetitive religious signs employed by them was analyzed to find rich capsules of experiences revolving around the realm of religion by the deaf community. The pertinence and application of religion in the mundane life of deaf students at a deaf-space is extremely vivid and earlier accounts of deaf falling low on religion are sturdily divergent by the present research. To conclude, the significance of religion among the deaf needs to be studied and evaluated through their lens and their sign language instead of the evaluations offered by the hearing world.
References


Ladd, P. 2003. Understanding Deaf Culture: In Search of Deafhood. Clevedon: Cromwell Press Lane,


Web Resources:
https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/deafness-and-hearing-loss
https://www.pbs.gov.pk/content/brief-census
Health Problems Faced by Migrant Workers in Country of Destination

Faiz Rasool
PhD Scholar, Department of Anthropology,
Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad.
Frasool@anth.qau.edu.pk

Majid Hussain Alis Ghalib Hussain
Assistant Professor, Development Studies,
Bahria University, Islamabad Campus.
majidtalairi@gmail.com

Shahnaz Bano
Assistant Gender and Poverty Wing, IFAD
MPhil Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad.
Shahnazahmadmir8@gmail.com

Abstract
The out-migration from underdeveloped countries like Pakistan is considering the only hope for the individuals as the survival strategy which leads towards the well-being of the left behind families, but this migration come along various health hazardous which did not consider a policy or human rights issue. The study focused upon the 3-D works (dangerous, dirty and degrading) which leads towards hazardous working environment that is the violation of labor laws. In the destination countries e.g. UAE various supervisor and the employers forced migrants for such work to get more benefits. The data was extracted from the MPhil dissertation; the area of the study was Dera Ghazi Khan; the labor migrants were in-depth interviewed. The overall working conditions / environment was narrated by the respondents discussed in the article. Study highlighted various health issues faced by the migrants in the country of destination due to various legalities and non-serious attitude of suppliers / employers toward migrants’ health.

Key Words: Health Problems, Exploitation, Labor Migration, Low-skilled

Introduction
Last century witnessed the extensive international labour migration. Hundreds of labourers, skilled or unskilled traveled to the economically developed areas as the survival strategy for their families. It was stated over 105 million people traveled to the country of destination from their home lands. Historically, from last 70s onward the number of out-migrants becomes doubled i.e. Asia (50 m), North America (41 m) and Europe (56 m) were recorded. As per the data of UN in 2005, published in word economics and social survey (2004) the overall number of out-migrants outside
of their country of birth were 163 m. The number of international migrants were 281 million in 2020 (UN DESA, 2021; ILO, 2021), from them two-third are the labor migrants. Certain studies included visitors (on business or personal trips) included in the number of migrants that roughly made one million people on the move between the high to low or middle to low or low to middle income countries each week. A number of reasons were identified but this large-scale migration attracted by the economic globalisation. And from them roughly 50 per cent belonged to the economically active labourers (GCIM, 2005).

Various studies also showed particular reasons of migration circle from low income to middle of high-income countries as the survival strategy. They inflation, lack of economic opportunities, less wages are some of the reason for such movement (ibid). Such migrants (skilled or unskilled) when moved from low income counties to the high- or middle-income countries creating new demands for housing and utility services as well as a pull factor for those who are seeking for migration. Generally speaking, due to advancement in production system, dynamics of labour market in less economically developed countries and less job opportunities forced them to flee for the economic benefits of their families. These workers worked in economically developed countries, they in-directly paying taxes and directly putting their efforts for the development. Labourer dependent countries like Gulf and USA, residents most of the time asked for higher per hour wages than those who came from different poor countries like Pakistan (Benach et. al., 2010). Though, both types of migrants assisted socio-economic development but due to their personal skills they faced a number of issues and health is one of them (Borrell et. al., 2008; Grondin et. al., 2003).

Migrant workers regularly engaged in low skilled workforce, that are known as the 3-D jobs because of certain challenges that is Dirty, Dangerous and Degrading, the jobs which are left by the nationalist for the migrants because of security risks, despite of certain factors e.g. low profile, less wages etc. (Fernandez et. al., 2008). The term 3-D coined after inspiration of Japanese 3K, with the passage of time the former becomes most popular phenomenon for work done by labour-migrants, it includes all sort of tasks ranging from construction of garment factories. In destination countries like UAE, low wages were paid to the migrant labourers irrespective of other parts of the world, where 3-D works pay handsome amount to the workers. Another sort of problem is the behavior of employer with the regular or irregular migrant workers. Particularly, from Pakistan the age bracket of Labour migrants ranging from late adult the very next nears of teen age completion. They are in good mental and physical health and wanted to earn economic stability to their families. Hard working environment, language barrier, culture differences and tagging of labourers/migrants and above all the behaviors of employers pushed towards mental or physical health issues. Less care for 3-D workers given, even some of them got major physical health issue e.g. loss of any organ, they sent back to the countries of origin without any calming any insurance policy or compensation.

Wage differences existed even doing same work in same environment which was paid to the natives or the migrant labourers. Health conditions, insurance of policies for any misshape during working hours equally benefited the workers but for migrant workers’ policies showed another picture. Work agreements e.g. AQAMA is another lope game which facilitate employers and benefit them the most. The objectives of the study were to explore the relationship of labourers and their employers, exploitation in wages and working conditions. Migrant labourers more exposed to the harsh working environment and less safety measure which made them more vulnerable in 3-D jobs.
Material and Methods

The data was extracted from the MPhil dissertation. Particular components and weightage have been given to the problems directly linked to 3-D works. Nine respondents were in-depth interviewed for the data collection and an interview schedule containing seventeen question were administered. All the respondent belonged to the district Dera Ghazi Khan (Southern district of Punjab Province). The questions were asked keeping in mind the employer’s relationships, working condition, wage distribution and the provision of safety tools for the jobs. All the migrants working in UAE (Dubai) construction sites, the overall scenario regarding the secure and safe work environment were to some extent same stated by all respondents. There was no concept of particular trainings for the workers.

Review of Relevant Literature

The increase of UAE’s GDP grows 6.62 percent (from 2000-2009) due to various factors i.e. the hike in oil prices, foreign investment in the construction sector, this growth is the reason of less consumption on the secure health environment and low wages of the laborers. All the six oil producing centuries are the destination of about 17 percent labor migrants from their total number of populations, UAE, Qatar and Kuwait is the highest in numbers who received technical, skilled or unskilled laborer for their day and night construction.

The studies of International Labor Organization (ILO) and Human Rights Watch (HRW) highlighted from all workforce, 95 percent of UAE’s workforce belonged to other countries (HRW, 2010). Tax free zones, huge number of expatriates, wealthy Emiratis, privileges for the skilled and technical individuals around the world is the pulling factor of more investors as well as laborer. Such influx of laborers reduces the wage market, and cheap labor is there for the service.

In the first decade of millennium, the only UAE had more than 1300 construction projects, that worth of 418 billion USD only in Abu-Dhabi and Dubai. The round clock work was the need of time which forced the laws of working hours from 8 working hours to 12 working hours a day by each worker (Sambidge, 2010). Such advancement provides a number of benefits to the investors and the contractors i.e. the long working hours and less wages and other privileges for the workers. Such long hours caused more exhaustion, more exposure to the heat (day shifts), inadequate safety measure that leads to serious health issues. Less sleep, sub-standard accommodation, unsafe working condition is the violation of international human rights. The government was working for the safety and security of the laborers in 2007 the report of the ‘Protection of Workers’ Rights in UAE’ acknowledged the violation of labor rights, working conditions, and the also suggested for expansion of labor laws for the protection of labor rights in UAE (Smith, 2008).

Grondin et al (2003) identified a number of jobs done by the unskilled migrant workers that pushed them into hazardous working environment and that had limited access to health care and the other precautionary measure on work place, or in some cases where stated perks do not exist. Study showed that construction work is dangerous, unfinished gray-structures, heavy machinery and the work force, skilled and unskilled labourers worked together and sometimes switched their jobs as well. Falls have been found very common among migrant workers at construction sites. It could be of two ways, less safety measures or low skilled workers working in high roof buildings. It is the responsibility of the state and the respective ministries to take care of such matters but the injuries and the fall, ended
up very low compensations. In certain cases, due to less awareness of the migrant workers they avoid to visit medical facility centers.

Ruhs (2013) stated another might worker’s violation, the visa-restrict-sanctions, as per the visa policy every migrant worker from any cater of the work environment must have local insurance e.g. Kafeel / Employer. He is the solely person, who has the authority on work and the working hours of the migrants, and mobility within the host country for work. Like in UAE, all sort of Visas tie migrant to the employers and do not allow immediate job to job transition after contract expires it has some rules and regulations e.g. migrant must have to deport and then fresh arrival with new employer in the country.

Discussion

The overall data were conceptualizing by thematic analysis of primary information. The 3-D model i.e. Dirty, Dangerous and Degrading were elaborated to draw a picture of working environment of construction workers in Dubai. Various case studies were included to add the description

- how migrant survive in hazardous working environment
- their payment structures impacted their remittance and
- nature of job damaging their health and economic status.

These prospects showed a clear damaging picture of the workers at jobs they don’t have any suitable environment and pushed for more exposed jobs in the construction sector and very compromising living standards compromising their health.

Health and Work Environment

All the respondent belonged to the construction work, one of the respondents shared, ‘in UAE, mostly people worked in construction sector. They start working from construction sites as laborer and then moved to other works but it is not always the same for the migrants.’ Doing labour work is very task no particular type of skills is required for laborers. Unskilled, semi-skilled emigrants received low wage but this is very high when it multiplied into remittance (exchange rate). They received very less amount because the illegal workers do work in construction sites, because it is easy there to hide, according to a respondent. Such work does not hold the future of the worker; sustainable economic development; those who entered in UAE opt this opportunity at very cheap price due to their hide-out.

Legal status of migrants in the country of destination is the comparison point for inequalities at all levels without considering the personal traits of the migrants (highly skilled or semi-skilled). Employment conditions, working environment, health situations, inequality in the wages are the major factors that are directly linked to the status of migrants. Those who are without work permit (legal documents), are more vulnerable in this regard. They are more exposed to exploitation, fear of job-loss, deportation, and low wages sometimes did not get anything after the completion to task, shard by three respondents. A very limited number of those who have legal documents forced to the hard environments by the supervisors at construction sites. Such migrants worked in hazardous environments and variety of
works which creates health problems for example direct contact to heat (sun-burn, etc.), dust and the physical exposure to the chemicals. They are working without any legal document that is why safety kits are not provided to them. A respondent shared, ‘no safety kits were used in the construction sites if you are working on fifth or fifteenth floor of the building, the lifting machine always operate in open areas without any safety walls.’

In particular scenario according to the ILO report, averagely 335,000 cases reported annually from construction and mining sites which caused serious injuries or even deaths. Those who are working without particular skills have more exposed to such problems. Various studies of the migrant workers showed such type of discriminations but the rules and the methods are different in UAE. The report also highlighted the social as well as health issues faced by the workers in the construction sectors of destination countries. Language is the second major exploitative tool by the supervisors who benefited through ground situations. They forced the workers for the hazardous jobs by threatening, and also motivated them with some additional dirhams.

**Working Hours**

It is very difficult to calculate the working time of the workers, calculation of the working hours (weekly or monthly) needs a proper justification and directions by the competent authorities in destination countries. Construction workers risked their lives and asked for overtime to add some additional dirhams in their monthly wages; newcomers were assigned to heavy work e.g. lifting heavy material(s) to the upper floors by self (using technology / machinery increases the cost of production) need more laborers that is why availability of illegal and legal laborer increase the competition so they ready to go for hard works. From the sample size, only one respondent worked 6 days a week with minimum 60 hours, that was his regular time of work. Friday is weekend, if anyone wanted to work they get more rewards and high wage than other regular days. Remaining all the respondents worked seven days a week spend more than 70 hours per week. When asked why the hours are so long, the responses were, ‘we need more money because the wages are less, we have to manage our expense and savings send back to Pakistan for the left behind family.’

Those who wanted more money for their left behind families they worked in off-days as well, such type of extra burden impacted their health very badly. As per the law ‘there is one-hour break after five-hour work’. Skipping the break is very much common among the laborers because, ‘we are here to earn, not for rest’. The working hours for the construction laborers were ten with one day off, it is fact there is no off days in Dubai.

Shakoor a labor worker narrated, heatstroke, toothache, headache, upset stomach, minor injuries during work is considered tiny injuries that is why painkillers provided by the supervisor, if he is not around you have to complete the task first and then go for any medical assistance. In the case of head injury or the broken bones, employer (Kafil) permits supervisor to go to the hospital and half of the expenses cut from the migrants’ account (it is because of his negligence so he must have to pay the amount as well).

**Health Condition at Work Place and Living areas**

It was observed during stay with migrant workers, the health conditions were not the primary concern of the employers as well as migrant. They only focused on working hours i.e. ten hours per day. Employers’ only concern were the active working according of the laborers if they got injured or sick employers wait only for one week, then migrant replaced with new one. It was observed; migrants don’t care about their health condition, when asked to a migrant why you are
working if you feel sick, he narrated, ‘we came here for earning purposes, if I been sick and doing less duty, less earning leads the family again at same point from where I have started working overseas.’ There were no first-aid or any medical emergency kit present in the construction sites, migrants only examined by doctors once in the start of their work permit.

The health condition of Barbers, workers who are working in Bakeries are good, because after every six-months vaccination and check-up made by the health department of UAE maintain their health. But health conditions in labor camps were not good, in private labor camps where long corridor loaded with hundreds of migrants in parallel opposite rooms (long halls) were serving migrant laborers without any proper medical of health facility. There were no even a medical box (emergency kit OR first-aid box) in majority of the labor camps. No medical facility provided to the injured at earliest until or unless Police Officer reported the patient.

Medical facilities provided by the doctors in hospitals, there were no private medical health units like working in Pakistan near the labor camps or nearby cities. All medical units were connected and worked under strict observation of govt. In labor camps the working conditions were hard and during the time (lunch time) they stayed in highly cool rooms (room temperature under 20 o C) and when they go back to the work the atmosphere temperature rose up to 40-50 o F. Sun-burn is normal health issue among migrants. In this hard environment, hard working conditions made the working life for the migrants more dangerous.

**Heat related illnesses**

The most encountered issue was the heat-stroke. Migrants are not well aware about the temperature of the UAE. Sun-burn is the second important health problem among the construction workers in UAE, which were not documented as ‘serious health issues’ in any report. A respondent stated, ‘I had sun-burn but my employer asked, you have to finish the job if you wanted your money, another migrant switched his work with me, and completed my task. There is no other option, no relaxation if you are at middle of some task you have to complete it first and they employer permits you to leave the construction sites. In the months of April to Sep. the temperature remained above 90 o F (32 o C), with 80 percent humidity. In July and August, the regular temperature remained above 100 o F (38 o C). Sun-Heat and the humidity is considered the health hazard for those who are working under sun-light without putting proper tools and securing the premise. A respondent shared, ‘heat strokes are very common, in each year everyone goes through three or four times, due to hard working environment and less use of water and rest it is very common among the migrants.’ No particular time and equipment given to the workers who are working in open areas under sky.

**Illegal workers particularly vulnerable**

As discussed earlier, the illegal migrants were more vulnerable among the construction workers, they do not have any worth as per the respondents; narrated, ‘particularly those who came through illegal means they were exploited by giving less wages and hard work.’ High demand of construction workers is the pulling factor of non-skilled individuals from the low-income countries. Legal and illegal migrants fulfill the demand of the supplier and contractors at one hand and on the other paying less wages to the illegal migrants maximize the profits.
It is not very much common by the contractors or the agents to promote illegal workers, local authorities fine the local companies if found any illegal worker among the crew. Supplying companies most of the times owned by expatriates, who always try to reduce the construction cost using more manpower because it is in abundance. More manpower endorses more interaction and high number of workers in construction sites that leads towards more accidents and more exposure to the hazardous environment. A Pakistani worker (Khalid) was hospitalized due to back injury he fell from lifting machine, his colleagues narrated, he worked for ‘A----Manpower Companies’, a Dubai based construction company, his documents were fake, he arrived through visit visa in UAE, and used hideout method to over stayed with some relatives at Dera-Dubai, he was from Layyah (Punjab) in Pakistan. Now construction company disowned him after the incident, because he does not have any legal contract with the company, company was not liable for providing him health insurance or services, all the co-workers collected some amount and managed his treatment, when he gets well he repay the whole debt in two years.’

Such type of incidents and the role of companies are very common among the migrants. There is no one behind the migrants if needed, nor the supervisor or the Pakistani embassy.

**Conclusion**

It is documented that migration from South Asia to the gulf countries made significant contributions in the GDP of the host country and some in the country of origin. But such contributions only encourage investors, stakeholders, supervisors and hiring companies, no one cared about migrants which were the most important pillar of this development. No check and balance upon the policies regarding working conditions, living status of the migrant measured by any of the governmental agencies. Those who put their all efforts for the development of the cities, receiving very limited in return and sometimes they wasted their lives. Economic stability is the important status which forced individuals to migrate high income countries for the survival of families. The 3-D jobs are the most dangerous jobs which are very common among the migrants because they do not have any choice among them. Such working condition/ environment imposes various health problems that must be addressed at policy level. The UAE is still practicing the biggest construction boom, along with Oil refineries, residential units, working spaces, skyscrapers and luxury resorts but the condition of the workers is very damaged. 3-D work need special care and attention from the government departments in the context of safety, security and wage prospects. The rights of labor must be adhering at national and local level so they may have worked in safe and secure environment easily. Some of the recommendations extracted from interviews for the betterment of the workers in countries of destination are as under:

1. Reform are required at sponsorship level. So, the involvement of the employer may reduce, as the exploitation of the migrants as well.
2. The UAE government may have banned all those companies who may have connections with the recruiters that recruit illegal workers to reduce the illegal migration boom.
3. Antagonistically examining and indicting companies who violate UAE labor laws.
4. Providing a safe and healthy working environment to the migrants i.e. provision of cloths, equipment, training how to handle machinery and first aid, also creating awareness of work-related health and safety risks.
References


Self-compassion and Hardiness as Protective Factors for Mental Health: Exploring the Relationship and Demographic Differences

Samina Rashid
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Wah
samina.rashid@uow.edu.pk

Sehrish Iqtedar
Student of MSc, Department of Psychology, University of Wah
Sehrishiqtedar11@gmail.com

Habiba Shaheen
Lecturer, Department of Psychology, University of Wah
habiba.shaheen@uow.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

Pakistan is facing a severe economic crisis. This time period of economic decline has been challenging for everyone. This unforeseen and drastic change has caused transformation in the daily routines which consequently increased psychological burden for working population. Mental health is a basic human need that has been impacted due to over work. Current study’s purpose is to examine the association between hardiness, self-compassion and mental health among working adults across the time period of economic decline. The present study purpose is to explore the demographical differences among these variables as well. Data were collected from N=488 working adults (males=256, females=232) by using correlational research design. Self-Compassion Scale Short form, A Short Hardiness Scale and Short Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale were applied to find the study variables. Findings of the current study suggest self-compassion, hardiness and mental health are positively correlated with each other. T-test analysis results indicated that female working adults have good mental health and more self-compassion as compared to males. Married working adults are more self-compassionate and have better mental health. Individuals working in private organizations are hardier whereas individuals working in government organizations are self-compassionate and have better mental health. Results were mentioned. Limitations, suggestions and implications of the study were presented for future research.

Key words: Self-compassion, Psychological Hardiness, Mental health, Working Adults, Economic Crisis.
Introduction

From the past 3 years, world is facing an uncertain situation filled with, grief, loss, tension and anxiety due to the spread of covid-19 pandemic. It took the world under complete lockdown resulting in the destruction of economies of many countries with Pakistan being one of its major victims. After that covid – 19 people suffered a lot emotionally and financially, because of loss of their loved ones and also people put their livelihood, career and fortune in danger. Pakistan faces continuing economic disaster and political upset from 2022-2023. Food, gas and petroleum prices increases because of this extreme economic dispute for months.

The economic crisis has impacted the lives of people globally. These unusual changes have taken a great impact on the mental health of employees. Mental health is the base for human welfare and their effective functioning. It is necessary part of well-being that grant to the overall mental health of every individual (WHO, 2004). To get attention is right of working adults’ population as they represent large group in terms of demographical portion, experience profound economical-consequences in economic crisis (loss of income) and are frequently committed with the responsibilities such as providing care to others (taking care of a child) (Kucera et al., 2021). Working adults are generally flexible to stress and other psychological health issues (McGinty et al., 2018). The different kinds of stressors faced by working adults such as negative emotions, poor interaction with co-workers (Bano et al., 2012) including one’s own issues (Lillius et al., 2008), exposes them to the conditions that may risk their mental health. Recently, self-compassion and psychological hardiness have gained attention from practitioners and scholars in response to these negative incidents.

Neff (2009) define self-compassion as showing kindness and compassion towards one’s self and having a non-judgmental stance towards one's own shortcomings. Working adults are continuously exposed to high workload that affects their ability to involve in self-care at working place. The constant conflict between the amount of work and the amount of time available to oneself prevents self-compassion from developing. Poor health outcomes and stress is result of lack of self-care for oneself (Egan et al., 2019). More the supervisor and coworker are self-compassionate their relationship can be enhanced. (Dodson & Heng, 2022). Studies have shown a strong meaningful relationship of self-compassion with mental health (Horan et al., 2018). It is related to burnout among working population. Research showed increased burnout as a consequence of decreased self-compassion (Atikinson et al., 2017). Driver (2007) reported that self-compassion helps to decreases the pessimistic emotions faced by working adults due to their exposure to any traumatic experience. It depreciates the negative influence of work-family dispute on the mental health of workers.

In a work place, employee face a lot of negative emotions either because of poor interaction with coworkers or the personal matters going on. A cross sectional study by Anjum et al. (2020) revealed that self-compassionate workers experience less emotional exhaustion owing to poor coworker interaction (Crocker & Canevallo, 2008). Research findings revealed that self-compassion is linked with high involvement in jobs and low cognitive and emotional weariness (Babenko et al., 2019). In hospital settings, workers who have better self-compassion provide better services and care to patient (Dev et al., 2018). Studies on standard college instructors indicated that teachers with self-compassion offer better emotional help to their college students. (Jenninngs, 2015). Van der Meulen et al. (2021) found that employees which are self-compassionate manage the stress level as it decreases the level of stress and psychological and bodily pressure. Along with self-compassion, researchers have identified another variable known as psychological
hardiness that helps face stressful life situations. A research study by Hashemi and Eyni (2020) revealed that perceived stress is negatively correlated with self-compassion and hardiness. Thus, self-compassionate people cope with difficulties and failures more adaptively. Such people are more devoted to their life goals and accept more challenges. In other way those people show psychological hardiness.

Hardiness is a personality trait that is associated with a person’s ability to manage and respond to stressful life events with coping strategies that turn potentially unfortunate circumstances into learning opportunities. It is characterized by a tendency to be deeply involved, a need to be in control, and a desire to learn from life’s events regardless of the outcomes (Maddi, S. R., 2004). The three basic elements of hardiness i.e. commitment, control and challenge determine how successfully a person functions in a social environment such as a work place (Lambert et al., 2003). Commitment is all about valuing one’s own life and staying persistent towards one’s goals even at the time of great stress. Being in control way having self-assurance of their ability to affect the situation instead of feeling helpless. Challenge involves viewing tragedy and stress as a part of one’s existence rather than wishing for absence of stressors. Hardy individuals are more stress tolerant as they prefer to face the situation rather than looking for an escape. For example, hardy individual will prefer attending a conference meeting with a supervisor, considering it as an opportunity to persuade supervisor rather than seeing it as a risk to lose position (Judkins et al., 2006). Hardiness is one of the important constructs for the employee wellbeing and career success (Ferreira, 2012). Alexainder and Kalein (2001) conducted a research study on emergency ambulance workers and found that higher level of hardiness is related to lower level of workout among the workers. Hardiness is closely associated with effort engagement Corso et al. (2017) determined a sizeable relationship between hardiness and work engagement. It helps to reduce burnout and increases the work engagement by increasing vigor and dedication. (LoBue et al., 2013). This burn-out and exhaustion may lead to the negative mental health consequences. Positive relationship between hardiness and psychological well-being was found and also act as a buffer against development of impact of stressful consequences (Kobasa et al., 1982).

Ryan and Deci (2001) define mental health as feeling of love, care, happiness and satisfaction from life. It also includes healthy psychological functioning and self-realization. World Health Oragnization (2001) suggested that nearly 450 million people suffer from psychological issues globally. Moreover, approximately 10% of the personnel of different occupations suffer from strain or neurotic issues (Eaton et al., 1990). The economic crisis has impacted psychological health of human beings which later had prominent effect on their physical fitness too (Janula et al., 2020). Psychological health is a great concern for working adults as the studies indicated higher rates of psychological issues and health problems among working adults (Marchand et al., 2011). Results of a study suggested higher rates of mental health issues in working adults (Gelaye et al., 2012). Stress which is related to work can lead to different psychological symptoms such as anxiety, lack of concentration and sleep disorders. Exposure to stress and traumatic experiences at work for long time can cause mental illness (WHO, 2005). If left untreated, these mental problems can lead to employee absenteeism, loss of their interest in work and health lost (Goetzel et al., 2004). Other factors in addition to work factors such as familial situations, individual characteristics, neighborhood and social support are linked with psychological distress among working adults (Marchand & Blanc, 2011).

Mental health is a top priority of working adults especially during the economic crisis. The fear generated because of low income has made people experience psychiatric symptoms such as irritation, stress and anxiety (Ahorasu et al., 2020). Current studies aimed to find out the relationship of self-compassion, psychological hardiness and mental health
among working adults during economic crisis as it has increased the level of psychological distress and anxiety among the working people. When we talk about workplace it is important to talk about gender inclusivity as both men and women are equally a part of work force. Luckily married couples revel in better mental fitness fame (Sylvia Smith, 2019). Gender differences among working adults on all the three studied variables are also taken in to account in this study. There is a lack of research in Pakistan regarding how self-compassion and psychological hardiness behave as a protective factor for mental health of working adults during economic crisis, the present research also aims to fill this gap.

Outcomes of this study will help in understanding the significance of self-compassion and psychological hardiness for the effective performance of adults in workplace as well as in promoting the mental fitness of working adults. To investigate the objectives of this research, following hypothesis were formulated:

**Objectives**

- To investigate the correlation among self-compassion, hardiness and mental health.
- To investigate the differences for self-compassion, hardiness and mental health on the demographic variables.

**Hypotheses**

- Self-compassion, hardiness and mental health are positively correlated with each other.
- Individuals working in government organizations have finer mental health, and more self-compassionate than those working in private organization.
- Married working adults have stronger mental health, and are more self-compassionate.
- Female working adults have better mental health and are more self-compassionate than men. whereas the male working adults are hardier than women.

**Methods and Procedures**

**Research design**

In current study Correlational research design was used.

**Participants**

A correlational study was conducted on convenient sample of 488 working adults (N=488). Sample belonging from both public and private sector institutes from different cities of Pakistan. Education level of the participants ranged from graduation to PhD. The data was gathered via both physical and online methods. The participants were selected on voluntarily basis. Informed consent was obtained in the starting. The members were informed approximately the purpose of the have to look at. It was also informed that they had been free to withdraw at any time, without giving a motive and that each one facts and opinions provided might stay nameless and private.

**Instruments**

- Self-Compassion Scale Short form
The scale was developed by Raees et al. (2011) as a short pattern of self-compassion scale containing 12 items of the authentic 26 item scale. Ratings are assessed on five-factor scale starting from 1 (almost never) to 5 (almost always). High score suggest higher level of self-compassion and low score suggest lower level of self-compassion.

❖ **A Short Hardiness Scale**

This scale was formed by Bartone in 1995 to measure the personality hardiness. The scale containing 15 items that cover the three important concepts of hardiness such as commitment, challenge and control. Scores are assessed on rating scale which ranging from 0 (not at all true) to 3 (completely true). High score indicates higher level of hardiness.

❖ **Short Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale**

The scale was formed by Stewart-Brown et al. (2009) as a short version to Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale to measure the mental well-being of a person. This scale consists of 7 items with a total score ranging from 7–35. Score are assessed on 5-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (none of the time) to 5 (all of the time). Higher score shows high level of mental well-being and lower score shows low level of mental well-being.

**Operational Definitions**

❖ **Self-compassion**

It is described as being available and has concerned towards personal sufferings, showing kindness and sympathize with oneself, taking an impartial information of one’s shortcomings and insufficiencies and ideas as someone experience as section of larger human adventures (Neff, 2003).

❖ **Hardiness**

It is a character trait that act as a buffer towards the adverse effect of disturbing lifestyle on the health. As aggregate of three important tendencies- dedication, control and mission, hardiness now not simplest facilitates survival inside the traumatic conditions but also flourishes the existence (Kobasa, 1979).

❖ **Mental Health**

Psychological well-being is a mental health focusing on both mental health and healthy psychological functioning. It has two different aspects; the hedonic aspect, which focuses specially on incidents of happiness and satisfaction with life, and the eudemonic aspect, which focuses on healthy functioning and self-realization (Ryan & Deci, 2001).
Results

Table 1: Descriptive statistics for the scales of self-compassion, hardiness and Mental Health (N=488)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>K</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>S. D</th>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
<th>Range Actual</th>
<th>Range Potential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hardiness</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>26.23</td>
<td>5.171</td>
<td>.088</td>
<td>.536</td>
<td>13-43</td>
<td>0-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-compassion</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>41.19</td>
<td>4.714</td>
<td>-.073</td>
<td>.165</td>
<td>28-55</td>
<td>12-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>27.93</td>
<td>3.300</td>
<td>-.407</td>
<td>-.502</td>
<td>18-34</td>
<td>7-35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note, N=488; k=no of items, M=mean, SD=standard deviation.

Table 1 shows descriptive statistics and normality statistics for all the studied variables. skewness and kurtosis values are in acceptable range for claim of normality of data.

Table 2: Pearson product correlation and Cronbach’s Alpha among Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Hardiness</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Self-compassion</td>
<td>-.73</td>
<td>-.027</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Mental Health</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.165**</td>
<td>.131**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**p<.01

Table 2 shows that mental health, psychological hardiness and self-compassion are positively correlated with each other. This shows that increased level of Mental Health is associated with increased level of self-compassion and psychological hardiness. The Alpha coefficient for all included variables ranges from .50 to .64 which indicate satisfactory inter-item consistency.
Table 3: T-test showing gender differences, organizational differences and marital status differences in Hardiness, self-compassion and Mental Health (N=488)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Hardiness</th>
<th></th>
<th>Self-compassion</th>
<th></th>
<th>Mental Health</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td>t(p)</td>
<td>LL-UL</td>
<td>Cohen’s d</td>
<td>M (SD)</td>
<td>t(p)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married (n=272)</td>
<td>25.74(5.79)</td>
<td>-2.35(.02)</td>
<td>-2.03, -1.18</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>41.67(4.97)</td>
<td>2.53 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single (n=211)</td>
<td>26.85(4.20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40.59(4.30)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private (n=228)</td>
<td>27.15(5.59)</td>
<td>3.46 (.001)</td>
<td>.71, 2.57</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>40.79(4.12)</td>
<td>-.98 (.33)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government (n=260)</td>
<td>25.51(4.77)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41.20(4.93)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male (n=256)</td>
<td>26.55(5.68)</td>
<td>1.43 (.15)</td>
<td>-.25, 1.59</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>41.05(5.25)</td>
<td>-.70 (.48)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female (n=232)</td>
<td>25.88(4.54)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>41.35(4.04)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 indicated a significant difference for hardiness, self-compassion and mental health between married and unmarried group. Married working adults are self-compassionate and have better mental health whereas unmarried working adults are hardier. The results show significant difference between government and private organization for hardiness. Those working in private organizations are harder than those in government organizations. Workers in government organizations have better mental health and are more self-compassionate but the results are non-significant. There is a significant difference between genders for mental health. Female working adults have better mental health and are more self-compassionate where as the male working adults are harder.

**Discussion**

The Aim of this ongoing study was to find out the correlation of self-compassion, hardiness and mental health. Moreover, the study purpose is to explore the differences for self-compassion, hardiness and mental health on the demographic variables. A correlative study was conducted on convenient sample of 488 working adults. Sample belonging from both public and private sector institutes from different cities of Pakistan.

The first hypothesis of the current study was, self-compassion, hardiness and mental health are positively correlated with each other. Results in table 2 shows that there is positive association between mental health and psychological hardiness as well as mental health and self-compassion. This shows that increased level of mental health is associated with increased level of self-compassion and psychological hardiness. The finding of the present study is aligned with previous studies which also suggest that strong meaningful association of self-compassion with mental health (Ghorbani et al., 2018). Self-compassion is linked with extended activity engagement and reduced cognitive and emotional weariness (Babenko et al., 2019).

Second hypothesis was individuals working in government organizations have better mental health, and are more self-compassionate than those working in private organizations. Results in table 3 indicates significant difference between government and private organization for mental health, self-compassion and hardiness. Those working in private organizations are harder than those in government organizations. Workers in government organizations have better mental health and are more self-compassionate but the results are non-significant. Van der Meulen et al. (2021) Recommended that self-compassion can also help personnel control the pressure degree because it reduces the emotions of strain and psychological and bodily fatigue. In government hospital settings, self-compassion makes it simple for the workers to provide good care to patients (Dev et al., 2018). Research on elementary school teachers indicated that self-compassionate teachers were better able to provide their students with emotional support (Jennings, 2015).

Third hypothesis was married working adults have better mental health, and are more self-compassionate. Results in table 3 indicates a significant difference for hardiness, self-compassion and mental health between married and unmarried group. Married working adults are self-compassionate and have better mental health. Previous study is aligned with current results. As Sylvia Smith (2019) concluded happily married couples enjoy higher mental health fame.

Fourth hypothesis was there existing gender difference for hardiness, self-compassion and mental health. There is a significant difference between genders for mental health. Female working adults have better mental health and are
more self-compassionate whereas the male working adults are hardier. Previous research suggested that women are more self-compassion (Emma Seppala, 2013). Taylor found that men display “fight or flight” responses. Whereas women are friendlier and lean toward “tend and befriend. In fact, research suggests that adherence to masculine gender norms is associated with lower ranges of self-compassion. (Reilly et al., 2014). Because of restrictiveness male upbringing differs from female (Levant, 2011; Riggs, 1997) it means that women are more self-compassionate than women.

**Implications**

Present study will be helpful for the psychologists to deal with patients who face mental health problems due to lack of self-compassion due to high workload that affects patient’s ability to involve in self-care at working place. Moreover, the present study will provide significant guidance that how self-compassion and Hardiness acts as a Protective Factors for Mental Health.

**Limitations and suggestions**

- The measures used on this look at rely on self-document, which can result in problem biases along with responses which aligned with social desirability. Multiple methods (e.g., self-report, observation and interviews) would be used for further studies.
- The phenomenon of social desirability should be pointed out, since the participants were able to answer the questionnaire in such a way that they reflected a positive image of themselves, not answering sincerely.

**Conclusion**

The aim of the current study was to investigate the relationship of Self-compassion and Hardiness as a Protective Factors for Mental Health. The study also aims to find demographical differences. The results of current study revealed the significant positive correlation between mental health and psychological hardiness as well as mental health and self-compassion. This shows that increased level of mental health is associated with increased level of self-compassion and psychological hardiness.

Current study also finds that married working adults are more self-compassionate and have better mental health. Significant difference was found among genders for mental health. Female working adults have better mental health and are more self-compassionate whereas the male working adults are hardier. Some constructs of this study is supported by previous studies carried out in different countries, culture and situations. The current results are consistent with previous literature.
References


Understanding the Social Stigma Surrounding Mental Health and Suicides in District Ghizer, Gilgit-Baltistan, Pakistan.

Zubair Ahmed  
Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology & Anthropology  
Karakoram International University, Gilgit.  
Zubair.ahmed@kiu.edu.pk

Abstract:

The mechanism of society to adopt discredit, disgrace, condemn, and disown any individual for an undesirable status is termed as a stigma. Stigma significantly impacts individuals through various stages like social isolation, self-hatred, guilt, shame hopelessness, and burden on others, leading to suicidal thoughts and self-harm. In Ghizer, the prevailing stigma of suicide, mental illness, love affair, and failure contributes to the soaring suicide problem and is a barrier to suicide prevention. The present study is aimed to analyze the process of stigmatization, the nature of various social stigmas, their contribution toward suicide, and their hindrance in suicide prevention. A qualitative research approach was used with particular reference to case-based sample selection in convenient sampling; for selecting respondents (family members and community members), suicide cases were collected from police and hospital reports. An in-depth interview tool was administered for data collection. Data were analyzed through thematic analysis through themes extracted through literature, then described in narrative form. The study concluded that self-stigma combines loss in academic life, stigmatization of love affairs, and mental illness, which forces individuals into self-vulnerability and then suicide ideation. A culturally appropriate study is suggested to channel the social institution(s) for saving the lives of community members and strengthening their mental health.

Keywords: stigma and suicide, mental health stigma, love affair stigma, failure in education.

Introduction

World Health Organization characterizes suicide as "the demonstration of purposefully executing oneself." It is one of the leading causes of death; almost 800,000 people commit suicide annually, and much more are involved in self-harm. Suicide, although it is an individual act, was widely considered a result of psychological issues. However, now it is a fact that individuals' extreme step because of the compromised psyche has roots in the social system, which means such psychological issues result from some social phenomenon. Social cohesion and integration provide protective cover against suicide; however, social disorganization, lack of integration, and cohesion lead to rising suicide rate (Durkheim, 1952). Suicide is a complex phenomenon because of biological contribution, personal history, family history, detailed events, religion, socio-cultural environment, and historical and socio-economic context (Souza et al., 2006). Like many other factors, social stigmatization is critical to the soaring suicide problem and a barrier to suicide prevention. Stigma is a mechanism based on the social construction of identity (Goffman, 1963). Such identity labels an individual so society discredits, condemns, and disowns that individual to an undesirable social status.
Moreover, stigma is conceptualized as a social process that happens to be in the broader socio-cultural sphere, which brings structural and institutional discrimination (Link et al., 1987) (Yang & Kleinman, 2008). The researchers identified three approaches that explain the contributions of stigma toward suicide. First is the stress-coping mechanism, in which stigma is considered a social stressor that generates adverse emotional reactions, social isolation, and hopelessness in individuals with mental illness. If the stigmatization and social rejection exceed an individual's coping capacity, it becomes suicidal (Schomerus et al., 2012). Second, for a person already experiencing mental illness, stigmatization causes alienation in parts by minimizing interaction and a sense of belonging with other society members. Thus, causing social isolation, which is believed to be a significant contributor to triggering suicide risk, discourages the desire to discuss one's problems with others (Schomerus et al., 2012). Third, social or public stigma is associated with an individual's self-stigma (Evans-Lacko et al., 2012). Studies indicated that public and self-stigma contributed to less willingness to seek help or treatment for mental illness (Schomerus et al., 2012).

In sociology, it is a matter of great interest, and a debate is going on the cultural meanings of suicide. Current theories of Suicide focus on how cultural meanings influence suicidality (Leong & M. Leach, 2008) (Iemmi et al., 2016). From a cultural perspective, the prevailing social norms and spiritual beliefs related to suicidal ideation, suicidal thoughts, and attempts to determine when and how a person may contemplate Suicide (Johnson, 2015). Suicide rates may vary due to under-reporting; in many countries, suicide is a social stigma and thus tend to be concealed. A comparative study has shown that suicide rates may reveal variations in cultural beliefs related to mental problems, suicide, failure in love or career shape the public or self-stigma (Iemmi et al., 2016). Moreover, suicide rates are different regionally within national boundaries and ethnic groups based on the diverse stressors, level of stigmatization, and how the community sees suicide as a cause of death (Schomerus et al., 2012). Different stressors may include the rupture in family structure, difficulty in adopting modernity, difficulty in remaining to comply with traditions, failure in competition, and poor socio-economic status, which can become a potentially suicidal combination (Pitman et al., 2017), (Park & Lee, 2016), (Pirkis et al., 2017).

In Ghizer, Gilgit-Baltistan, the suicide rate is alarmingly high compared to other areas of the country (Khan et al., 2009). Ghizer society has unique characteristics; the community is experiencing various difficulties or stressors. The community lacks sufficient emotional, social, and financial resources because of the changing family structure, rapid social transformation, and remote geography. These factors lead to declining social cohesion and integration, which may increase the risk of suicidal behavior. The community is Muslim, and religiously committing suicide is a sin.

Moreover, mental health awareness is minimal; being in a love affair or love marriage is socially unacceptable, and failure in education or desired career is a social shame. Under such an impression, stated elements are the source of stigmatization, which not only contributes to the rising risk of suicidal ideation and suicide but also becomes a barrier to suicide prevention. The present study analyzed the stigmatization process, the nature of various social stigmas, their contribution toward suicide, and their hindrance in suicide prevention.

**Methods**
The study is carried out in the Ghizer district of Gilgit-Baltistan. A qualitative design of the study was used. A nonprobability sample technique was used by considering the characteristics of the community, e.g., small-scale communities living in scattered valleys. Also, case-based samples were selected, police and hospital reports were analyzed, and the area was selected based on higher suicide cases.

**Ethical considerations** were primarily focused on due to the sensitivity of the topic. Every respondent was interviewed after providing preliminary details about the research objectives. Thus, informed consent was taken for in-depth interviews, interview notes, and voice recordings. Interviews were conducted face-to-face in secured settings, e.g., at respondents' homes and previously specified offices or rooms. The anonymity and confidentiality of respondents were preserved.

**Data is collected** through in-depth interviews, and an interview guide is used. In-depth interviews were taken in Shina and Urdu language(s) and transcribed into English. Teachers have been selected from teaching institutes; four teachers have been interviewed in-depth after formal consent. Students of different age brackets, e.g., intermediate and Bachelor levels, were the focus while selecting the sample from youth; five students were interviewed (one found with suicidal ideation)—four health professionals who have dealt with suicide cases and two who worked as psychiatrists were interviewed. The most crucial segment of the sample was the suicide victims' family and friends, eight respondents were purposively sampled, and each one was interviewed logically while considering the emotional considerations.

Similarly, two religious scholars and two notable community members were interviewed. The overall sample represented every segment of society. Collectively, twenty-five respondents were interviewed.

**Data is assessed** under five emerging themes according to the dominant forms of stigma, e.g., the stigma of suicide, the stigma of mental illness, the stigma of the love affair, and failure in exam/career. Interviews were transcribed, analyzed through thematic analysis, and described according to the abovementioned themes. These central themes included insights from the data. They examined how stigmatization occurs, the impacts of stigma on individuals, stereotypes in the community, and phrases demonstrating stigma and stigma as a barrier in suicide prevention were discussed.

**Discussions**

Generally, it appeared that most respondents believe that suicide is against societal norms and values and said it is an unforgivable sin. The most repeated reasons noted by respondents behind suicide are mental illness, failure in love, and loss of education. There is much ambiguity in responses regarding stigmatization; some say it is a way of punishing parents. The individual deserves that attitude from society, and some say it is a negative notion that should not be attached to any individual as it brings more negativity to that individual. However, almost every respondent said that stigmatization leads to suicidal behaviors, and it is a significant barrier to suicide prevention. The themes were developed after analyzing the literature, and then interview schedules were made for in-depth interviews. Field data were analyzed, and results were also discussed.

**Concept of Stigma**
Anthropologists conceptualize stigma as a shared moral judgment, deliberating stigmatized individuals’ morally ambivalent reputation (Reynders et al., 2014). A study conferred that stigma has a local definition and social roots for every community, so the impact on the individual depends on the beliefs that determine what “normal” and “stigma” is for that community (Kleinman & Hall-Clifford, 2009). In Ghizer, respondents conceptualize the stigma as an individual’s act, behavior, habit, or situation, which makes that individual notorious, i.e., “badnam” (dishonored) in the community. Thus, community’s response or behavior towards such an ill-reputed individual is full of hatred, disrespect, and unacceptability. A respondent said, “Being dishonored in this community is like living in hell, where u have fewer options to survive and more thoughts to die.”

It is found that there is a great value attached to honor and self-respect; thus, to lose one’s integrity is like a tragedy that further worsens the community. In most of the interviews, respondents reiterated that the ill-talks of people, bad looks received in a public gathering, taunting by peers, and mocking by family or relatives are all such public behaviors that cannot be easily tackled through general countering strategies like public sessions and religious seminars. Therefore, it is suggested by respondents that any attempt or intervention for countering stigma should have embedded in the social system that it targets. A research study also said that it is imperative to understand the distinct social and cultural mechanisms responsible for creating stigma (public or self) in the lives of stigmatized individuals, which should be taken as the primary focus of efforts and interventions to combat stigma (Kleinman & Hall-Clifford, 2009).

**Stigmatization**

Goffman defined stigmatization as being disgraced by society and condemned to an unwanted social status. Stigma can have an emotional, cognitive, or behavioral effect. For instance, in self-stigma, individuals with mental illness internalize stigmatizing others’ attitudes and beliefs (Evans-Lacko et al., 2012). Such individuals think of themselves as burdens and thus want to shun themselves and make themselves socially isolated. They believe this alienation is due to the undesirable social status with which they have been labeled. Therefore, such people do not seek mental health treatment (Reidy, 1993). Consequently, their problem goes on worsening, and they ultimately become suicidal. A respondent highlighted that,

“Such dishonored (stigmatized) individuals face the bitter and cold response from relatives and community, which makes them alienated and unable to fulfill the daily affairs of their life. He starts finding hideouts and situations to minimize facing the public; this makes him vulnerable to self-guilt or sham and depression, leading to suicidal thoughts.”

Another respondent opined that Ghizer is a closed community; although physical barriers like mountains and rivers separate people; however, familial ties are shared even from distant places. These ties make almost every individual known to others; thus, an individual’s actions and behavior are not in line with perceived social values, creating an antagonistic attitude, and people start gossiping about that individual. This stigmatization process makes that individual alienated and socially isolated, leading to a narrowing social space for his routine life, ultimately pushing him towards suicidal thoughts.

**Suicide as social stigma**
In anthropological research, distinct cultures relate specific meanings of suicide (Leong & M. Leach, 2008). In one culture, it may be believed that suicide is an unpardonable sin. In contrast, in other cultures, it may be viewed suicide is a socially acceptable resolution of pain, agony, grief, or the inevitable end of life (Lester et al., 2013). Studies have shown that suicide rates are not the same across societies; rural suicide rate is higher than in urban areas in various countries. Similarly, cultural variations, causes, the manifestation of stigma, and the perception of suicide vary in different social settings (Woo et al., 2012), (Maes, 1993), (Chew & McCleary, 1995), (Meares et al., 1981). Like any society, religious and cultural beliefs prevailing in Ghizer consider suicide an unforgivable sin and an unaccepted way of ending life. Respondents said it is believed that the soul of the suicide victim remains suspended; neither it die nor it lives and thus remains restless. Thus, the notion of “rest in peace” for every departed soul after death seems unattainable for a suicide victim. Therefore, attempting suicide is a stigma that is a discredited act. This stigma often hinders the suicide attempt from becoming socially normal; thus, once having a suicide history is considered a major risk factor for suicide.

Similarly, a family history of suicide is also a significant risk, as family members are very prone to suicide stigmatization. Members of suicide victims become vulnerable to the community’s questioning about their child’s socialization and home environment. It is said that relatives and neighbors fully participate in the death rituals of the deceased victim; however, after that, people hesitate to visit and make communal ties with the family of the suicide victim. A young girl having intense suicidal ideation reiterated that,

“Many times, I wanted to die, and I planned to commit suicide, but I just could not do it because of one thing: after my suicide, people would dishonor my parents, especially my father. It would be a great shame for my father that his daughter commits suicide, and my father will not withstand the bitter and disrespectful response of the community.” Thus fear of public stigma, in one way, prevents some individuals from committing suicide; however, most people with suicidal histories are vulnerable to the negative impact of stigma, which leads them to suicide.

**Mental health; as social stigma**

Individuals with mental illness often face stigmatization through stereotypes, discrimination, and prejudice. Using mental health services is a primary source of being labeled as mentally ill and stigmatized (Rüsch et al., 2005). Mental illness stigma brings various negative results in an individual’s life, including an unwillingness to help-seeking, social isolation, low self-esteem, hopelessness, and shame or burden leading to impaired life quality (Link et al., 1989). Mental illness, inadequate social resources, and high stigmatization contribute to suicidal ideation (Pirkis et al., 2017), (Keller et al., 2017). It is found that the perception of being mentally ill is considerably different for labeled compared to unlabeled. The fear of social rejection is likely to develop in labeled individuals. They tend to adopt coping strategies, one of which is to conceal their mental illness to avoid stigma, thus unwilling to seek mental health treatment. Even families covered the situation by relating it to the influence of “jinns” (supernatural) and fairies. It is revealed that instead of consulting a psychiatrist, people approach religious and spiritual healers (shamans).

The analysis of various qualitative and quantitative studies has shown that stigma negatively impacts help-seeking behavior (Schomerus et al., 2012). Respondents said that “being mentally ill” is a term no one wants to be known for. People with anxiety, depression, or any other mental illness do not go to the hospital; they tend to get the medicine on
their own to stabilize their mental health. Drug stores provide them with these medicines without a prescription, which is another public health concern.

A girl said,

“There is no professional psychiatrist available here, and we cannot share our mental problems with doctors or even with a psychiatrist as this healthcare personnel are locals and, most of the time, are our neighbors. Thus seeking help from them puts us in trouble by exposing our situations to our parents and relatives, which would make us questionable, and that is not the better solution. Then this circulates in the whole community, and ultimately we can be infamous as mentally ill.”

**Love affairs as a social stigma**

Every society has unique norms and values defining love, intimate relationships, and the marital system. In many traditional organizations being in a relationship before marriage or teenage love affairs are highly discouraged and unacceptable. Previously, in traditional associations, transgression from norms brought severe punishments, including banishment from the community (Bleek, 1981). Presently, such penalties take new forms, and stigmatization is one of them; the level and severity of stigma depend on the socio-cultural context. Adolescents, especially girls, who engage in premarital affairs, risk being stigmatized, negatively affecting life, and leading to suicidal ideation (Yardley, 2008). Such stigma can be called a blemish of an adolescent’s character or tribal stigma, as societal norms and values determine it (Sawyer et al., 2012). Similar to these studies, the Ghizer community also has a particular set of norms that do not allow such a relationship with the opposite gender. Families have zero tolerance towards such teenage relationships, especially for girls. A teenage girl said that.

“I planned to commit suicide to avert the stigma after disclosure of such a relationship. The boy was blackmailing me into continuing the relationship; otherwise, he would disclose my telephonic chit-chat with him. I was so afraid of my family and community’s response after this disclosure that I decided to die. Fortunately, I shared my problem with a social worker who handles the issue of blackmailing, and I gave up the idea of committing suicide.”

Furthermore, she emphasized that “everyone makes mistakes, but the family should support their girls in such matters of blackmailing and fake relationships so that girls can avoid stigmatization.”

In societies guided by norms and values, adolescents are expected to avoid such relationships, and parents decide their marriages. Respondents said that Ghizer society also follows the traditional marriage fixing practice, which such decisions are taken by parents, not by the marrying individuals. It was revealed that there were cases of suicide where premarital pregnancy was the cause of suicide. For such cases, public stigma is so intense that suicide is preferred as the better option over public stigma. It is also found that being in a relationship with any boy, or refusal from a marriage of parent’s choice or choosing their partner is considered deviant. The stereotypical phrase “bad-chalan” (characterless) is used for such girls. Being mocked and stigmatized by such stereotypes, girls cannot tolerate and often commit suicide.

**Failure as a stigma**

Everyone thrives on success; however, life also challenges achieving the desired goals. Social setups, like community perceptions, family expectations, and peer competition, set the goals in education and career that determine an
individual’s success. Thus, failure to achieve such goals brings a self-stigma for individuals, which develops a fear of facing the community, feeling a burden for the family, and shame of failure among peers.

It is found that success in the educational field is an essential feature for advancing to higher school, university, and career in life. At the same time, it offers significant aid to the individual associated with future career plans. Failure in education may have internal school problems or external factors. Whatever the reasons, the consequence of educational failure remains to continue in school, when school is left, after graduation, and through the various career stages. The study also supports these findings that failure in education is a reason for stigmatization and a risk factor for suicidal behavior (Yaylaci, 2015). Suicidal behavior is affected by school performance and the stress triggered by examinations (Sharp, 2013). Respondents highlighted that when the result of matric and F.Sc is released, it triggers many suicide cases. Students who fail to achieve their desired outcomes are often mocked by parents, taunted by peers, and criticized by teachers. Moreover, failing their ambition of becoming a doctor or engineer makes them self-stigmatized, and some students cannot overcome such a situation of mocking, criticism, and stigma and commit suicide. Similarly, a significant correlation was established in a study between examination pressure, embarrassment, and shame because of failing.

It is found that besides education, the stigma of failure also affects those who fail to get desired or high-positioned jobs. Forgetting to achieve career goals makes an individual depressed and anxious; combined with the community’s constant questioning about career plans, criticizing for being unproductive, and mocking of failure, this becomes a deadly pattern for suicide.

**Stigma and suicide prevention**

Stigma, either social or self, with its diverse types, is a contributing factor behind suicide and proved to be a barrier in suicide prevention. Individuals with mental health problems avoid help-seeking to avert fear of stigmatization. Stigma in the target community’s context, to design effective suicide prevention strategies, must be analyzed. Respondents said that some foreign and non-regional organizations came and gave one or two-day sessions on suicide prevention outside of community settings. Making people sit is insufficient to listen to hours of foreign content during such sessions. It might seem helpful for some time, but effective and practical interventions are needed in the long term. Similarly, in a study, it is contended that suicide prevention methodologies are predominantly Eurocentric in their design, ignoring native, communal behaviors of knowing (Walters & Campbell, 2002). Researchers highly suggested that incorporating native ideas and views in suicide prevention programs is imperative to get valuable results (Link et al., 1989), (Walters & Campbell, 2002), (Mugisha et al., 2011). It is found that suicide prevention also needs stigma-reduction programs, having a comprehensive approach that meets each unique community’s requirements. Moreover, it is emphasized by respondents that cultural strengths like family values, religious beliefs, spirituality, traditional healing practices, and communal identity attitudes are needed to be incorporated in devising suicide prevention programs.

**Conclusion**

The data description showed a clear picture regarding the elements that boost suicidal ideation. Mental illness, love affairs, and failure in educational development was the significant stigmas prevailing in the Ghizer community. The study’s results supported the prior research studies indicating that stigma has contributed to suicide. It was
documented that mental health-related stigmas prevail more due to limited available psychiatrists (only one at the district headquarters hospital Gakuch) and mental health practitioners. Another critical factor highlighted during the research is that being professional and keeping patients' confidentiality is the ethical duty of healthcare professionals, they should maintain secrecy, and a breach of privacy could bring stigmatization, which worsens the patient's mental health instead of treatment. If the government wanted to recruit other staff in this regard, it was documented that the trust of the patients is a must; if the psychiatrist came from the same community or the area, they might be the reason for the spread of the news (respondent has health issues) which add the fuel in the fire.

Five themes were identified after data collection, all attached to suicidal ideation and the self-stigma developed from surrounding. Mental illness is the basis of self-stigma, the failure of academic development and disappointment in love affairs or loss of affection from one party under the influence of the normative structure of the community is the fundamental reason for mental illness, e.g., anxiety, self-declination, and idealism that leads to towards suicidal ideation. Durkheim's conceptualization of suicide ideation and suicidal thoughts works here in another way round scenario: the community is intact, and they have strong bonds and ties. Their bondage and fear of dishonoring family through ill-social-behaviour motivated individuals towards suicidal thoughts and stigmatization associated with external factors adding fuel to the fire. Mental health is just a health issue, but the meanings associated with this sickness control the health-seeking behaviors of the community members. The study also found that if social stigma, e.g., related to love affairs and other social evils, may spread under the impression of Muslim-conduct-of-life, it worked as a barrier to suicide ideation, e.g., suicide is a religious sin. Such tactics may be utilized to lessen the inclination of youth towards this ideation.

The last study concluded that cultural approaches should be incorporated into suicide prevention strategies, and help from social institutions, e.g., family, religion, and education, must work together to cope with this issue. The socialization process is a joint venture of social institutions, and with anthropologists' help, social institutions should act immediately to overcome suicidal thoughts among community members.

**Limitation of Study**

The limitation of the study was the seeking of consent for interviews because of the nature of the topic; suicide, mental illness, love affairs, and failure are topics that are not openly discussed in the community. Another limitation was the difference in language. Although the translation is as close as possible to the original narration; however, the risk of data loss existed during transcription from Shina and Urdu to English.

**References**


Assessing Pakistan’s Responses towards Covid-19: A Policy Appraisal

Summar Iqbal Babar
Assistant Professor at School of Politics and International Relations, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad
summar.rao@qau.edu.pk

Abstract

Covid-19 is an unprecedented phenomenon in human history that has drastically altered the global socioeconomic and strategic landscape with far-reaching political effects. In absence of a security paradigm capable of accommodating this massive health catastrophe, developing states like Pakistan were affected badly as its socioeconomic fabric nearly withered away, and health infrastructure’s deficiencies were severely exposed. It dented its health sector, slashed the economy, worsened unemployment, caused supply chain bottlenecks, and hampered inter/intranational travel. The additional inflationary pressures triggered protracted recessions and exposed the state’s (lack of) preparedness and efficacy of institutional structures against non-traditional security (NTS) threats. This further augmented the dire need for the human-centric ideation of security which poses an urgency to equip Pakistan with the necessary tools and strategies for a wide range of future non-traditional threats. In absence of a pre-defined policy framework for dealing with non-traditional security threats, central and provincial governments along with other relevant stakeholders joined hands to make a holistic preventive effort that led to the adaptation of innovative practices such as smart lockdowns and Ehsaas relief programme due to which Pakistan attained a high recovery rate of 99.13%. This article attempts to theorize the Covid-19 puzzle from a human security standpoint at the outset, evaluating Pakistan’s strategy, measures taken to combat it effectively, charts the future course of human security in Pakistan, and offers future actionable policy options.

Keywords: Covid-19, Socio-economic, Non-traditional Security, Policy Framework, Ehsaas Program, Pakistan.

Introduction

Covid-19 has impacted unprecedentedly socio-economic and political structures globally so as Pakistan. This has drastically altered policy measures, transformed strategic thinking, and expanded security landscape with significant focus on non-traditional threats. The traditional security apparatus in Pakistan has revolved around military threats that have historically disregarded non-traditional security concerns, thus, Pakistan initially, was unable to react swiftly and effectively to this non-traditional threat. Following containment measures like smart lockdowns and tightened curfews, closely knitted Pakistani society faced several issues related to the economy and physical and mental health that disturbed the country’s entire social fabric. Pakistan’s markets experienced financial losses and negative growth while policymakers wrangled over whether to impose lockdowns or maintain the country's economies. Consequently, Covid-19 caused more deaths in Pakistan than in any war since the country’s independence (Saif, 2020). The Covid-19 virus has so far infected an estimated 1.6 million individuals in Pakistan, of whom roughly
40,000 have died. The country’s GDP dropped to -1.5% while the unemployment rate skyrocketed to an alarming 6.3% (Statista, 2023).

In the absence of health security, inadequate human and financial resources, outdated healthcare infrastructure, insufficient investment in the health sector, and poor resource management, Pakistan faced problems to proactively deal with the Covid-19 issue (Sherin, 2020). Thus, innovative choices and novel practices had to be adopted to make up for the strategic limitations and resource shortages.

**Purpose**

The purpose of this paper is to gauge preparedness of Pakistan’s health system, its strategies adopted against Covid-19 to contain, initiatives taken for effective control and better institutional collaboration among government organs, health units and involvement of multiple actors including civil society, media, and global community.

**Methodology**

For this paper, a detailed literature review of secondary sources that includes policy documents and briefs, research articles and health commentaries, reports on socio-economic and political effects by global institutions and media has been done. This offered a better, comparative understanding of approaches employed by other developing countries to assess Pakistan’s covid responses and identify institutional lags, inherent and lingering structural lacunas in health system...

**Findings**

Covid-19 with its multifaced impacts to create societal inequality, hike in poverty and inflation causing more vulnerable groups and in absence of digitalized structures, compelled Pakistan to forcefully adopt the human-centric non-traditional security (NTS) paradigm. Therefore, the strategic thought process needs to be updated to achieve comprehensive security necessitating a unique synergy on economic, social, political, military, and environmental fronts, in state reaction. The human-centric security concept can be better positioned to provide Pakistan with the essential tools and methods to respond to a wide range of future non-traditional threats and utter a multifaceted response if required.

**Securitizing Covid-19 and Human Security**

Hard power has always been the main subject of security in world politics, but the Covid-19 outbreak exposed some limitations of the traditional strategic thinking and operational conduct. Although with the rise of neo-liberal thought in the realm of political economy, non-traditional security became a subject of debate among theorists for years, unfortunately, world leaders failed to realize and create an efficient system to address human security threats. Because of this prior exposure to the concept and significance of non-traditional security, the world was able to quickly adopt new techniques to tackle the pandemic.

Securitization theory played a critical role in Pakistan’s pandemic response. Following global security trends, Pakistan has traditionally conducted threat assessment from a state-centric perspective, with the resulting policy choices and strategic responses relying solely on the military component. This is why Pakistan as a unit and policymakers as a strategic wing had to suffer initial losses when the pandemic struck because policymakers faced an acute dilemma of theorizing a crisis’s non-traditional dimension i.e., health. Pakistan’s initial losses were substantial as its health
infrastructure and the economy appeared to be rapidly deteriorating, but a multifaceted non-traditional security response was quickly prepared and implemented, saving the country from chaos. Since then, the non-traditional security paradigm has been incorporated as a permanent component into Pakistan’s security regime. Pakistan’s success and rapid socioeconomic recovery can be attributed to the dynamic combination of traditional and non-traditional security paradigms working in tandem to address any type of security threat.

With the emergence of an important human security threat, policymakers need to rethink the whole security paradigm by keeping two important aspects in mind; firstly, state-centric security should give way to the security of human individuals, and secondly, armaments cannot provide human security, thus, sustainable development must be prioritized (Haq, 1994).

**Strategic Co-relation between Human Security and National Security**

The nature of security threats has drastically changed; states are faced with novel threats including (but not limited to) diseases, environmental calamities, climate crises, resource depreciation, social strife, etc. Humans find themselves at war with forces of nature, such forces that have been aggrieved by anthropogenic activities. This warrants crucial adaptation by states to provide human security against threats from a plethora of sources where causal relations are often blurred and hurt people, indiscriminately.

French President Emmanuel Macron while addressing the nation on counter-Covid measures on 16 March 2020 announced: “We are at war” (Rose & Lough, 2020). This also displays the limitations of conventional social contract in the face of non-traditional security threats. Advanced democracies faced resistance in virus containment efforts put up by groups from across the political spectrum (Babar & Malik, 2022). Nascent democracies with a history of internal conflicts saw the socio-economic, ethnic, racial, and religious fault lines emerge yet again while some reverted to varying levels of authoritarianism. This has highlighted one important aspect of human security: non-traditional threats cannot be responded to by the state alone. Thus, effective non-traditional security response must bring civil society, private stakeholders, and citizens on board with state authorities. Since democracy can provide such inclusivity, the social contract needs an overhaul. A human-centric approach can strengthen democracy in face of Covid-19 and the rising tide of authoritarianism.

**Mapping Pakistan’s Covid-19 Responses**

Pakistan is the fifth most populous country in the world with a rapidly growing population of approximately 235 million people. Yet Pakistan’s public healthcare system is inefficient due to the over-prioritization of hard components of security for the policymakers. Other than lacking in functional/operational capacity, corruption mars most meaningful reform attempts. Moreover, it barely caters to the needs of 20% of the population that is unable to bear the expenses themselves. Covid-19 was additional pressure on the already poor-performing healthcare system. Yet surprisingly, Pakistan’s healthcare system outperformed many in the region, thanks to a multifaceted policy response.

More than a year since Pakistan saw its fifth wave of Covid-19, the pandemic has been reduced to a mere bad memory. The spread-prevention standard operating procedures (SOP), once vigorously enforced by federal and provincial governments in Pakistan are no longer observed. It is critical to take stock of how Pakistan fared through the pandemic as a nation-state. The initial confusion and unpreparedness on the state’s part, coupled with the citizens’
refusal to abide by the government’s measures for containment of the Coronavirus imply that lessons learned should be incorporated into Pakistan’s national security discourse, policy actions, and society at large. The following passage overviews Pakistan’s domestic response to the unprecedented global health calamity, and its social, economic, and political impacts, followed by a critique of limited institutional capacities at the onset of the pandemic and measures taken forthwith to make up for them.

Pakistan detected the first case of Covid-19 in February 2020. Though the state institutions developed containment SOPs, contact tracing, and imposed lockdowns, the caseload touched 6,825 by 12th June that year (Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination, 2020). Pakistan’s health sector was under-resourced, underdeveloped, and in shambles pre-Covid-19; the pandemic exacerbated it further. More importantly, at the time, Pakistan’s national security policy had been, one, undefined, and two, traditionally dominated by state-centric security considerations, therefore Covid-19 was not seen as a security threat despite its potential to devastate the economic activity, resulting in political uncertainty and social strife. In 2020, as a result of a country-wide lockdown and trade disruptions, Pakistan’s GDP contracted by 0.4% (Ministry of Finance, 2022). The working population dropped from 35% to 22% during the same period (Dar, 2022). Whereas the first lockdown resulted in fears of widespread job loss and hunger, during the subsequent waves, the government resorted to systematic “smart lockdowns” to limit their economic impacts. On the social front, the state faced challenges to its writ and legitimacy at the hands of Covid-sceptics. But the inclusive response strategy, which took religious, ethnic, and political leaders of thought on board, eventually pacified the resistance.

1- Securitization of Covid-19 in Pakistan

Multiple securitizing agents may be identified in Pakistan which sought to securitize Covid-19 in Pakistan. Chief Minister Sindh Murad Ali Shah, citing the fears that the widespread viral infections in his province could spiral out of control, announced a complete lockdown beginning 23 March 2020 (Geo News, 2020). When faced with the ‘developing state dilemma’, Mr. Shah claimed that economic recovery was possible, but if a large portion of the workforce in Pakistan’s densely-populated economic hub–Karachi, Sindh–was to be infected, repercussions would be far-reaching. Hence, to him, Covid-19 posed an existential threat to human security. His rationale was picked up by celebrities, several of whom took to social media to voice their agreement (DAWN Images, 2020). Sindh’s containment strategy was soon adopted by other provinces, and the federal government took the initiative to establish a National Command and Operations Center (NCOC) to coordinate provincial efforts into a national effort. Using the platform, policymakers and experts refined the contours of lockdown policy, developing a "smart lockdown" strategy. It was augmented by the expansion of the state’s social security net through the Ehsaas emergency cash program. Thus, the securitization of Covid-19, unlike the Copenhagen School’s thesis, proved positive in the case of Pakistan and resulted in an innovative pandemic response.

2- Test, Learn, and Adapt Strategy

In absence of a non-traditional security-oriented policy to respond to the direct and indirect impacts of the pandemic, Pakistan’s earliest response followed a test, learn, and adapt strategy to bridge the gaps. Contact tracing proved to be an effective strategy, requiring multi-sectoral coordination and mobilization of limited resources in a systematic manner (Zafar et al., 2022). Whereas inbound travellers were screened for symptoms and suspects quarantined, the scope of tracing, tracking, and isolation was expanded nationwide as capacities developed over time. The public and
private laboratories lacked testing facilities; the initial test kits had to be imported at exorbitant prices amid a worldwide shortage. Indigenous kits were made available only in June 2020 (Jamal, 2020). Hospitals also faced ventilator shortages to deal with critical cases, which brought to light the fact that Pakistan had no local ventilator development capability (Mubarak, 2020). Also in short supply was personal protective equipment (PPE). Healthcare workers, overworked by the rising caseload, contracted Covid-19 by hundreds (Khan, 2020). In short, Pakistan’s health system nearly collapsed, were it not for healthcare workers who held up their end even in the most difficult of times.

3- **Invoking Health Interventions**

For effective and rapid response, it required legislative and institutional mechanisms for adroit addressal of covid-19 and following measures have been taken:

a- **The 18th Amendment and Health sector in Pakistan:**

The 18th amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan transferred the responsibility of the health sector to the health sector to the four provinces. The federal government took the lead in synergizing the national effort through the National Command and Control Center (NCOC) (Babar & Malik, 2022: 178), whose responsibilities included:

1) Bringing all the necessary stakeholders including policymakers, administrators, healthcare experts, and bureaucrats for developing necessary policy interventions for virus detection, quarantine, containment, and vaccination.

2) Data collection utilizing advanced technology to predict, prevent and contain the spread of the virus and monitor all activities.

3) Strategy development for public awareness campaigns through print, electronic, and social media.

b- **National Action Plan for Covid-19**

The National Action Plan focused on creating and responding efficiently to the Covid-19 outbreak, strengthening emergency response capabilities and preventing the further spread of the virus in Pakistan. The plan called for prioritizing financial and other resources for emergency preparedness and response and mobilizing increased domestic and international investment in this area. Provincial and Area Departments of Health can use this plan to implement important emergency preparedness actions, strengthen inter-sectoral collaboration and develop operational capabilities for an efficient response. The plan also evaluates resource allocation to ensure that financial investments support implementation (National Institute of Health, 2020).

4- **Vaccine Diplomacy**

NCOC started vaccination of frontline health workers and elderly on 10th March 2021. Table 1 shows the details of the 179.8 million vaccine vials Pakistan received as of 30th November 2021, either as donations or through bilateral agreements (UNICEF, 2021). At the time of writing, 333.6 million doses of numerous COVID-19 vaccines have been administered (single, double, and a booster dose in both cases) (Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination, 2020).
Assessing Pakistan’s Responses towards Covid-19: A Policy Appraisal

5- Establishment of NCOC and Ehsaas Cash Program

NCOC and Ehsaas Emergency Cash Programme were key in the prevention of a general socio-political and economic catastrophe. The former combined the Covid-19 testing, treatment, containment measures, and public awareness under a civil-military command, embracing technological advancement to set up a robust pandemic response. The latter, a social security net, catered to 12 million daily workers (an estimated 100 million if family system is considered) through one-time, on-demand cash assistance by disbursing Rs. 193.96 million or Rs. 12,000 per family ($78.6 in April 2021 conversion rate; $46.6 as of February 2023) (BISP, 2020). Resultantly, the social security net expanded by 281% compared to pre-Covid levels (Gentilini et al., 2020). Moreover, to shoulder the economic crunch faced by the market, the government gave an Rs. 900 billion ($5.66 billion) economic relief package. While Rs. 200 billion ($1.25 billion) were reserved for low-income groups, Rs. 280 billion ($1.76 billion) were meant for wheat procurement (Latif, 2020).

6- Countering Socio-Cultural Impediments

The social dimension of Pakistan’s response to Covid-19 as a nation-state was yet another area of concern, as the understanding of the Coronavirus by the nation and the state were immediately at odds with each other. Religious pilgrims imported a considerable number of cases in the first wave, so the state response, in addition to contact tracing and isolation, was to ban mass prayers in mosques. Sahabzada Peer Abdul Basheer, Chairman of Milli Yakjehti Council, a non-political alliance of religious parties, was one such individual who criticized the closure of mosques on religious grounds. “This is the moment that we should offer prayers and seek forgiveness from the God. But we have taken the opposite position and closed the doors of the God’s houses (masjids). This is like inviting the azab (suffering) from the God,” he was reported to have told his followers (Rehmani, n.d.). This led to visible discontentment among the citizens. But the state under the leadership of President Arif Alvi strived to bring religious scholars and other leaders of public thought on board. The president convened the first conference with religious leaders (ulema) on 26th March 2020, where he requested their support. NCOC employed ulemas’ help in creating public service messages disseminated through print, electronic, and online media. Federal Ministry of Religious Affairs and Interfaith Harmony played a leading role as a liaison between religious scholars–important thought leaders in Pakistani society–and the government. Religious leaders also lend support during the vaccination drive, calling upon their followers to get vaccinated. At a conference convened on 3rd June 2021, Mufti Kifayat Hussain Naqvi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vaccine</th>
<th>Doses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cansino</td>
<td>2,841,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PakVac (vaccine concentrate imported from CansinoBio and packaged by NIH in Pakistan)</td>
<td>6,997,320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinopharm Covax</td>
<td>8,845,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinopharm Bilateral/Donations from China</td>
<td>30,920,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinovac</td>
<td>77,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pfizer Covax</td>
<td>20,121,260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pfizer Bilateral</td>
<td>6,259,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AstraZeneca Covax</td>
<td>8,071,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderna Covax</td>
<td>9,248,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sputnick</td>
<td>9,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>197,804,280</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Type and number of COVID-19 vaccines received by Pakistan as of November 2021 (latest available data)
lauded the untiring efforts of President Alvi, who took the leading role in crafting a national effort by bringing the ulema in the loop for which he “deserves our tributes and appreciation” (Tribune, 2021).

7- **Flash Floods 2022 and Covid-19**

As of February 2023, Pakistan has had a total Covid-19 caseload of 1.57 million and 30,641 deaths, showing a 99.13% recovery rate (Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination, 2020). In a country of 235 million inhabitants, 37% of which live in densely populated urban centres, this was no less than a feat. Compared to the developed world and comparable developing states, Pakistan arguably managed to contain the virus (in its true sense). Unlike an early assessment by Bloomberg that Pakistan will take up to a decade to vaccinate 75% of its population, effective and coordinated inoculation allowed the state to vaccinate 34.6% of the eligible population—18 and older, later reduced to 5 years old—within 9 months of global vaccine rollout (Arab News PK, 2021). At the time of writing, 333.6 million doses have since been administered under the planning and direction of NCOC. Dissolved after the fourth wave subsided, NCOC was re-established by the incumbent government. Lessons learned from NCOC are expected to prove useful in future national calamities. One such example is National Flood Response and Coordination Center (NFRCC), modelled on NCOC to “articulate and synergize flood relief efforts” established to oversee post-Monsoon 2022 flood rehabilitation and restoration efforts (National Flood Response & Coordination Center, n.d.).

8- **Mapping the Future of Human Security in Pakistan**

The COVID-19 pandemic served as an eye-opener for the magnitude of threats posed by non-traditional security challenges. Pakistan had to rethink its national security approach from a human security perspective to prevent—what could otherwise have been—a perfect storm. This paradigm shift has the potential to serve the state in any future security theorization and policymaking. A human-centric security focus will arguably strengthen the federation. NCOC, for instance, provided a platform for governments across Pakistan to coordinate on policy and implementation of effective pandemic response. Such employment of technology and public access to information with little bureaucratic red tape is expected to bring transparency in hitherto closed-door policymaking. The aforementioned NFRCC, conceived based on lessons learned from NCOC, strengthens the argument that Pakistan should establish a permanent national, apolitical, flexible, and human-centric institution with a legal/constitutional status through proper legislative process from the parliament (Khalid, 2021). The first-ever National Security Policy (NSP) of Pakistan released on 12th January 2022 acknowledged human security as a crucial aspect of comprehensive national security.

9- **Sharing the Dividends-Regional Human Security**

Pakistan’s National Security Policy envisions “mutual coexistence, regional connectivity, and shared prosperity (as) essential prerequisites” to the national security of individual states and regional peace (National Security Division, 2022). Human security is not only a common need of all states, but the multifaceted challenges facing human beings, their needs, and complex interactions can be best solved through a collective effort. Hence, NCOC can provide a model to be replicated under the umbrella of S.A.A.R.C. (South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation is a regional intergovernmental organization. Member states collaborate for human welfare, mutual assistance, and regional self-reliance) at the regional level for collective human security in South Asia.

In post-pandemic, Pakistan is a new state by all means. Whereas the authorities seemed clueless at the beginning, faced with an unprecedented non-traditional security challenge, an interconnected and integrated national response
proved useful in two ways. One, it strengthened democracy whereby different governments and state institutions worked in collaboration for a national cause. Second, it highlighted critical gaps in Pakistan’s national security. The economic, political, and social challenges discussed above are by no means exhaustive, but a careful assessment of each can help prepare the state for future crises that may befall the country and threaten national security. In this regard, Pakistan’s National Security Policy 2022-26 is a step in the right direction.

10- Actionable Policies

Given a critical appraisal, identifying the loopholes in policy implementations, following are the suggested actionable measures to be considered:

1. **Future-oriented Research:** Institutional responses based on careful improvisation of limited resources/expertise allowed Pakistan to avoid a general catastrophe. Thus, research on best practices, strengths and weaknesses in institutional actions can help in drawing lessons and preparing a national response strategy for future national-level emergencies.

2. **Overhaul of Health Infrastructure:** Government must build upon the stopgap measures which improved the healthcare infrastructure, equipment, and workforce amid the COVID-19 pandemic. Healthcare infrastructure is essential for pandemic response: The COVID-19 pandemic has highlighted the critical importance of healthcare infrastructure, including hospitals, clinics, and laboratories, in responding to pandemics. Governments must invest in the construction, maintenance, and upgrading of healthcare infrastructure to ensure that it can withstand the demands of a pandemic. An increase in federal/provincial healthcare budgets coupled with reforms and improved transparency may reinforce the gains made during the pandemic.

3. **Devolution of Healthcare Policy and Service Provision:** During the pandemic, the federal and provincial governments displayed an impressive coordination through the National Command and Control Center (NCOC). But the fruits of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan need to be devolved to the lowest tiers of government for improvement in citizen-centric policy making and service provision.

4. **People-centric Healthcare Policy/Strategy:** Inter-connected societies offer both opportunities and complexities. In the age of disinformation, governments must establish their credibility through effective use of social media (in addition to traditional sources) to keep the information-hungry citizens from falling for anti-state propaganda. In this view, the young require attention.

5. **Health Economy:** Filling gaps in Pakistan’s health economy is critical for improving healthcare outcomes: Pakistan faces significant gaps in its health economy, including limited access to medical equipment and vaccines. These gaps can lead to inadequate healthcare delivery, particularly in rural and underserved areas. By filling these gaps, the government can improve healthcare access and outcomes for all citizens. Government may seek public-private partnerships in this regard. Public-private partnerships can bring expertise and resources: Public-private partnerships can be an effective way to fill gaps in Pakistan’s health economy. The private sector can bring expertise and resources to develop new technologies and improve existing ones, while the government can provide regulatory oversight and support for research and development. By working together, the public and private sectors can bring new innovations to the healthcare sector and improve healthcare outcomes for all citizens. Development and/or support of entrepreneurial ventures also require state’s support through dedicated policy making, funding, and incubation.
Conclusion

Pakistan’s policy and operational infrastructure were not prepared for a non-traditional security challenge at the onset of COVID-19 pandemic, yet it managed to contain the pandemic and its socio-economic and political fallout. Pakistan was quick to alter the emphasis from state-centric security to a human-centric security paradigm. The successful adaptation of a hybrid state-cum-human centric security policy and mobilization of multiple resources at the disposal proved to be extremely vital in curtailing the disastrous outcomes of the pandemic. Moreover, the long-term impacts, be those health-related or economic, were also taken care of through innovative incorporation of the Ehsaas programme and the establishment of NCOC. The shift in Pakistan’s policy paradigm will play a crucial role in mitigating the impacts of any natural or induced calamity in the future and has posed an urgency at the state level to divert attention from hard components of security to soft/unprecedented ones. Pakistan’s response to Covid-19 was perhaps better calculated and articulated in the region, but still, the policy shift alone can be only so much fruitful unless there is cooperation at the regional level. Therefore, it is in the best interest of the international community to work together to give due regard to human security and devise a collective response regime at the regional and global levels.
Bibliography


Pakistan will take a decade to vaccinate 75% population—Media. (2021, April 6). Arab News PK. https://www.arabnews.pk/node/1838321/pakistan


EFFECT OF SELF-ESTEEM AND PERSONALITY TRAITS ON ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT OF UNIVERSITY STUDENTS

Dr. Hamid Ali Nadeem
Lecturer Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad,
hamid.ali@aiou.edu.pk

Arshad Mehmood Qamar
Lecturer Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad,
arshad.mehmood@aiou.edu.pk

Farkhanda Bashir
Punjab School Education Department
farkh.pg@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The objective of this research was to study the effect of self-esteem and personality traits on academic achievement of university students. Self-esteem and personality traits are the most important aspects that affect the academic achievement of university students. For this reason, one hundred and fifty (150) university students (N=75 male, N=75 female) were selected randomly. Two questionnaires were used to collect the data. Rosenberg's self-esteem scale (1997) and John & Sirivastava's Big Five inventory (BFI) scale (1999) were administered for this purpose. The standard of academic achievement was their average academic marks during their academic year. Data were analyzed through inferential statistics including Pearson correlation and multiple regression. Results showed that self-esteem, personality traits (introversion and openness to experience), and academic achievement are correlated. The result of this research revealed that self-esteem and personality factors are affecting the academic achievement of university students. It is recommended that the students at the postgraduate level must be guided in terms of personality development and boosting their self-esteem for their improved performance in their academics.

KEYWORDS: Self-esteem, personality traits, academic achievement

INTRODUCTION

Maturity usually starts at 12 or 13 and till 18 or 19 years old. Social appreciation explains the status of youth in their society, especially in the form of a transmission distance between childhood and adulthood. Reynolds, Hopkins, and Stoll (1993) described youth as a period with personal development more than childhood and adultery, which gives physical, psychological, and social distinction to its special place within the development of psychological psychiatry. First, the variables of the study are to be introduced forming the conceptual background for the research.
Self-Esteem

Self-confidence can be sent to itself as a capable or self-portrait and the global dimension of self-esteem (Galanakis, Palaiologou, Patsi, Velegraki & Darviri, 2016). It is a fact that we deal with ourselves as well as with the feelings associated with our decisions (Wang, Huebner & Tian, 2021) and according to broad beliefs about ourselves. Self-esteem includes the separation of ophthalmologists such as academic ability, close friendship, romantic appeal ability, and physical appearance (Bazkiaei, Heng, Khan, Saufi & Kasim, 2020). The diagnosis in which the person creates and maintains his customs. It describes an attitude of approval. It shows an attitude of approval and indicates that individuals are self-sufficient, capable, successful, self-esteemed, and self-determinant (Munir, Jianfeng & Ramzan, 2019; Tus, 2020).

Types of self-esteem

Self-esteem is the image of a person. Self-esteem is widely believed to play a major role in relationships. For better or worse, self-esteem can be affected at work, at home, with friends, family, and even strangers. Concepts of self-esteem are traditionally divided into "high" and "low", with general self-esteem and self-acceptance of self-esteem, and self-determination characterized by self-destructive feelings (Arsandaux, Montagni, Macalli, Bouteloup, Tzourio & Galera, 2020). The following are different types of self-esteem.

High self-esteem

Usually, highly confident people have been asked to lead happiness and more psychological health (Baumeister, Campbell, Krueger, & Vohs, 2003). Generally, highly confident people have been asked to lead happiness and more psychological health.

Healthy self-esteem means you cannot end up trusting yourself or getting less feedback. You can get healthy self-esteem and still feel uncomfortable about something. But with more healthy people, most people can recognize that they are unhappy about it and work to deal with it less difficult. Usually, healthy self-esteem generally encourages others who appreciate their value. They have an easy time with the relationship and can succeed quickly. The reason for this is that they are not held by a negative self-image with a self-esteemed or superior person with the embedded image of a person (Lavy & Naama-Ghanayim, 2020).

Low self-esteem

Low self-esteem is a hopeful state that prevents people from realizing their full potential. People with low self-esteem seem imperfect, inevitable, and inexperienced. People with low self-esteem feel very vulnerable to themselves. Such feelings always make people confident. Casale(2020) argues that self-confidence is a hallmark of economically unsuccessful people, leading to low risk-taking. It usually starts when a person says something negative about themselves. Once someone begins to believe this negative feedback, others may lose confidence. Over time, people start having negative conversations. People with low self-awareness are generally detached from others, have a low self-image, and negative self-talk and proportions often lead people down a dangerous path of depression (Kircaburun, Alhabash, Tosuntaş & Griffiths, 2020).

Humanistic theory of Maslow

A common human desire to be accepted and appreciated by others is the gift of gratitude. People frequently seek recognition through jobs and interests. The person experiences a sense of contribution and worth through day-to-day activities performed. At this level of the hierarchy, imbalances can result from low self-esteem, and inferiority complexes may arise. People who have low self-esteem frequently require the respect of others. You might feel
compelled to work toward fame and honor. However, you won’t be able to improve your self-esteem until you accept who you are (Maddi & Costa, 2017). Higher levels of self-esteem can be hindered by mental imbalances like depression. The majority of people require stable self-esteem. Maslow distinguished between a "low" and "high" version of needs. The need for respect from others is the "low" form of respect. This may include the need for attention, recognition, fame, and status. For instance, the individual might require strength, competence, control, self-assurance, freedom, and independence. Because it is based on experience-based internal competencies, this "high" version takes precedence over the "low" version (Acevedo, 2018). If someone doesn’t meet these needs, he/she may experience feelings of helplessness, weakness, and inferiority. This indicates that the subsequent levels of gratitude are not distinct. Instead, the levels are connected. Because it affects who we are and how much we are worth, self-esteem is important. When it comes to how we think, feel, and make decisions, self-esteem affects everything. In his hierarchy of human needs, Abraham Maslow refers to the "need for honor" as a need. There are different aspects of this including self-love, self-assurance, competence, and respect are all aspects of self-respect. "That which, above fame, glory, and flattery, demonstrates the respect we deserve of others," according to Maslow, is the most wholesome expression of self-esteem (Navy, 2020).

**Personality Traits**

The "big five" personality traits are often referred to by contemporary personality psychologists as the five fundamental aspects of personality. These five categories are usually described as follows:

1. **Extraversion**

Extraversion is characterized by strengthening, encouraging, social ability, communication, intensity, and an excessive amount of emotional expression. People who are higher in extroversion are out to get energy in social situations. People who are less (or introduced) to extroversion are more secure and have to spend energy in social settings (Normadhi, Shuib, Nasir, Bimba, Idris, & Balakrishnan, 2019).

2. **Agreeableness**

The dimension of this personality includes attributes, adultery, mercy, compassion, and other behavior. Those who agree are more cooperative, while in this exhibition they are more competitive and even paired (Normadhi et. al., 2019).

3. **Conscientiousness**

This dimension’s standard features include high-level thinking, with good continuity control and behavior-related approaches. They regularly organize and mind accordingly (Normadhi et. al., 2019).

4. **Neuroticism**

Neuroticism is a feature that is visible, disappointed, and passionate about inefficiency. In this way, more people experience mood, worries, disappointment, hurry, and depression. In this exhibition, fewer people are more stable and passionate (Normadhi et. al., 2019).

5. **Openness**

These features such as imagination and insight, and there is a wide range of interests in this feature. Those who are more in this exhibition are more interesting and creative. In this nature, fewer people are often more traditional and can struggle with an overview of thinking(Normadhi et. al., 2019).
Theories of Personality

There are numerous theories regarding the development of personality. Many of these theories have been influenced by various psychology schools. The following are important perspectives on personality:

**Biological theory:** The biological approach suggests that personality is influenced by genes. Research on heritability suggests that personality traits and genetics are linked. Connection of personality traits to biological processes is one of the most well-known biological theories (Mitchell & Kumari, 2016).

**Psychological theory:** According to behavioral theory, an individual's personality develops as a result of how they interact with their surroundings. Behavior theorists reject theories that take into account internal thoughts and feelings and instead focus on behavior that can be observed and measured. John B. Watson and B.F. Skinner are two behavioral theorists (Ohara, Mase, Kouda, Miyawaki, Momoi, Fujitani & Nakamura, 2019).

**Humanistic Theory:** Humanistic theory emphasizes the significance of individual experience and free will in a person's personality. The idea of self-actualization, or the innate need for personal development that drives behavior, was emphasized in humanist theory. Abraham Maslow and Carl Rogers are two humanist theorists.

**Theory of traits:** One of the most important areas of personality psychology is the trait theory approach. This theory says that personality is made up of more characteristics. People’s behaviors are essentially shaped by traits, which are relatively stable characteristics (Jayawickreme, Zachry & Fleeson, 2019).

Academic Achievement

Educational success or (educational) is the result of performance education - as far as a student, teacher or institution has achieved their educational goals. Academic success or achievement is usually measured by examination or continuous evaluation.

**OBJECTIVES**

The objectives of this study were:

1. To find out the effect of self-esteem and personality on educational success among university students.
2. To study the relationship between students’ self-esteem and personality characteristics among students.

**Hypotheses**

H1: The higher the self-esteem and personality traits, the higher the rate of academic achievement among adolescents.

H2: The higher the academic achievement, the higher the personality traits.

H3: The higher the self-esteem the higher the personality traits.

**METHOD**

**Sampling Technique and Sample**
A stratified sampling technique was used for this research. The sample of the study was selected from three HEC-recognized universities of Islamabad including Air University, Quaid-e-Azam University, and the National University of Modern Languages (NUML). The present study examined the relationship of personality traits and self-esteem with academic achievement. The sample size was 150 which were equally divided into males (75= 25 male from each university), and females (75= 25 female from each university).

**Research instrument**

**Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale**

Rosenberg’s self-esteem scale was used to find out the self-esteem of the sample, with 10 items scale having responses on a 4-point Likert scale ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree.

**Big Five Factor Personality Traits**

The big five personality inventory, developed by John and Srivastava (1999) was used to measure the personality. The questionnaire contains 44 items. This scale was designed on 5 Point Likert scale ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree. The questionnaire covers the big five elements (dimensions) of the personality (Azucar, Marengo & Settanni, 2018).

**Validity and reliability of instruments**

First of all, questionnaires were distributed to three-panel experts who had PhD Education degrees, for content validation. Drawing on their comments about the questionnaire’s design, panel experts found that the questionnaires were appropriate to measure the self-esteem and personality of Pakistani university students. These tools were pilot tested on a sample of 60 students. Reliability was calculated through Cronbach Alpha coefficient value. It was found 0.72 and 0.87 for BFI and RSE respectively.

**Data collection**

The researchers visited the sampled universities. They were briefed about the objectives of the study and explained that there is no correct or wrong answer to the questions and privacy of their answers. They were assured about the confidentiality and privacy of their data.

**RESULTS**

Inferential statistics were used to analyze quantitative data.

**Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alpha reliabilities of Rosenberg’s self-esteem and Personality traits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scales</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results of Table 1 show that all instruments i.e., the Big Five Inventory and Rosenberg Self-esteem scale have high alpha coefficient reliability. The reliability for BFI is 0.72 and for RSE is 0.87. These values of alpha reliability indicate that all scales are reliable.
Table 2

Demographic description of the sample (n=150)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Status</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower (10,000-20,000)</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>21.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle (25,000-30,000)</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>73.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper (40,000-60,000)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5.34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Adolescence (18)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>33.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Adolescence (19)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>33.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Late Adolescence (20)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>33.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family System</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>59.33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>40.67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The total sample's gender and marital status distribution is shown in Table 2, with the sample's age range being 16 to 24. The gender distribution of the samples was the same as shown in the table. Male and females both participated equally (50 percent). The nuclear family system is represented by nearly 59.33% of the participants, while the joint family system is represented by 40.67%.

Table 3

Pearson correlation of Rosenberg self-esteem scale and Big Five inventory (n=150)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scales</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BFI</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.540**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSE</td>
<td>0.540**</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 illustrates the result of the correlation between Rosenberg’s self-esteem scale and the Big Five inventory. The result significantly shows the positive correlation between BFI and RSE which supports the hypothesis that there is a relationship between self-esteem and personality traits among adolescence.

Table 4

Regression Analysis of Rosenberg self-esteem scale, Big five inventory and Academic Performance (n=150)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>β</th>
<th>95% CI</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>-3.155</td>
<td>(-3.607, -2.703)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSE</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>(-.006, .27)</td>
<td>.878</td>
<td>526.46</td>
<td>.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BFI</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>(-.029, .033)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 represents the analysis of regression to find prognostic rates involving self-esteem and personality traits on academic performance among adolescence. This table depicts that self-esteem (β=0.61, 95% CI) and personality traits (β=0.72, 95% CI) are momentous prognostics of academic performance. Our calculated values of R² represent high variance in academic achievement by both self-esteem and personality traits. The above-stated prediction is significant at F (526.46) and p<.05

DISCUSSIONS

The first variable of the study was self-esteem how self-esteem expresses the individual behavior of men and occupies their occupation and how personal characters or factors contribute to personal decisions. These factors are open for experience, intelligence, utility, unanimousness, and neuroticism. This research was initiated (Casale, 2020) for self-confidence, achievement goals, and educational achievements to define the relationship between self-esteem, successful goals, and educational achievements among educational school children. For this reason, 200 primary school students (100 men, 100 women) were randomly selected, and then using two questionnaires for data collection. This is a list of success qualifications of the self-esteem question and students.

The researcher’s second variable personality or symptoms, also known as the five factors model (FFM), is a model consisting of common language interpreters (Azucar, Marengo & Settanni, 2018). It is not based on experiments). This is widely used by a psychologist who describes human personality and psychology through five psychologies. These five factors are described as experience, intelligence, utility, consensus, and neurotransmitters. Many researchers believe that they are the five basic personality signs. People who are less (or introduced) to extroversion are more secure, and on the other hand, people have to spend energy in social settings, which can increase high expansion and benefit in social, social status. The second way defines unanimous trust, fate, love, and other behavior. Those who exceed the consent are more cooperative, while at that time these people are more competitive and even paired. The person, who is highly skeptical with good continuity and purpose, guides them to believe (Hazrati-Viari et al., 2012; John, John & Rao, 2020).

The current research model speculates n = 150 university students, with 75 male students and 75 females. According to my research, the first objective of my research is the relationship between the students and their personalities. If the quality of self-esteem and personality is high, the higher education rate is higher than that of
The result significantly shows positive touch between the BFI and the RSS, which supports its promotion, that there is a relationship between the university’s self-esteem and personality (Robins et al., 2001).

The current study was organized to compare the relationship between self-esteem, characteristics, and the impact of the personality of personality and their impact on youth. In this study, we also study the family’s family varieties, gender differences, and ages, self-esteem of GPA, personality symptoms, and academic success. First, we looked at how personality traits and self-esteem are linked. We discovered a strong positive correlation between these dimensions, as was to be expected. Five major personality factors are linked to higher levels of self-esteem: openness and proximity to experience, agreeableness and hostility, conscientiousness and disorientation, neuroticism and emotional stability, and I comprehend. Additionally, these outcomes are in line with (Fatemeh Amirazodi and Maryam Amirazodi, 1999; Naseer, Mussarat & Malik 2022). Second, we looked into the connection between personality traits and academic performance. Positive correlations were found between academic performance and the Big Five personality traits, as was to be expected. Higher school grades correlate with higher personality traits. Additionally, these results were in line with those (Batista et al., 2022; Batool, 2020; Cid-Sillero, et al., 2020).

CONCLUSION & RESEARCH DIRECTIONS

The purpose of the current research was to investigate the connection between personality traits, self-esteem, and their effect on academic performance. The findings point to a significant connection between academic performance, personality traits, and self-esteem. Male adolescents have higher self-esteem than female adolescents. In a nutshell, the objectives of this study were met in every way. Every research study is bound to have some limitations. Despite these limitations, this study contributed significantly to the literature regarding the effect of personality traits and self-esteem on the academic performance of university students.

The researchers were glad to be part of this project that could ever be conducted. But at the same time, researchers have not covered all aspects of this study. Therefore, it is recommended that other researcher may study the effect of self-esteem on the academic performance of students in a larger population and with different levels of students.
REFERENCES


Körük, S. (2017). The Effect of Self-Esteem on Student Achievement. In: Karadag, E. (eds) The Factors Affecting Student Achievement. Springer, Cham. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-56083-0_15](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-56083-0_15)


Academic Writing Problems Faced by ESL Learners in Higher Education Institutions

Amna Umar
Lecturer Visiting, Department of English, Lahore College For Women University
amnaumar2016@gmail.com

Dr. Muhammad Ajmal
Associate Professor of Linguistics & Literature
Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, D.I. Khan
dr.muhammad.ajmal@qurtuba.edu.pk

Dr. Fouzia Ajmal
Assistant Professor, Department of Teacher Education, International Islamic University Islamabad
fouzia.ajmal@iiu.edu.pk

Abstract

English is used as a medium of instruction for educational purposes all over the world. All the subjects such as Mathematics, Social Sciences, and Technology are taught in English. However, students face difficulties to communicate effectively in that present study was conducted to find out the writing difficulties and the reasons for those difficulties. The sample consisted of the postgraduate students of University of Education Faisalabad campus. This study used quantitative method. The data were collected via questionnaire and were analysed by calculating frequency, mean, and standard deviation. The data analysis depicted grammar, preposition, vocabulary and sentence structures as main problems. Students felt that insufficient teaching methods are the cause of these problems. The students needed that teachers may deliver lectures in English language to improve their writing skills.

Key words: Academic Writing, ESL Learners, Spelling, Vocabulary

Introduction

Academic writing skills are an important but most difficult skills for university students especially who did not have English as their native language (Lee & Tajino 2008, Negari, 2012). They face many problems in the areas of vocabulary and spellings. The effective writing skills require mastering the grammar of that language. Studies revealed that poor grammatical structures of language affect the performance of written assignments (Myles, 2002). Writing is used as a mode of appraisal, which shows the writer's skill especially in ESL content. For the ESL learners learning English is the need of the hour (Ying, Siang, & Mohamad, 2021). Academic writing is a process in which we show our ideas, perception,
Academic Writing Problems Faced by ESL Learners in Higher Education Institutions

and information. It must deal with the specific topic. The features of an academic writing are valid, reliable, precise, and use references from the other. According to Adams and Keene (2000) teaching of English can help the students to improve their academic writing and speaking Skill. Students with their academic career must have to cope with different writing Genre such as Summery, essays, reviews, and research articles. Daoud and Al-Hazmi (2002) showed that non-native speakers of the English language explored a new world of academic writing by assessing self-integration of learning and intellectual commitment.

The development of writing is influenced by many factors like writing ability, language proficiency, and experiences of such languages (Kobayashi & Rinnert, 2008; Kubota, 1998). Academic writing must be written in formal language and style Academic writing must have a serious thought constructed on the basis of grammatical pattern. Teachers uses the different Approaches such as Product, Process, and Genre to enhance the writing skill of students. Product approach is followed by many teachers in our schools and colleges which focuses on mimicry and memorization of model text. The process approach in which creativity is more demanded than the memorization. The genre approach involves learners to complete their writing not only as text to produce but this text involves all the structures and features which is directly related to the given topic. This research focus on writing for academic purpose: problem faced by ESL learners in UE Faisalabad campus. ESL writing is one of the major challenges for both students and teachers. According to AL Faddy (2012) the basics of academic writing is to see the talent of learners to check the related references, and organize them in such a way that they develop its own expression. Instead of a single person, academic writing deals with the society (Bruke, 2012). It is necessary for ESL learners how the use of Colon, Semicolon, in their writing. ESL learners must be conscious in order to reduce the mistake while writing a dialogue, Summery, research paper or the title of thesis. Academic writing becomes a very prominent factor for professional career. It is a truth that we judge students’ ability through their writing at higher level.

Literature Review

According to Musa (2010), writing is difficult skill to acquire due to involvement of many components like punctuation and spelling. English for specific purposes is divided into two types. First is English for Occupational Purposes (EOP) second is English for Academic Purposes (EAP). Its aim is to improve students’ skills of communication reading and writing in a very short time period so that they can achieve success in life. In 1960’s English become the most dominant area of EFL learning or teaching. Its importance is shown by a number of Universities that provided M. A. in that specific language.

Another contributing factor is the writing styles of the writers (Kubota, 1998). Researchers investigated that writing skill transfers between first language and second language (Kobayashi & Rinnert, 2008; Kubota 1998). On the other hand, many researchers argued that the first and second languages are different from each other (Grabe, 2000; Petrice & Czarl, 2003). Hutchinson and Waters (1987) state that the main point which must be done in ESP (English for Specific Purposes) teaching is use of authentic materials that help the students to acquire better opportunities for jobs. ESP defined as a process of teaching of English for academic studies and professional purposes. Hutchinson and Waters says that there are two historical steps that give life to ESP. Firstly World War brought a new phase of development in the fields of life such as science, technology and economy (Hutchinson & Waters, 1987) that’s why English becomes the language of
knowledge. According to Hutchinson and Waters (1987) at that time English became the language of demand of people than other language. They also point out that spoken English can vary from written English.

With the help of rhetorical and linguistic options, novice writers need writing tasks after careful examination of complex variables in composition (Johns, 2008). Many researchers explored the teachers' perceptions about the academic writing (Casanave & Hubbard, 1992; Zhu, 2004). Many researchers examined the students' perceptions (Grami, 2010; Yiu, 2009). The third group explored the students' writing sample (Ezza, 2010; Tahaineh, 2010). The last one explored the judgements of the students about their academic advisors (Bacha & Bahous, 2008; Myles & Cheng, 2003).

Dudley Evans and St. John assert that ESP is not only related with some particular fields and it is not merely used by adult students but also by young adult in secondary level. There are types of ESP language described by David Carter in (1983), first is restricted language used by waiters and traffic police. But people who use that language are not able to communicate in new situation. Carter developed the second type of ESP that is English for Academic and Professional Purposes. ESP is further divided into three types such as English for Business and Economic (EBE). Hutchinson and Waters state that the other type is particular subject.

Hutchinson and Waters differentiate EAP and EOP. EAP use and learnt for study purposes and EOP is used by students when they get a job. EOP has great importance in profession and it is the language of doctors, lawyer, tourist and nurses. EAP is a language which is taught in educational institute and students wants to specialize in that language during their ESL programmes. Myles in (2002) says that academic writing is a conscious process and needs much practice to compose developed and analyze ideas. Grammar is the most complex area for second language learners (Farouq, 2012). Nyasimi (2014), the challenges using correct sentence structures and paragraph development need struggle by the students. Grammar is not a set of rules, but a growing structure of language (Kleisar, 2005). There is a close relationship between language and culture. Baker (2003) argues that language reflect our belief, values, morals and entirely culture and by learning language one's learn language. Many ESL learners learn L1 from their school that is why when learning second language students are not able to collect their ideas in form of academic writing in ESL context. This situation is alarming because they do not know what academic English is and use conversational English for writing purposes.

Academic writing is the main component of students' socialising at university level. It is important for students to improve soft skills and academic writing skills needed by students (Jacobs, 2007). Academic writing and business writing are two types of writing styles. Business writing is based on hard facts. Academic writing is that in which reader describe their beliefs and values to explain a subject. Business writing may be called practical writings. These writings include CVs, application and personal letters for jobs. Academic writing has eight features such as complexity, hedging formality, explicitly, responsibility etc. The language of these writings is accurate and simple. The students must talk oriented in learning process to ensure academic tasks and understanding the rules of academic writing for their success (Pineteh, 2014). It is the responsibility of the students to overcome their shortcoming of poor writing skill and their lack of English competency. Academic writing requires effort and commitment needed guidance by teachers to appreciate the fact.
Several writings are conducted in the area of academic writing in English as a second language context and identify the problems that students face while academic writing. Lee and Tajino (2008) proposed that the development of second language is attributable to experiences in that language than to transfer of cultural patterns in first language. Wiggle (2002) says that writing shows not only the thought of the person but also the new information in the world. Academic writing is the type of critical writing and to produce new information in second language advocated by Arnopolsky. The academic writing skills need individual attention and regular feedback (Pineteh, 2014). English can help the students to make effective use of academic requirement and learning context (Adams & Keene, 2000). English writing skills make the students proficient in critical thinking and inspiration to earn and utilize powerful word expressions and best vocabulary (Abdulwahed, 2010; Ismail, 2011).

Fujioke did a survey and suggest how Asian students achieved academic writing. Major problem faced by ESL learners is critical thinking rather than lexical problems. Research shows that lack organize ability due to their translating text first in Urdu then write in English. Abad (1988) find that ESL learner problems in writing skill due to inappropriate teaching method and unsuitable environment which is not suitable to learn a foreign language. According to Al Murshidi (2014), poor academic writing skill is responsible for low language proficiency. The reasons included wrong choice of vocabulary, grammar errors, irregular verbs, spelling mistakes and punctuation (Al-Khairy, 2013).

ESL students face two types of problems first is lack of vocabulary, spelling mistake, pronunciation and errors in syntax or morphology. The second is that they are not able to express their ideas properly when write about a common topic of everyday life. He points out that cause of these problems is students’ inefficiency in English inside and outside classrooms. Ballard and Clancy say that academic writing become tough for non-native speaker because they are less familiar with English. Al Mukharge says in (1985) mother tongue is the greatest hindrance in academic writing for ESL learners. Academic writing skills have an important role for non-native speakers of English language like objectivity, formality and complexity for using the language accurately and precisely (Abdulwahed, 2010).

The Objectives of the Study

The objectives of study were:
1. To find out the writing difficulties that postgraduate students have to meet in their academic writing courses.
2. To investigate the reasons of the writing difficulties among students of University of Education FSD campus.
3. To find out the problems in academic writing course.

Research Questions

These were the research questions of study:
1. What are the kinds of writing used by postgraduate students in UE?
2. What are writing difficulties faced by students in UE FSD Campus?
3. What are the causes of writing problems faced by students?
4. What are the suggestions to solve this problem?
Methodology

The research was descriptive in nature. The researchers used quantitative method to explain the writing for academic purpose, problems faced by ESL learners in UE Faisalabad campus. The population of this research was the students of English department of University of Education Faisalabad Campus. Students were selected from semester four and five. The respondents belonged to different backgrounds because of socio economic and educational culture varies. The study sample consisted of 100 students randomly selected from University of Education FSD campus after taking data of ESL students who had undergone the course of academic writing. Thus, each student served as a sampling unit for the study. Thus, from the responses of this sample the data has been collected and analysed.

The research questions for this study were most appropriately investigated using the exploratory tools of questionnaire. With the use of the survey questionnaire this study took on the combined quantitative approach of research. By means of employing this approach, the researcher was able to obtain the advantages of both quantitative approach and overcome their limitations. Data from quantitative research differs in several ways. This is a major difference in data interpretation. A precise distinction between facts and opinions was available in this type of research (Cooper & Schindler, 2006).

Results

Data of all questionnaire (N=100) were entered in SPSS version 23. Analysis of data was presented in the form of tables followed by interpretation. Information collected through questionnaire was analysed by calculating frequency, mean, and standard deviation. The frequency shows that how students responded on five-point Likert scale. The mean values show the balancing point of their responses on each problem. Standard deviation shows that how much responses deviated from the mean. To find the difference in distribution of responses, chi-square test was conduct.

Table 1

Mean, SD of responses of problems faced by postgraduate students in academic writing (N=100)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weak foundation of target language</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of motivation</td>
<td>4.08</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of L1 in the classroom</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural difference between L1 and L2</td>
<td>3.98</td>
<td>1.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural difference in L1 and L2</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in register</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties in expression</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammatical error</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of vocabulary</td>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in use of syntactical structure</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties in proposition</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>1.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in use of sentences</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling errors</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 showed problems faced by post graduate students in academic writing. Mostly students responded that they agreed or strongly agreed with these problems but intensity of the problems is different. Students felt problems in expression and they considered the structural differences between L1 and L2 caused grammatical and spelling errors those results in problems in syntactical structures. Prepositional problems caused confusion in use of correct tenses. Mostly these problems occur as a result of the Lack of vocabulary encountered by students that is associated with the use of L1 in L2 classrooms. The eighty-seven percent students were agreed or completely agreed that lack of vocabulary is most common problem among postgraduate students. The mean value (M=4.27, SD=0.96) is highest among all other problems.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic writing is important area of study</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>0.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prescribed syllabus</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of writing</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of writing included in syllabus are sufficient.</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 showed the types of problems carried by the learners in University of Education. Respondents responded in both ways positive and negative. They found weaknesses in syllabus as well as they were not satisfied with the types of writing in their classrooms Mean values (M=4.53 SD= 0.73) showed that the respondents consider academic writing as an important area of study. However, they were not satisfied with their prescribed syllabus. Mean values (M=3.94 SD= 1.11) reflects this clearly. There is no significant difference in results about the respondents' views towards the satisfaction and sufficiency of academic writing included in their syllabus (M= 3.55 SD=1.13) (M=3.27 SD =1.25)

Table 3 showed that students' problems in academic writing is lack of guidance (M=4.42 SD=0.90). Mean values showed that (M=3.76 SD=1.19) the respondents do not get opportunity to practice academic writing in their classrooms. Assessment system in U. E. (M=3.61 SD=1.27) is also a cause of problems in academic writing. According to the respondents, insufficient teaching strategies (M=3.22 SD=1.39) caused problems in their academic writing. Results showed that the students were not familiar with referencing style (M=3.15 SD=1.30) and they considered that the less opportunities to practice academic writing in classrooms (M= 3.76 SD=1.19) as a cause of their problems.
Table 4
Mean, SD of responses about main problem Areas in academic writing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grammatical error</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in register</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of vocabulary</td>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in use of syntactical structure</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties in proposition</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>1.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems in use of tenses</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling errors</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 revealed that mean values represent that the lack of vocabulary (M=4.27 SD=0.96) was the major problem in academic writing. Respondents faced problems in the organization of syntactical structure (M=4.00 SD 0.98). Table showed that learners encountered problems in register (M= 4.27 SD=0.96) as well as prepositions (M=3.84 SD=1.23) pose difficulty in academic writing. Results showed (M=4.01 SD 1.13) that students face grammatical errors in writing. Another important area of language learning is pointed out i.e. use of tenses for sentence formation (M= 3.45 SD=1.30), this is closed to spelling errors which was very significant problem in writing in general. These identified issues in academic writing became the basis of problems in syntactical structure of L2 for ESL learners in University of Education.

The mean value (M=4.27, SD=0.96) was highest among all other means of problems.

Table 5
Percentage, Mean and SD of responses about how to overcome the writing problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learner centered classroom</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>.910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher as a facilitator</td>
<td>4.61</td>
<td>.723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of multiple teaching facilities</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>.735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom writing tasks</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>.674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of simple English in classroom</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>.891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific material for academic writing</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive reading</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>.990</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 showed the suggestions about how to overcome problems in academic writing. Mean values (M=4.61 SD=.723) presented that the respondents emphasize the role of teacher in classroom. 69 % respondents agreed that the teacher should be a facilitator in teaching process that is in line with new concepts of teaching and learning. The participants of the study suggested (M=4.53 SD=.735) the use of multiple teaching strategies as well as they also suggested (M=4.42 SD=.674) that classroom writing task enhanced their skills. Respondents favour (M=4.33 SD=.910) the learner centered classrooms and use of simple English in classrooms (M=4.21 SD=.891). Participants of the study suggest extensive reading (M=4.30 SD=.990) for the improvement of academic writing the mean values showed the balancing point of their responses on each problem. Standard deviation showed that how much responses deviated from the mean.
Table 6
Mean, SD of responses about problems related to lack of writing skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity to practice academic writing in classroom</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>1.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom writing tasks</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>0.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher as a facilitator</td>
<td>4.61</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific material for academic writing</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extensive reading</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 showed results of the research question that the lack of academic writing in classrooms is a reason of the problems faced by ESL learners, respondents agreed with the concept of importance of writing task in classroom (M= 4.42, SD=0.674). They also focused on the availability of specific and relevant material for the development of academic writing skills. (M= 4.22, SD= 0.860). Extensive reading for the enhancement of vocabulary is also needed.

Findings and Discussion

The result of recent study shows the problems faced by students such as grammar, preposition, Vocabulary, Sentence structures and grammatical errors, the same has been pointed out by Eng, Luyue, and Lim (2020). Students felt that insufficient teaching methods are the cause of these problems. A number of students agreed that guidance and practices of academic writing is necessary to improve their writing skills. Computer programmed such as Endnote use to help pupils to gain these objectives. Student considers teachers use L1 in ESL classes is one of the main causes of their failure in academic writing which is stressed by Gaffas (2019) also. Teachers also have low proficiency in that target language. The students needed that teachers should provide lectures in English language because it increases their writing skills. The administration chooses such a curriculum which enhances their writing abilities.

The eighty-seven percent students were agreed or completely agreed that lack of vocabulary is most common problem among postgraduate students. Another student mentioned vocabulary. This is because a reasonable vocabulary is needed for students to function effectively in their programs. Moreover, the findings of the current study revealed that the students face difficulties in grammar like prepositions, tenses word structure and in syntactical structures. Grammar is extremely important in conveying accurate messages. A large number of respondents agreed that the guidance is important for students in the development of academic writing skills. A significant number of respondents agreed that the students should be given the opportunity to practice academic writing in classroom as they do not get the opportunity to practice academic writing in their classrooms. The informants pointed out that teachers play an important role in improving learners’ academic writing skills.

Conclusion

The study concludes that the main problem which university students” face in academic writing is weak foundation of English language skills. Umar and Noreen (2021a) also asserts that ”students lack basic skills of EL, which ought to be
acquired at primary and middle level. Higher secondary level is not to learn the basics of the language but to master the skills as a lifelong learning” (p.178). Moreover, the findings of the research ascertain that problem in the use of register, poor expression of writing, lack of continuity, frequent grammatical errors, lack of vocabulary, poor syntactical structure, incorrect usage of proposition, difficulty in the usage of correct tenses and spelling errors are some of the major problems which university students’ face in academic writing. The reasons behind the lack of academic writing skills of the students’ include usage of L1 in classrooms, structural and cultural differences of L1 and L2, lack of guidance and practice, assessment system and incompetence of teachers in terms of teaching methodologies. Khan and Khan (2020) also points out the incompetence of language teachers in term of language skills and teaching methodologies especially at primary and middle level in most of the low stature private sector schools. Moreover, Umar and Noreen (2021b) and Alam and Uddin (2013) blame the criteria of assessment and assessment driven teaching and learning practices as one of the major cause of poor language skills of the students’.

Recommendations

The findings of the research recommend that teachers must motivate the students so that they are able to learn the target language. Students should not be allowed to use the L1 in the classroom in order to enhance the ability of their L2. University should revise the syllabus and teachers should guide the students and provide opportunity to practice academic writing in classrooms. Moreover, modern means of assessment should be adopted and teachers should apply various teaching methodologies in classrooms.

Therefore, the researchers recommend that the Universities should introduce ESL learning programs for students to develop their language skills. Teachers should ask the students to practice writing skills in classrooms as well as assignments should be given to enhance the writing practice of the students. Moreover, teachers need to check the work of every student and should must provide feedback individually. This will help in identification of the specific errors which the student makes and will help the teacher to guide that particular student according to its needs. Moreover, Universities should develop the English language curriculum according to the needs of the students and the needs of the ESL classrooms in Pakistani context. The curriculum must focus on all language skills including reading, writing, listening and speaking as only writing skills will not help to develop language skills as language is developed through integrated learning and without extensive reading and extensive practice of listening and speaking students will not be able to develop proficiency in writing. Therefore, teachers must assign extensive reading tasks to the students and should encourage them to listen content in English and communicate in English inside and outside the classrooms. Moreover, teachers need to be trained for teaching English in specific context. Recruitment criteria must be revised and language teachers must be recruited based on their language skills proficiency not on their academic performances. However, along with language skills proficiency, teachers must have appropriate teaching skills and they should use variety of teaching methodologies to engage students’ interest. Universities should encourage the use of audio-visual aids and information technology and must provide the same to help develop language skills of the students.
References


Adams, K., & Keene, M. (2000). Research and writing across the disciplines (2nd Ed.).

Al Murshidi, G. (2014). UAE university male students’ interests impact on reading and writing performance and improvement. English Language Teaching, 7(9), 57.


Primary School Social Studies Curriculum: Comparison of National Curriculum (NC) 2006 and Single National Curriculum (SNC) 2020

Rabia
rabiaslamo65@gmail.com

Dr. Syed Abdul Waheed
Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Studies, University of Okara, Pakistan.
s.a.waheed@uo.edu.pk

Dr. Nadia Gilani
Assistant Professor, Department of Teacher Education, University of Okara, Pakistan.
nadia.gilani@uo.edu.pk

Abstract

From the perspective of globalization and technological advancements, the change in social studies curriculum is deemed important because it provides the necessary knowledge, skills, competencies, and attitude toward the modern world and makes students responsible national and global citizens. This study aims to compare and find the differences between National Curriculum (NC) 2006 and the new Single Nation Curriculum (SNC) 2020 for the grade five Social Studies textbook. Content Analysis was employed to compare both the curricula of social studies. For this purpose, a rubric was developed to analyze the key differences between NC 2006 and SNC 2020 in terms of content, student learning outcomes, suggested activities, information other than textbooks, website links, assessments, and projects. Major findings of the content analysis revealed that information about the struggle of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Allama Iqbal, and other prominent personalities in the creation of Pakistan was not found in the new curriculum. Website links are given at the end of each chapter to integrate the technology in the classroom for further information through different sites.

Keywords: Social Studies, Curriculum, Single National Curriculum, Curriculum Change, National Unity, Primary School, Punjab.

Introduction

Curriculum change becomes important over time because knowledge develops continuously with respect to time as technology is advanced, knowledge is also advanced; students’ needs and interests tend to change according to new technology. There is a huge difference between the past and 21st-century students; the curriculum is also being updated according to teaching methods because classrooms are more child-centered now and flipped and collaborative learning is undertaken. Globalization emerged because of the increased interaction of people and technology throughout the world and thus curriculum reforms also help students to globalize and compete worldwide (Ali, 2021; Yi, 2016).

As a social reformer, a teacher takes the responsibility to add those topics and subjects for the sake of needs of the society and its requirement; the teacher has to implement the curriculum reform in the right direction otherwise it has no importance; the teacher is the personality that knows the ability, interest, and needs of students and develops them
according to society demand in the classroom according to the curriculum. As an evaluator, the teacher evaluates the curriculum reforms according to learners’ needs because a teacher is one of the persons that is more interactive with students (DeCarlo, 2018; Nyamida, 2020).

In the future, students become part of different organizations in their lives (Brugar & Whitlock, 2020) and the curriculum of social studies cannot be neglected because it helps students to socialize and learn the domestic value to live actively in society (Lerch & Buckner, 2018). The social studies curriculum of Pakistan is designed to integrate the civic responsibilities among the young generation, know the value of democracy, and make the students competent in different disciplines to become active citizens in the future and present his beloved country Pakistan like a shining star (Single National Curriculum [SNC], 2020).

The social studies textbook for 5th grade includes six chapters which are Citizenship, History, Government, Economics, Culture, and Geography. The new chapter on citizenship describes how the learners live in the 21st century as global and digital citizens, some new content that is about ancient civilizations (Roman, Gandhara, and Greek) is also added. Commonly used social media is also included which explains how these media are helpful for learners in studying purposes. Some other topics such as entrepreneurship and democratic government are also added. So, the social studies curriculum contributes to the holistic development of learners in all aspects of life that they face in real-life situations.

The purpose of this study is to critically analyze the difference between the old National Curriculum 2006 and the new Single Nation Curriculum (SNC) at the primary level for the selected textbook of social studies for grade 5. The difference between the two different curriculums is sought with respect to seven attributes that are content, student learning outcomes (SLOs), suggested activities, website links, information other than textbook, projects, and assessment.

**Research Questions**

1. What is the difference in the main features of the social studies textbook of grade five in the National Curriculum 2006 and Single National Curriculum 2020?
2. How does the curriculum of social studies of grade five differ in terms of content, student learning outcomes, suggested activities, website links, information other than textbooks, projects, and assessment?
3. How do the differences between the social studies textbook of National Curriculum 2006 and Single National Curriculum 2020 justify the development of SNC?

**Methodology**

The design of this study was content analysis followed by the qualitative research approach. This type of content analysis was relational analysis because the content was critically analyzed in the context of predetermined content (Wilson, 2016) of National Curriculum 2006 and Single Nation Curriculum 2020 of Social Studies. The data source of this research was social studies textbook from 5th grade. Social Studies subject was chosen because this is the study of interaction among people and it inculcates a sense of civic responsibility among the youth to take justified decisions for the public in diverse cultural settings (SNC, 2020).
Content analysis for this research was done with the help of a rubric. These rubrics and other checklists are recommended by content analysis research experts. Consequently, a rubric was developed which has seven components i.e., content, student’s learning outcomes, suggested activities, information from other textbooks, website links, assessment, and project. Under this checklist, a thematic analysis was done and found the major differences between NC 2006 and SNC 2020 social studies textbooks.

Analysis & Results

The objective of the study was to examine the difference between the Single Nation Curriculum (SNC) 2020 and the National Curriculum (NC) 2006 of the social studies textbook of grade 5. The difference in the two curricula was outlined through a content analysis strategy which was used with seven content parameters, student’s learning outcomes, suggested activities, information other than textbook, website links, assessment, and projects. According to these seven parameters, every chapter of the social studies textbook that was similar in both curricula was compared and their similarities and differences were found.

In social studies, there was a total of six chapters in Single Nation Curriculum 2020. One chapter about citizenship is included in Single Nation Curriculum. The rest of the four chapters which were Culture, Geography, History, and Economics were divided into sub-parts and these types of subparts were not present in the previous curriculum. The last chapter titled States and Government is the same in both curricula. Activities and information other than textbooks and projects are different from National Curriculum 2006. Website links were also added in SNC 2020. The assessment procedure is the same in both curricula but asked questions are different, some general knowledge questions are also asked at the end of each chapter as well. The detailed analysis is given in the following table.

Table

Content Analysis of Social Studies Textbook of Grade 5th

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 1: Culture</th>
<th>Comparison of Social Studies Single Nation Curriculum 2020 with Previous National Curriculum 2006</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>In the new SNC 2020, the Culture of Gilgit Baltistan has added as well as means of communication, mass media (newspaper and magazines, radio and televisions, computer, and internet), social media, advantages, and disadvantages of means of communication are also currently added in this chapter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student’s Learning Outcomes</td>
<td>In the new curriculum, learning outcomes are about how minorities celebrate their festivals, their means of communication, and their importance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested activities</td>
<td>Activities that are included are making a class newspaper, creating community messages on social and environmental issues through flashcards, making posters: about the plantation, following traffic rules, don’t waste water, and keeping the environment clean.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Information other than the textbook

In 2020 curriculum gave information about the Arabic language, Balochi Bursi, different Urses, the term global village, art and craft, and information about tappa (type of song).

Website links

At the end of the culture chapter website link is given on causes and solutions of environmental pollution.

Assessment

To think about the social phenomena, thought-provoking questions are included in the new curriculum that is the method of mass communication students used when they contact each other and write some properties (of a student) area where they are from e.g., Punjab, Sindh, Baluchistan, KPK, Kashmir and Gilgit Baltistan.

Project

Projects given in the new curriculum are to sing a folk song in class, celebrate culture day in school, and make posters of social and environmental issues.

Chapter 2:
History

Content

In Single Nation Curriculum 2020, the History chapter is entirely different from the previous curriculum of 2006. The chapter on history is divided into two parts, the first part includes the beginning of human civilization that are Gandhara, Roman, and Greek civilizations and the second part includes historical personalities of Pakistan (Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, Baigun Rahna Liaqat Ali Khan, Baigun Jahan Ara Shahnawaz, and Chaudhary Rehmat Ali) and Influence of provinces in the creation of Pakistan.

Student’s Learning Outcomes

In SNC 2020, the beginning of civilization includes Roman, Greek, and Gandhara civilizations, their timeline, and lifestyle, explain the region’s/province’s contribution and role of Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, Begum Rana Liaqat Ali, Baigum Jahna Ara Shahnawaz in the creation of Pakistan.

Suggested activities

In SNC 2020, all activities have entirely new content: a timeline of Greek, Gandhara, and Roman civilization, identification of the ancient civilizations on the map of the world, finding the Gandhara civilization on the map of Pakistan, and writing an essay on a favorite personality.

Information other than the textbook

In the new curriculum 2020, information is entirely different from the previous curriculum that is about the common era, before the common era, chiton, colosseum, the APS incident that occurred in 2014, All India Muslim League, and Moulana Zafar Ali Khan.

Website links

The website link is given about the ancient civilization of the world.
Assessment

Selected response questions and performance-based questions both are from the given content of the chapter.

Project

Students discuss the different personalities that are important in the creation of Pakistan in groups; make a chart of their discussion and hang out in the classroom. In the second project, students draw a timeline of Greek, Roman, and Gandhara civilizations in different groups on chart paper.

Chapter 3: Geography

Content

The new content that is added in this chapter is the physical topographies of Pakistan, weather and climate, and population.

Student’s Learning Outcomes

The learning outcomes are based on population, weather, and climate, and major landforms in Pakistan are added to the curriculum 2020.

Suggested activities

In new curriculum activities given on weather and climate topics and make a chart paper on global warming and its negative effect on climate, precautionary measurements about floods and earthquakes, celebrate earth day and made a speech on population growth rate and factors affecting overpopulation.

Information other than the textbook

In SNC 2020, information other than a textbook about the geography of Pakistan is about the time of Pakistan, Pamir Kot, global warming and its effect on Karachi city, Hamoon Mushkheil, conventional signs, and information about time (am and pm).

Website links

Website links are available on lines of latitude and longitude, physical features of Pakistan, the weather of Pakistan, and issues related to the increase in population.

Assessment

Extensive questions are newly included in the list of populated and unpopulated countries, making the line and bar graph of temperature and recorded rain respectively, names of the given map in exercise, naming the lines of latitude, and completing the map with the elements of the map.

Project

The projects given in this chapter are about naming the area of Pakistan on the globe with reference to latitude and longitude lines, precautionary measurements of flood and earthquake, earth day, and factors that are responsible for overpopulation.

Chapter 4: Economics

Content

In the recent curriculum 2020, new content is added about public as well as private properties and facilities, consumers and producers, inflation and its types, trade and its importance, means of transportation, entrepreneurship, and its types, and history of money in sub-continent.
**Student's Learning Outcomes**

The learning objectives of curriculum 2020 are about entrepreneurship and its types, “Inflation” and how it affects buying power of people, and the interdependence of consumers and producers on each other.

**Suggested activities**

Activities that are given in Curriculum 2020 are the list of occupations that provide services and activities useful for citizens, compare the present and previous prices of some goods and give some suggestions that how government convinces people to pay taxes.

**Information other than the textbook**

All the information that is given in the new curriculum is different from previous curriculums that are about Dr. Muhammad Amjid Saqib, leather coins, names of state banks of different countries, social entrepreneurship, and the head office of Pakistan railway.

**Website links**

Website links are about transportation means in Pakistan, businessmen, and the evolution of money that is given in the new curriculum.

**Assessment**

In the new curriculum 2020, some questions are added that are: write the currency of different countries, a timeline of the Evolution of Money, three names of import and export and name from where import and export are done, names of important roads, airports, and sea ports and write the detail of successful businessman e.g., his name, name of business, type of business, location of the business (city), name of goods or services he made.

**Project**

Six projects are given in the chapter Economics of Curriculum 2020, these projects are about: the important role of roads, sea ports, and airports in the economy of Pakistan, a list of businesses of those people that are living in your area, making business plan e.g., name of business, resources for business, and prices of goods, make supposed bank in the classroom with the help of chairs and table and students play a different role like a bank manager, cashier, and others, and arrange the tour of students in a museum and see there the coins, currency that was used in the past.

**Chapter 5: State and Government**

**Content**

Content about the formation of a democratic government is added in the new SNC 2020.

**Student’s Learning Outcomes**

In the new curriculum, the formation of democratic government, general elections, development, and functions of political parties and competition, and elections according to policy is added.

**Suggested activities**

Elect the head of your class by democratic method and practically, through this activity students learn democracy in the best way and know the power of the vote.
The Head of the province is elected by the president, names the high courts of different provinces of Pakistan, three constitutions of Pakistan i.e., 1956, 1964, and 1972 and the Rule of Law firstly solved in civil or session court then the high court and last supreme court.

Website link is given on content: government structure of Pakistan, how is it working in Pakistan country.

Selected response questions, constructed response questions that are true or false, extensive questions, and new questions are added, writing the name of three ministries.

Projects are given on the responsibilities of different courts, applying the democracy method in the class, and conducting essay competitions on social issues in SNC 2020.

Findings

This section presents the findings and results of the research study achieved through content analysis under the paradigm of qualitative research. Findings have been consolidated in the above table and clear differences between both curricula are written in the second column as well.

- Single Nation Curriculum 2020 Social Studies textbook includes six chapters of studies that are citizenship, culture, state and government, history, geography, and economics.

- Five chapters Culture, State and Government, History, Geography, and Economics are present in both curricula, and only one new chapter is included in the Single Nation Curriculum 2020 of social studies which is Citizenship.

- In the SNC of social studies in six themes of studies four are divided further but in the previous curriculum, there is no such a division.

- The culture chapter is divided into two parts: the way we live together and the means of communication. In SNC new content about the province of Gilgit Baltistan and means of communication (YouTube, WhatsApp, Imo, Viber, Vimeo, Skype, Facebook, Twitter, and snap chat) are added.

- The history chapter is divided into three parts: ancient human civilizations (Greek, Roman, and Gandhara), historical personalities of Pakistan (Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, Baigum Ranna Liaqat Ali Khan, Begum Jahan Ara Shahnawaz and Chaudhry Rehmat Ali) and role of provinces in the creation of Pakistan.

- The geography chapter is divided into four parts: map and skills, physical features of Pakistan (mountain ranges, plateaus, desert areas, coastal areas), weather and climate, and population.

- The economics chapter is divided into three parts i.e., economics, entrepreneurship, and the evolution of money.
• In the chapter on Citizenship, civic rights, and responsibilities, digital citizens, united nation, freedom of speech, common etiquettes, peace, and harmony are included that was missing in the previous curriculum 2006.

• The latest information is closely related to content and increases the level of interest among the student to learn more about content. All information from other textbooks in SNC 2020 is different from the previous curriculum.

• Website links are available at the end of each chapter to create a thirst for knowledge and make the students learn to use the latest technology to meet the world for research purposes.

• To provoke thinking, projects are also given at the end of the chapter. So, students learn the given content practically, through group discussion, teamwork, simulative learning activities, and the use of different technology in front of the class.

• Student activities are also given at the end and mid of the chapter to create curiosity and attentiveness in learners.

• Assessment is basically through selected response items, constructed response, and performance-based. All the types of assessment are from the given content of the textbook. There are also given some questions that are related to the student’s general knowledge about this world and his own country.

• The color of the Map of Pakistan in the whole textbook is not fully green, different provinces are shown with different colors, and on every map, the area of Jammu and Kashmir is shown disputed area.

• There is no information about Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah and prominent personalities in the creation of Pakistan.

• Single Nation Curriculum of Social Studies 2020 is in Urdu but the previous NC 2006 had both mediums i.e., English and Urdu.

Discussion & Conclusion

The curriculum provides the road map to the educational system; it is important to secure the goals of one’s nation and then transmit them to the next generation. The curriculum gives the content, learning objectives, learning outcomes, and method of teaching according to the given content and according to society’s needs of the modern world (Eller, 2017; Malik & Bhatti, 2022). The curriculum should be reformed because the new knowledge is innovative and hence technology will be progressed and then the culture of the society is changed (Lham, Jurmey, & Tshering, 2020). If the culture of society becomes advanced, the curriculum should be reformed according to society’s demands (Jorgenson et al., 2019).

Single Nation Curriculum 2020, is uniform all over the Pakistan at primary level. The purpose of SNC 2020 is to bring harmony and unity among all nations without any caste or racial system. It provides equal opportunity to acquire education without any disparity. The Social Studies curriculum is important for students to acquire knowledge about civic rights and how to live in a society with a multidimensional system. It also inculcates decision-making power, problem-solving, and critical thinking abilities in the youth. The curriculum of social studies also instructs the love and
belongingness for their community and country, how to present the country at the world forum, and how to take part in the development of the country (SNC, 2020).

The purpose of this study is to make a comparison of social studies in Single Nation Curriculum 2020 and National Curriculum 2006. Areas that were examined to find the difference between the two curricula are content, student learning outcomes, suggested activities, information other than textbooks, website links, assessments, and projects. Through these categories, differences are found between the SNC 2020 and NC 2006 social studies curriculum.

In the social studies curriculum of 5th grade, there is a total of six chapters in Single Nation Curriculum 2020. A chapter on citizenship is included in Single Nation Curriculum. The rest of the four chapters which are Culture, Geography, History, and Economics are divided into sub-parts that were not in the previous curriculum. The last chapter on states and government is the same in both curricula. Activities and information other than textbooks and projects are entirely different from National Curriculum 2006. Website links were also added in SNC 2020. The assessment procedure is the same in both curricula but asked questions are different in both curricula.

There are some implications of the study for the Social Studies curriculum and textbook developers for all provinces. In the social studies curriculum, at the level of 5th grade, students should be aware of the personality and efforts that were done for the creation of Pakistan by Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah. The Map of Pakistan should be shown in complete green color showing the unity and harmony in the nation of Pakistan. Activities given in the Single Nation Curriculum of social studies should be appreciated by the principal and teachers and school principals should set the lecture duration and required material for activities in such a way that all the students perform given activities under the guidance of the teacher. In the Single Nation Curriculum of social studies, projects are given therefore students must do these projects individually or in groups under the guidance of a teacher to learn teamwork and collaborative learning.
References


Wilson, V. (2016). Research methods: Content analysis. Evidence-Based Library and Information Practice, 11(1 (S)), 41-43. https://doi.org/10.18438/B8CGoD


Teachers’ Beliefs and Practices Regarding their Feedback to Students at Elementary Level

Inamulhaq Hashmi
Senior Principal, Department of Elementary & Secondary Education, AJ&K, Pakistan
inamulhaqhashmi98@yahoo.com

Dr. Rahmat Ullah Bhatti
Assistant Professor, Department of Early Childhood Education & Elementary Teacher Education, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan.
rehmat.ullah@aiou.edu.pk

Dr. Muhammad Asghar Ali
Assistant Professor, Department of Education, Women University of AJ&K Bagh, Pakistan
aamasgharali@gmail.com

Abstract
The study aimed to discover the feedback beliefs and practices teachers use to improve their students' learning at elementary level in Tehsil and District Muzaffarabad, AJ&K, Pakistan. Non-probability convenient sampling technique was used, and out of the population of 1012 teachers, the sample size comprised of 170 teachers, when precision level was ±7%, confidence level was 95% and P=0.5. Three dissimilar research tools were set for teachers for data collection. The questionnaire was used to study teachers’ feedback beliefs and oral and written feedback check lists were used to investigate teachers’ actual feedback practices. Statistical tests of Mean, Standard Deviation, t-Test Independent Sampling and One-Way ANOVA were used for data analysis. With varying degrees of agreement, majority of teachers held satisfactory beliefs regarding types, purposes and other related aspects of feedback. Contrarily, teachers’ actual oral and written feedback practices were quite unsatisfactory. Multitier educational management was recommended to establish systematic mechanisms of promoting and monitoring teachers’ pedagogical skills.

Key Words: Feedback, Task Based Feedback, Process Based Feedback, Self-Regulation Based Feedback, Self & Peer Feedback

Introduction
Teachers’ feedback is a systematic phenomenon with valuable implications in improving the learning quality. Teacher’s feedback bridges the gap between students achieved and desired learning intents. Feedback is primarily linked with while-teaching interaction between learner and teacher with the purpose of learner’s improvement (Black & William, 2010). Feedback is a pedagogical framework of assessment with the purpose of promoting learning, instead of gauging learning, and it keeps teaching practices aligned with the students’ learning needs (Black, et.al. 2004). Teacher’s feedback is an intervention at a learning point where the learner has arrived, as sorted out by the assessment, for his future learning. Teacher’s assessment data shows the point where students fall, from where teacher’s feedback enables students move forward (McFadden, 2015).
Hattie and Timperley (2007) defined feedback as the facts and evidences provided by an instructor, related to the various aspects of the learner’s performance. Voerman et al. (2012) referred feedback as the data provided by a tutor to a learner with reference to certain learning objectives with the purpose of his learning improvement. Quality feedback almost doubles the average student’s growth during an academic year (Hattie and Timperley, 2007). William (2010) reported that teacher’s feedback accelerates the students’ learning by 50%. A teaching toolkit places quality feedback central to increase students’ learning by additional eight months over a year (William, 2010). According to Black and William (2010), studies proved that better quality-ongoing feedback enables the low achievers to achieve more than the rest and reduces the gap between the high and the lower achievers. Teachers need to incorporate feedback practices in their instructional practices for addressing students’ learning needs (Par and Timperley, 2010).

According to Shute (2008), formative teaching feedback can indicate a gap between a learner’s present and desired levels of achievement, as shown in the following figure:

![Feedback process]

Adapted from Voerman et al. (2012)

Teacher’s feedback provides him with a means to improve his own instruction, and an opportunity to correct his students’ errors (Akkuzu, 2014).

Educational feedback phenomenon is reasoned from the theory of behaviorism that expects a teacher to bring about an observable and desirable change in his students’ behavior. Behaviorists claim that there exists a connection between an agent or stimulus and an outcome or response. Application of Thorndike’s famous law of effect can be seen when correct and true feedback remarks of teacher show a desirable change in behavior of children. Teachers feedback delivered before, during or after instruction, performs the role of stimulus. Behavior of a student can be manipulated by using positive and constructive feedback as stimulus. Reward and praise are stimuli to the correct response of a learner that strengthen his newly learnt behavior, whereas punishment stops him from showing undesirable behavior. Thus, feedback procedures operate in a straight and linear course and certain outcome follow as a result (Thurlings, M. et.al. 2013).

![Linearity of Feedback]

Cognitivism focuses on learners’ cognitive processing of information. Teacher’s feedback works in the fashion advocated by cognitivism when its content is processed, decoded and used by students. Teachers provide feedback to students which they vigorously process to decipher and interpret new curriculum. According to the cognitivism,
delivery and use of feedback is a linear process in which teacher provides guidelines and students process them leading to achievement of the learning outcomes.

**Linear Process of Feedback**

Feedback —> Receiver —> Learning Outcome

Adapted from Thurlings, M. et al. (2013)

Cognitive processing of teacher’s feedback firstly indicates a gap between a student’s current and desired level of achievement, secondly it reduces his cognitive burden of a complex problem-solving task, and thirdly it enables him modify his unfitting task, schemes, tactics, operational mistakes and mistaken beliefs (Shute, 2008). Teacher-students dialogue is an act of social interaction. Student’s learning takes place in the zone of proximal development (ZPD) by a more knowledgeable other (teacher in teaching context). Educational talk between teachers and students is, thus an application of social cultural theory also. Theory of social constructivism works when learners use their prior knowledge as starting point to build new knowledge. During the construction of new knowledge and skills, teachers’ and peers’ feedback play significant role in maintaining true dimensions and logical hierarchy of knowledge (Shute, 2008 & Thurlings, M. et. al., 2013). Teachers’ feedback activates the process of metacognition, because it targets students’ self-regulation (Hattie and Timperley, 2007). Teacher’s feedback provides students a means to think about their own thinking, and to constructively adjust their method in future work (Taraban, 2014). Process of self-regulation is reasoned from behaviorism, cognitivism, meta-cognitivism and constructivism (Schunk, 2012).

This study used two well-referenced models devised by Hattie and Timperley (2007), and Black and Wiliam (2010). These researchers described that purpose of effective feedback is to provide answers of the three basic questions, i.e. “Where am I going?” related to the goal of giving or receiving feedback, “How am I going?” related to the progress being made to achieve the learning goals, “Where to next?” related to the type of activities taken up for better achievement. These models address these three questions which shape the teachers’ feedback knowledge and practices in dimensions of ‘feed-up, feed-back and feed-forward’ respectively. Each question specifies a particular type of feedback. Addressing to these questions, feedback researches endorsed four levels (types) of teachers’ feedback: a. task based feedback: corrective in nature and most frequently used to describe how well a task is done; b. process based feedback: specific to the process underlying the learning task; c. self-regulation based feedback: deals with the way students monitor, direct, and regulate their learning actions; d. feedback about self as a person: positive or negative and is frequently used. Process based and self-regulation-based feedback interventions are powerful, task-based feedback is useful, whereas feedback about self as a person is ineffective for learning (Hattie & Timperley, 2007). Both the models claimed that the objective of feedback is to arrive at the changes in learning so that students achieve the desired goals.

Irving, et.al. (2011) worked with a teachers’ focus group to study their feedback beliefs and practices. Data of discussion with teachers about definition, purpose and personal response was divided into feedback on learning, feedback on behavior, and grades and marks. Teachers’ perspectives of feedback purposes were categorized as: a. feedback for encouragement, improvement, reporting and compliance, and b. for no purpose (as providing comments with grades, students focused solely on the grades; thus, making feedback comments irrelevant).
Hattie (2000, 2007) claimed that feedback about self as a person is the most frequently used practice, but is less effective. Teacher's praise of student's attainment has effect size 0.12. Task based feedback informs about learner's correct or incorrect answer, and helps him obtain more or different knowledge. The most usual feedback practices are those which combine both task-level and self-level feedback comments. Such mixed feedback comments weaken the power of feedback. Extensive amount of task related feedback makes students unable to guess the rotation by sequential developments. Therefore, extensive task-based feedback makes students focus only on the instant target rather than the tactics and procedures to attain the cumulative target. Task level feedback delivered to a whole group may confuse students because they find it difficult to decide whether it has been delivered to a particular student or the whole group. Process based feedback practices specifically focus on the process involved in performing a task. Such feedback practices are based on targeting students' perceptions, and their environment, and developing relationship between their personal beliefs, knowledge and their working environment. Task related feedback practices are concerned about surface understanding, i.e. acquiring, storing, reproducing and using new information. Process based feedback practices focus on deep understanding, i.e. constructing new knowledge and relationships, and cognitively processing and converting in to complex or untested tasks, setting new goals and modeling a learning task strategy. However, there exists a powerful interaction between task related feedback aimed at mere achieving the task and process related feedback aimed at strategizing the process of achieving the task. The focus and purpose of process level feedback provides learners information about relationships among ideas and strategies they need to use for error detection, learning from errors and cues regarding various strategies and errors.

Self-regulation feedback practices develop in students the capability and autonomy of creating ideas, beliefs, concepts, feelings and actions on their own to plan and adjust to achieve targets; and lead to seek, accept and accommodate feedback information. They point towards self-sufficiency, self-control, self-direction, and self-discipline. Six major features of self-regulation feedback practices are the ability to generate internal feedback and to self-evaluate; to develop readiness to spend effort into searching of and dealing with feedback information; to achieve the level of confidence in accuracy of the reaction, to gain attributions about success or failure; and to arrive at the degree of ability at seeking help (Zimmerman 2000). Such feedback plays its role as an inherent catalyst during learning activities. The students use internal feedback mechanism by applying checks and monitors on their progress to regulate their tasks. Such feedback defines the nature of products and the features of the intellectual progressions (Osuala, et. al. 2018).

Peer-and self-feedback practices inspire students to recognize their learning targets and understand the standards used to evaluate their effort which in turn engages them in self-regulation. Students; a decisive source of such feedback, gain their continuous and immediate contact with their own points of view, actions and practices (Andrade & Heidi, 2010). Irving (2008) stated that the interpersonal relationship, and psychological and emotional attachment and trust are the factors that make peer-feedback productive and effective. Constructive interpersonal relationships between peers make environment suitable for working. Self-feedback depends upon the psychological issues related to self-disclosure and confidence. Peers need to be self-disclosing, confident and trusting in order to play the role of assessor.

Studies have provided different views about the timing of giving feedback. Task based feedback practices involving immediate error correction make acquisition rate faster, but task and the process-based feedback can divert the
students’ attention away from the task during fluency of its building. They, therefore, badly affect the process of getting automaticity and the related strategies of learning. Delay in task-based feedback, for example, in the situations of testing is beneficial, whereas immediate process-based feedback, for example, during the process of conducting classroom activities is beneficial. Task based feedback is powerful if it is delivered immediately and process-based feedback is beneficial when delivered with delay (Clariana, et. al. 2000). Wiggins (2012) and Brookhart (2008) advocated providing feedback when students’ efforts and their effects are alive in their minds. Feedback delayed for several days after students had completed their assignment would lose its effectiveness. Studies endorsed that feedback should come to the students when they are still thinking about their task and making efforts to solve their problems.

Shute (2008) recommended that effective feedback comments should: (a) focus on the task, not on the learner; (b) be elaborated, i.e. describing what, how and why it is required by the learner; (c) avoid from cognitive load, (d) be manageable in terms of brevity, specificity, clarity, simplicity; (e) lessen uncertainty between progress and objectives to assist learners to find where they have reached relative to the success benchmark; (f) be fair, objective, written, verbal or via computer; (g) encourage a learning goal orientation, i.e. it should transfer attention from performance to the learning; (h) prepare teachers and peers welcome errors and avoid reactivity towards making mistakes to expose them; and (i) give learners opportunity of self-regulation and critical thinking.

Rationale of Study

Teaching quality at elementary level in public sector in AJ&K had been questioned by several studies. Farooq & Kai (2016) and Shabbir, et. al. (2014) discovered that public sector elementary teachers are unable to solve students’ learning problems and manage their behavior. Deficit of parents’ trust is a reason of low enrolment in public sector schools. Hence, to identify the areas of weaknesses in elementary teachers’ teaching skills, educational feedback beliefs and practices of teachers were analyzed in this study. The correspondences and discrepancies between the teachers’ feedback knowledge and practices were discovered.

Significance of Study

This study aimed to identify elementary teachers’ incapacities in their feedback beliefs and practices in public sector schools of Muzaffarabad, AJ&K. Such weaknesses make the teachers’ pedagogical practices ineffective which ultimately add to the poor-quality elementary education. Findings of this study provided evidence to affect change in elementary teachers’ application of educational feedback to make their teaching strategically effective. It has potential to draw attention of school leadership, educational management and policy makers to initiate professional development plans to address the pedagogical incapacities of teachers.

Objectives of Study

1. To explore the elementary teachers’ beliefs of feedback in educational setting.
2. To identify feedback practices used by elementary teachers.
3. To find out feedback beliefs and practices of teachers working at elementary level with respect to demographic variables.
Conceptual Framework

This research used an existing Teachers' Conceptions of Feedback (TCoF) questionnaire devised by Brown, Harris and Harnett, (2012). Based on the work provided by Hattie and Timperley (2007) and Irving, Harris, and Peterson (2011), Brown et al. (2012) drafted items related to ten feedback constructs for their survey questionnaire. Four factors were related to the purposes of feedback, i.e. irrelevance, improvement, reporting & compliance, encouragement. Four factors were related to the types of feedback bases, i.e. task, process, self-regulation and self. Two factors were constructed on the basis of questions posed in literature i.e. about validity of self and peer feedback and timing of feedback. The TCoF consisted of 37 items of six-point, positively-packed agreement Likert rating scale. Brown et al. (2012) perceived four factors related to feedback practices during cluster analysis of teachers’ feedback beliefs. These practices were grouped as Non-teacher Feedback, Teacher’s Formative Feedback, Teacher's Protective Evaluative Feedback and Parents Reporting Feedback. The researchers found that teachers’ improvement factor predicted teachers’ formative feedback factor, peer & self-feedback belief factor predicted non-teacher feedback factor, and encouragement factor predicted protective evaluative feedback factor, and parents reporting factor predicted reporting and compliance factor. In this study, the researcher used an additional factor of irrelevance to study the cases where teacher does not write any comment or only signs on written work or does not assesses it.
Teachers' Beliefs and Practices Regarding their Feedback to Students at Elementary Level

Conceptual Framework Of Oral FB

Belief factor

Practice factor

Beliefs

- Improvement
- Parents Reporting
- Encouragement
- Peer & Self Feedback

Practices

- Formative Feedback
- Reporting & Compliance Feedback
- Protective Evaluation Feedback
- Non Teacher Feedback

Conceptual Framework Of Written FB

Belief factor

Practice factor

Beliefs

- Improvement
- Parents Reporting
- Irrelevance
- Encouragement
- Peer & Self Feedback

Practices

- Formative Feedback
- Reporting & Compliance Feedback
- No Feedback
- Protective Evaluation Feedback
- Non Teacher Feedback

- Formative Feedback
- Reporting & Compliance Feedback
- Protective Evaluation Feedback
- Non Teacher Feedback
Methodology

This study was based on descriptive and quantitative paradigm. Population comprised of 1012 teachers (male and female), whereas 170 teachers were sampled using non-probabilistic convenient technique. The researcher visited schools and spent time with teachers administering the questionnaire and observation checklists. The survey questionnaire consisted of 37 items. Oral feedback observation checklist consisted of 18 items and written feedback practices observation checklist consisted of 22 items.

Results

Data was categorized into teachers’ feedback beliefs, teachers’ oral and written feedback practices. Data related to teachers’ responses (N=170) confirmed the following results of their feedback beliefs and practices.

Table: 1: Responses on items related to feedback for improvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students use the feedback I give them to improve their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can see progress in student work after I give feedback to students.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.77</td>
<td>1.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students use comments I give them to revise their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.82</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving students feedback is important because it helps them learn.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>5.29</td>
<td>1.16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 4.69 to 5.29 and SD ≤ 1.31 show that teachers believe that their feedback improves their students’ performance.

Table: 2: Responses on items related to feedback for accountability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents can tell how well their child is learning from my feedback.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At my school, teachers are expected to give both spoken and written feedback to students.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>1.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback practices at my school are monitored by school leaders.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.49</td>
<td>1.48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 4.49 to 4.70, and SD ≤ 1.48) indicate that teachers are responsible to provide students proper teaching feedback.

Table: 3: Responses on items related to feedback is irrelevant

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Feedback is pointless because students ignore my comments and directions.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>1.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students rarely make changes in their work in response to my feedback.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>1.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I seldom give written feedback because students throw it away.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time spent on giving feedback is wasted effort.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>1.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value =2.16 to 2.85 and SD ≤ 1.75) show that majority of teachers think that their feedback is relevant to improve learning.
Table: 4: Responses on items related to feedback for praise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The point of feedback is to make students feel good about themselves.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The goal in giving feedback is to protect and enhance the student’s self-esteem.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good feedback praises students.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>1.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback should be full of encouraging and positive comments.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers should always include praise in their feedback about student work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.64</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My feedback includes comments on the effort students put into their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>1.27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 3.77 to 5.00 and SD ≤ 1.66 indicate that teachers think the purpose of their feedback is to praise students.

Table: 5: Responses on items related to task based feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My comments help students create the kind of work I expect from them.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.74</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My feedback is specific and tells students what to change their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.72</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My feedback helps students decide what to include and/or exclude in their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>1.37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 4.71 to 4.74 and SD ≤ 1.37 reveal that teachers support task-based feedback.

Table: 6: Responses on items related to process-based feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I give students opportunities to respond to my feedback.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>1.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In feedback, I describe students work to stimulate discussion about how it could improve.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.68</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback is a two-way process between my students and me.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>1.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I organize time in class for students to revise, evaluate, and give themselves feedback about their own individual work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean=4.35 to 4.98 and SD ≤ 1.39 indicate that teachers think moderately in favor of giving process-based feedback.

Table: 7: Responses on items related to self-regulation-based feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I encourage students to correct/revise their own work without my prompting.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>1.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback is about helping students evaluate their own work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>1.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My feedback reminds each student to self-assess his or her own work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.48</td>
<td>1.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My students generate ideas about improving their learning independent of me.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My students analyze their own work with little direction from me.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>1.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 3.51 to 4.69 and SD ≤ 1.61 show that teachers’ majority strongly favor self-regulation based feedback.
Table: 8 Responses on items related to usefulness of peer and self-feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students are able to provide accurate and useful feedback to each other and themselves.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.99</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students can be critical of their own work and can find their own mistakes.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>1.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peers are the best source of feedback</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>1.40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 3.99 to 4.24 and SD ≤ 1.49 discovered that teachers think peer and self-feedback as useful for learning.

Table: 9: Responses on items related to timeliness of feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I aim to deliver feedback to students within a few days of receiving their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.45</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback that takes more than a week to get to the students is useless.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students should not have to wait for feedback.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>1.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I give students feedback immediately after they finish.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>4.55</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality feedback happens interactively and immediately in the classroom while students are learning.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>5.03</td>
<td>1.14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean value = 2.54 to 5.03 and SD ≤ 1.69 revealed that teachers’ majority is confident that feedback should be delivered in time.

Table 10: Oral Feedback Practices related to formative feedback for improvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher gives instant response to students’ work in class.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher only says that students’ work is incorrect or correct.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher gives correct answer when students are incorrect.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher provides hints to students to correct their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher talks about quality of students’ work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks students to revise/correct their answer themselves.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks students to comment how to improve their learning.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher helps students infer the correct information.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>.27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.04 to 3.04) and (SD≤ 1.13) showed that teachers do not provide formative oral feedback for students' improvement.

Table 11: Oral Feedback Practice related to feedback for parents reporting and compliance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher calls the parents about students’ progress.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher arranges meeting with parents about students’ progress.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.65</td>
<td>.89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.36 to 1.65) and (SD≤ 0.89) indicated that teachers do not orally communicate to the parents about their child’s progress.
Table 12: Oral Feedback Practice related to protective evaluation feedback for encouragement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher gives positive comments with smiley face on students’ work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.29</td>
<td>.817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher praises/appreciates students on their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher displays students’ good work before class.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher pastes a sticker on student’s face or asks to clap on his work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>.32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.12 to 3.61) and (SD ≤ 0.817) discovered that teachers do not deliver positive comments but rarely appreciate the students, hence they do not provide protective evaluation feedback to students.

Table 13: Oral Feedback Practice related to non-teacher feedback for peer and self-feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks other students to comment on a student’s work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks students to check other’s work and give comments.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks students to give comment on their own work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher involves parents give feedback to their children.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.00 to 1.20) and (SD ≤ 0.59) indicated that teachers never provide opportunities of peer and self-feedback.

Table 14: Written Feedback Practice related to formative feedback for improvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes comments immediately on notebook.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>3.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher only underlines mistakes.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.68</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher underlines and corrects mistakes.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes hints, reminders to correct.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes about quality of work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes to revise or correct work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher discusses with students about their work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>.51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.18 to 2.85) and (SD ≤ 3.32) proved that teachers only sometimes write comments on notebooks but never give task, process or self-regulation-based feedback to the written works.

Table 15: Written Feedback Practices related to feedback for parents reporting & compliance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes comments for parents about work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes reports of student’s performance.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>.61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.33 to 1.35) and (SD ≤ 0.64) discovered that teachers do not communicate to the parents about their child’s progress in writing.
Table 16: Written Feedback Practices related to protective evaluation feedback for encouragement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes grades or marks on students’ work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher ticks or crosses work with comments.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>1.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher pastes stickers or stars on students’ work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher displays good work before class.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes ‘very good, excellent’ etc.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes correct answer if student mistakes.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>.67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.17 to 2.19) and (SD≤ 1.34) showed that teachers do not use protective evaluation written feedback practices, but mostly tick or cross without correcting the written work.

Table 17: Written Feedback Practices related to non-teacher feedback for peer and self-feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher asks other students to check the written work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes for student to assess his work himself.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes for parents to check child’s work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to table 17, Mean values (1.00 to 1.01) and (SD≤ 0.08) indicated that teachers never give written instructions to students to engage them in peer or self-based feedback.

Table 18: Written Feedback Practice related to no feedback for irrelevance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher seldom writes comments on homework.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher writes ‘seen’ or signs mostly on homework.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>1.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher does not assess the written work.</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean values (1.00 to 1.57) and (SD≤ 1.60) indicated that teachers almost always check the written work.

Table 19: Feedback Beliefs with respect to gender (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beliefs of Teachers</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.065</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>.948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=4.24, SD=0.58 and M=4.25, SD=0.52, t (168) =0.065, P >.05 discovered that teachers of both the genders have the same belief regarding feedback.
Table 20: Feedback Beliefs with respect to Employment Mode (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Employment Mode</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers Feedback Beliefs</td>
<td>NTS</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-NTS</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=4.33, SD=0.45 and M=4.21, SD=0.59, t (168) =1.32, P >.05 indicated both NTS and Non NTS teachers have the same belief regarding feedback.

Table 21: Feedback Beliefs with respect to age groups (One Way ANOVA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Age Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>F value</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers Feedback Beliefs</td>
<td>18-30 years</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.281</td>
<td>.755</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31-40 years</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td></td>
<td>.281</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 40 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>4.28</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>167</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=4.26, SD=0.53, M=4.21, SD=0.58 and M=4.28, SD=0.53, F (2, 167) = .281, P >.05 indicated teachers of all age groups had the same concept of feedback.

Table No 4.22: Oral Feedback Practices with respect to gender (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral Practices of Teachers Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>.18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=1.60, SD=0.14, M=1.66 and SD=0.18, t (168) = 2.28, P < .05 discovered that both male and female teachers use the same oral feedback practices.

Table 23: Oral Feedback Practices with respect to employment mode (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Employment Mode</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral Practices of Teachers Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>NTS</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>1.58</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-NTS</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=1.58, SD=0.14, M=1.66 and SD=0.17, t (168) = 3.01, P < .05 showed that both NTS and non NTS based teachers use the same oral feedback practices.
Teachers' Beliefs and Practices Regarding their Feedback to Students at Elementary Level

Table 24: Oral Feedback Practices with respect to age group (One Way ANOVA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Age Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>F value</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral Practices of Teachers</td>
<td>18-30 years</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>31-40 years</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>.137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 40 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=1.59, SD=0.17, M=1.62, SD=0.16 and M=1.66 SD=0.16 F (2, 167) = 2.01, P > .05 showed that teachers of all age groups use the same oral feedback practices.

Table 25: Written Feedback Practices with respect to gender (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written Practices of Teachers</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>-537</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>.592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=1.48, SD=0.26, M=1.51 and SD=0.36, t (168) = -537, P > .05 showed that teachers of both the genders use the same written feedback practices.

Table 26: Written Feedback Practices with respect to employment mode (t-Test Independent Sample)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Employment Mode</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written Practices of Teachers</td>
<td>NTS</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>2.188</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>.030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>Non-NTS</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values of M=1.57, SD=0.27, M=1.46 and SD=0.33, t (168) = 2.188, P < .05 showed no significant difference in written feedback practices of NTS and non-NTS based teachers.

Table 27: Written Feedback Practices with respect to age group (One Way ANOVA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Age Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>F value</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written Practices of Teachers</td>
<td>18-30 years</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regarding Feedback</td>
<td>31-40 years</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>2.890</td>
<td>.058</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Values of $M=1.62$, $SD=0.28$, $M=1.50$, $SD=0.27$, and $M=1.45$, $SD=0.36$, $F(2, 167) = 2.890$, $P > .05$ revealed that written feedback practices of teachers of all age groups are the same.

### Discussion

Study revealed that majority of teachers possessed well defined and firm beliefs regarding purposes, types and other aspects of teachers’ educational feedback. They hold positive belief towards feedback timeliness; significance and relevance of task, process, self-regulation, and peer and self-based educational feedback for students’ improved learning. No significant difference between feedback beliefs of teachers was found with respect to their demography. These views of teachers related to feedback beliefs are supported by the studies of Hattie and Timperley (2007), Shute (2008), Andrade & Heidi (2010), Irving, et.al. (2011), Brown, et.al. (2012), and several meta-analyses. However, a negative relationship was exposed between the teachers’ feedback beliefs and their actual oral and written feedback practices. It was revealed that their oral and written feedback practices in classroom were either non-existent or nominal and much poor. They were found in difficulty while providing oral feedback to students, a clear evidence of their poor feedback delivery skills. Such a discrepancy between their feedback beliefs and practices is not supported by any research study.

### Conclusion and Implication

Our educational system does not address teachers’ inability to provide proper and timely educational feedback. Teaching methods and techniques used in classrooms lack feedback practices. Monitoring of the teaching activities does not pay attention to the aspect of proper educational feedback. As a result, children do not participate actively and cannot achieve the desired goals of learning and all creative and imaginative abilities are going waste. This situation should no longer be prevailed. Therefore, we have to redesign our teaching skills schools to make them favorable for children; otherwise we cannot provide quality education.

### Recommendations

Keeping in view the results, conclusions and discussions, following were the recommendations for future:

1. Teachers need to modify and adjust their teaching methods and stitch effective feedback with them to bridge their students’ learning gaps.
2. Educational management, curriculum designers, textbooks developers and teacher trainers need to revise teacher need based induction policies, develop pedagogy focused learning materials, plan and implement need-based teachers training plans, and qualitatively evaluate teaching performance, respectively.
3. This study can be taken as basis for studying the instructional monitoring system in AJ&K.
4. Future researchers can move forward for exploring the effective ways of promoting quality of teaching in AJ&K.
References


McFadzien, N. (2015). Why is effective feedback so critical in teaching and learning?


The attitudinal analysis of speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi at United Nation

Asia Shahmir  
MPhil Scholar, Dept. of English,  
Air University Islamabad  
asiashahmir123@gmail.com

Sajjad Rasool  
Visiting Lecturer, Dept. of Linguistics and Social Sciences,  
The Begum Nusrat Bhutto Women University Sukkur  
sajjadrasoolghumro@gmail.com

Dr. Sadia Irshad  
Assistant Professor, Dept of English,  
Air University Islamabad  
sadia.irshad@mail.au.edu.pk

Abstract

The paper investigates the attitudinal resources of speeches delivered at UNO during the Israel-Palestine Conflict. The study aims to investigate the use of interpersonal functions in speeches and how language resources are used to organise affect, judgment, and appreciation. In these circumstances, the language used by politicians and public figures played a significant role in highlighting the issue and influencing the audience. In total, two speeches were taken that were delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi at the United Nations in 2014 and 2021, respectively. The qualitative method was used in this study, and the appraisal theory by Martin and White (2005) was applied to selected speeches. Findings show that appreciation and affect are mostly used by both speakers, and the least used resource was judgment, as the main aim of speeches was to highlight the ongoing incident. This shows that various resources are used by speakers to convey attitudes and negotiate relationships.

Keywords: Attitudinal resources, Appraisal theory, Systematic Functional Linguistics, Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi’s speeches

Introduction

Public speaking is the act of delivering a speech to an audience to change attitudes, behaviors, and feelings and to inspire or impress people with words. It is also viewed as a means by which meaningful interpretations are put together in certain situations or settings (Martin, 2020). A communicative tool that allows the speaker to interact with the masses through the appropriate use of language (Ananda et al., 2018). In a nutshell, public speaking is a form of communication between an audience and a speaker that can be formal or informal. The speech demonstrates the speaker’s ability to influence the audience. It also shows how the speaker uses language to communicate his goals and thoughts. Moreover, a function of
language indicates the speaker’s intention towards any objects or events. According to Faraz et al. (2018), speeches are the form of public speaking through which one can interact, gain public favor, make a commitment or promise, etc. These are also used to influence or persuade the masses and also to make-believe in them. However, Novi et al. (2019) state that persuasive speeches are those that influence the audience. The function of these types of speeches is to make the audience think about certain issues and also what actions are needed to resolve them. The same phenomena are usually adopted by public and political figures to achieve their goals and also make the masses believe in them. As a result, politicians and other public figures also use a wide range of techniques and tactics to get their message across to the public by using powerful words in speeches or debates. So, this paper tries to explore the political speeches and contrastively analyses Noam Chomsky’s political speech and Shah Mahmood Qureshi’s speech delivered at United Nation in 2014 and 2021 respectively. So, the present study aims to investigate how to explore the attitudinal resources used in speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi. This study also tries to examine Noam Chomsky and Qureshi’s opinion of Israel’s actions. Therefore, appraisal theory, which is part of interpersonal metafunction, is suitable to explore, describe, and explain the way language is used to maintain an interpersonal relationship, adopt a stance, and evaluate and construct textual personas. This theory is a significant advancement within the framework of Systemic Functional Linguistics as it provides a new theoretical perspective at the lexical level, not only at the clause level. The Appraisal System examines the speaker’s or writer’s use of appraisal tools to express, show attitudes, and emotions, persuade audiences, influence their views, and negotiate relationships. So, this system suits well for the present research to study attitudinal resources obtained in the speeches of Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi.

This study is significant in several ways, as it incorporates Systemic functional grammar. It will contribute to the area of appraisal; through which we can see the language resources used by political or public figures to highlight their attitude toward certain events or objects. An evaluation analysis is conducted to show that assessment plays a role in the social context description of language function. The analysis shows how words are utilized to engage the audience. Moreover, the current study will be helpful to understand how speakers usually convey their attitudes toward objects and ongoing events that are happening in the world. As appraisal theory is a significant advancement within the framework of systemic functional linguistics, this study will help novice researchers fully understand and apply this theory to different datasets. This study will also be very beneficial to the researchers because it will point them in the right direction when applying appraisal theory to interpersonal language analysis.

**Literature review**

Systematic Functional Linguistics is the type of grammar that looks at the systematization of any text, either written or spoken. It usually tries to find the reasons and purpose of writing and speech as it focuses on the functions of the language. Through metafunction analysis of the language in use, SFL reveals through the peculiarities, distinctiveness, and selection of the words. Furthermore, language acts as an interpersonal function because speakers or writers use language to interact with other people (Halliday, 1971). Interpersonal metafunctions give way to other theories, like appraisal theory. As appraisal is a central part of the meaning of any text. SFL’s appraisal theory is also used to look at how words are used in a text and how the writer or speaker uses linguistic tools to show their feelings about things or events. Thus, the interpersonal function is the function of participation in language. It sets up the relationship between the speaker/writer and the listener/hearer (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). The main focus of appraisal is on how people
express emotions or feelings, persuade the people they're trying to get to like or agree with them, convey attitudes, shape opinions, and negotiate relationships. According to Martin and White (2005), "Attitude is about how we feel, including our emotional reactions, judgments of behavior, and how we think about things" (p.35).

Several studies have been conducted on attitudinal appraisals by different researchers. One such study was conducted by Ailan (2017). The study focuses on Barack Obama’s victory speech and was conducted by applying the appraisal theory. The researcher found that various attitudinal resources such as affect, judgment, and appreciation are used in the speech to support Obama’s policies, ambitions, plans, and viewpoints. Furthermore, affective resources in speech were higher than in appreciation and judgments. This shows that in this speech, Obama’s major concern was the future of the country, despite challenges and difficulties. He simply wants to rebuild public confidence by highlighting his plans. Apart from this, appreciation resources were used as the presidents emphasized the importance of the election campaign and the power of democracy. When, on the other hand, judgments were used to back up the very goal of promoting democracy, peace, equality, and prosperity.

Another study was conducted by Novi et al. (2019) to investigate the evaluative stance presented in the campaign speeches of Donald Trump and Hillary Clinton that they delivered during the campaign for the presidential election in the United States in 2016. By applying the appraisal framework by Martin and White (2005), their focus is usually on the engagement resources utilized by the speakers in their campaign speeches. They found out that the use of disclaimers was more prominent than other resources of engagement. As Trump utilizes disclaim to make promises, and pledges, and also deliver his political agenda, Hillary’s speech shows her efforts and also counter-strikes all the problems she dealt with.

Sangka (2017) studied the attitudinal resources used in the Michelle Obama speech toward presidential candidates. She found that Michelle Obama used a total of 97 attitude devices in her speech. The most common devices that are used by the speaker are judgments, and the least common resources are affects. Michele Obama gave priority to Hilary Clinton by using positive judgments, and she also thinks that Clinton is more capable than Trump of being the president of the United State of America. Moreover, she shows her negative attitude towards Trump by using negative judgement and appreciation. The study concluded that every speaker has a different attitude towards people or events. Another study on a similar pattern was conducted by Zhang and Pei (2018), in which the object of the study was Jinping’s and Trump’s political speeches delivered at the World Economic Forum in the years 2017 and 2018 respectively. After applying appraisal theory to those speeches, the researchers found how political figures express ideology in their speeches, how they utilize language resources to coordinate emotions, opinions, and appreciation, and also how they analyse the joint formation of language and power through speeches. Such use of attitudinal resources helps listeners or readers understand text in a more efficient way.

The study carried out by Aljuraywi and Alyousef (2022) explored the evaluative language presented in political interviews given by Donald Trump, Joe Biden, Leslie Stahl, and Norah O’Donnell by using Martin and White’s 2005 appraisal framework. The study shows that Trump and Stahl use more attitudinal resources of affect, whereas Biden and O’Donnell use more attitudinal resources of appreciation. The analysis also revealed a link between the four participants’ political stances and ideologies during the interviews and the attitudinal resources they used. Finally, the findings show that the attitude exchange between the interviewer and interviewee had a significant impact on the overall tone of the interviews.
Another study was conducted by Abubakar (2023) on President Muhammadu Buhari’s and former President Goodluck Ebele Jonathan’s speeches delivered during the 2015 presidential election in Nigeria. A study shows that both speakers address issues related to economic, political, and social issues. Whereas by using the assessment tools of engagement, evaluation, and denial, they try to attain different communicative goals. Jonathan used capability, disclaimer, and denial, whereas Buhari used appraisal resources of concur, proclaim, distance, and hearsay to pique the interest of their target readers. They both used adverbs to describe problems and verbs to talk about problems that were either present or past.

Researchers, apart from political discourse, also conducted studies by applying appraisal theory to different discourses, as it also reveals interpersonal meaning in the different genres and discourses. Setyaningsih and Larassati (2019) applied appraisal theory to students’ reviews of their previous semester’s grammar course. Whereas, Jing and Lihuan (2021) explore the use of attitude language resources in English news reports on COVID-19 published on the official website of China daily. Another appraisal study conducted by Iswara (2016) was on the commentary on Ernest Hemingway’s novel "A Farewell to Arms." The result shows that positive appreciation is present as it is about the novel being reviewed, and it tells readers that this novel is worth reading. Thus, appraisal theory is not just applicable to speeches or spoken data, but one can also analyse different genres, as in this research, the novel commentary was taken as data. Furthermore, words are used by speakers or writers, and their main concern is to engage the listener or reader with the purpose of that text or speech.

So, keeping in view the research cited in the literature review section, many studies have been conducted on the use of appraisal theory in debates and speeches delivered by different political leaders, but little work has been done to compare and analyse the attitude resources present in speeches delivered by famous political activists and political figures. Furthermore, the current study focuses on speeches delivered by political figures and activists on the Israel and Palestine Issues, as it is regarded as one of the most serious issues that remains unresolved. So, the current study investigates the use of interpersonal functions in speeches and how language resources are used to organise affect, judgment, and appreciation. Furthermore, it reveals how speakers evaluate not only what is happening but also the state of affairs and the people involved in the conflict.

The present study answers the following questions

1. What types of Attitudinal resources are present in Noam Chomsky’s speech delivered at United Nation in 2014?
2. What types of Attitudinal resources are presents in Shah Mahmood Qureshi’s speech delivered at United Nation in 2021?
3. What are the similarities and differences in Speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi on Israel/Palestine conflict?

**Research Methodology**

**Research Design:** The present study is qualitative in nature. This research method descriptively analyses the data. Hancock et al. (2007) states that qualitative method explains social phenomena. This method uses logical reasoning to evaluate the data. This study does not used any statistical tool but uses percentages and frequencies and then descriptively analyse the data.
Theoretical Framework

As this paper tries to explore the interpersonal metafunction of language in political speeches. According to Halliday and Matthiessen (2014), the interpersonal function is the function of participation in language. It sets up the relationship between the speakers/writers and the listeners/readers. Thus, the subjective presence of the writer is there in the text to criticize, approve or disapprove, and enthuse or disgust the people who read or listen to the text. Moreover, it involves the creation of community texts of common sentiments and values and the use of language processes to communicate emotions, tastes, and norms (Martin & White, 2005). So, appraisal theory, which is part of interpersonal metafunction, is suitable to explore, describe, and explain the way language is used to maintain an interpersonal relationship, adopt a stance, and evaluate and construct textual personas. This theory is a significant advancement within the framework of Systemic Functional Linguistics as it provides a new theoretical perspective at the lexical level, not only at the clause level.

To identify attitudinal resources used in speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi, the appraisal theory by Martin and White (2005) is used as the theoretical framework. Appraisal theory divides resources into three main semantic domains: Engagement, Graduation, and Attitude. In this study, our concern is about attitude, so attitude is described as a good or bad scale of how one thing is good or bad in a particular society. Attitude as a language resource contains a lot of interpersonal meaning. According to Martin & White (2005) Attitude is concerned with the feelings, emotional reactions, judgments, and evaluations of things (p.35). Moreover, attitude is further divided into three parts: affect, judgement, and appreciation.

- **Affect**: is a sense or feeling about something, such as adore, felt. It is further divided into realis and irrealis. Moreover, the emotional response is referred to as "realis" when it is related to the present and "irrealis" when it is related to future states.
- **Judgment**: it's about appraising human beings and their behaviour concerning social norms. It is further divided into social esteem and social sanction when evaluating people. Moreover, social esteem is related to social behaviour and social sanction with moral qualities.
- **Appreciation**: it's about the evaluation or quality of things. It is more complicated, as the values differ concerning the type of entity being appraised, but two main categories are: reaction and composition, former indicates how the speaker or writer viewed or perceived it, and later indicates how the object was made up.

Data Collection

For this study, a dataset of two speeches by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi is used. The main goal of these speeches was to show the Israeli atrocities against Palestinians by Noam Chomsky was delivered on October 14, 2014, at the United Nations. The duration of the speech was 16 mins and 55 secs, and it was downloaded from YouTube. However, the second speech was delivered by Pakistani foreign minister Shah Mahmood Qureshi on May 20, 2021, at the United Nations. The duration of this speech was 11 mins and 55 secs and it was downloaded from YouTube. For analysis the speeches, the researchers watched and listened both of the speeches repeatedly to transcribe the utterances of the speakers.
The reason for the selection of these speeches was that they were delivered at a time when Israel and Palestine’s conflict was ongoing, respectively, in 2014 and 2021. Secondly, the speech by Shah Mahmood Qureshi was the most recent one delivered in May 2021, whereas it was delivered by a Muslim having a religious connection with Palestine. Moreover, Chomsky’s speech was delivered in 2014, but even then, it is important as it was one of his famous speeches, and also that no one has analysed these speeches by using the appraisal theory of SFL. Apart from that, selected speeches have international value because they are delivered on the platform of the United Nations. So, both the speeches were of great importance as, through these speeches, the speakers were informing the world about the attacks and injustices that Israel has perpetrated on Palestinians.

Data Analysis Procedure

For the analysis part, the researcher used the appraisal theory developed by Martin and White (2005). So, for this purpose, the researcher first analyses transcription of each speech and identifies three sub-systems of attitude affect, judgement, and appreciation. Furthermore, the researcher also identifies the types of each resource in the text as affect is further divided into realis and irrealis; judgement into social esteem; and social sanction, whereas appreciation is further divided into two types: reaction and composition. After identification of the attitudinal resources, they were presented in the tabular and graphical forms. In Tables and Graphs, the frequencies and percentages are presented. Moreover, the numerical data is described and results were analysed. Then a detailed discussion was carried out on the use of attitudinal resources in the selected political speeches. The results further shed light on how speaker’s express emotion, and convince the audience, convey attitude, and negotiate relationships by adopting appraisal resources.

Results and Discussion

This section of data analysis focuses on answering the questions aiming to investigate the appraisal items’ respective attitudinal resources from speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi at the United Nations. Moreover, this section focuses on the comparative analysis of both speeches and also highlights the important points of the speeches concerning their language.

After analysing the text of speeches by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi; the used appraising resources of Attitude and each attitude sub-types are displayed in the following tables and figures.

Table 1 shows the appraising resources of the attitude presented in Chomsky’s speech delivered at the United Nations. Among attitudinal resources, appreciation items are mostly used by the speaker, and within appreciation, it is a reaction, whereas composition is lower in numbers. Reaction as an appreciation sub-type tells how the speaker thinks about the entity, and Chomsky, through his speech, indicates the overall negative evaluation of Israel’s actions in Palestine with America’s support, such as "A U.S. veto typically," "unremitting and decisive support of the United States," "by establishing how the conflict is viewed and interpreted in the United States and within its broad sphere," "It broke down completely with the next major episode of mowing the lawn" etc. Moreover, quite a greater number of Affects are used in speech, as they indicate the emotional response related to present and future states. Chomsky utilised the realis affect more, while the use of Irrealis affect was considerably lower. such as "pleasure, overwhelming, extensive, etc." As the speaker usually talks
about the incident that happened in the present, but fewer stances of judgement are used by Chomsky in his speech while providing evidence from the literature, so for this, he quoted historians Idith Zertal and Nathan Thrall as "respected historians” and “leading specialists." The main aim of his speech was to inform the world about the attacks and injustices that Israel has committed against Palestinians.

Table 1: Summary of Attitudinal resources in Noam Chomsky’s speech

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudinal resources types</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Sub-types</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affect</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>Realis</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Irrealis</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>25.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgement</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>Social Esteem</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>87.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social Sanction</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appreciation</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>Reaction</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>72.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>27.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>202</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 shows the appraising resources of the attitude presented in Qureshi’s speech delivered at the United Nations.

Table 2: Summary of Attitudinal resources in Shah Mahmood Qureshi’s speech

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudinal resources types</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Sub-types</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affect</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>Realis</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>72.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Irrealis</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgement</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>Social esteem</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>92.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Social Sanction</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appreciation</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>Reaction</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 highlights that the speaker mostly used appreciation resources in his speech. Among appreciation, composition items are mostly used as they indicate how the things or events are composed, whereas reaction is less used in his speech. Shah Mahmood Qureshi’s phrases or words used are “Death echoes, plunged in darkness, occupied territories,” and so on are all part of the composition. He also uses some words or phrases which represent speakers’ thoughts about the event, such as “Gaza, the Israeli air strikes are responsible, the security council has failed, condemn Israel’s forcible and illegal settlement of Gaza”. Next, the speaker uses affect as it is a natural way of talking or discussing something in a present or future state. Shah Mahmood Qureshi talks about the current ongoing conflict between Israel and Palestine. For instance, “this is one such moment.” What we do today will be recorded in history. “ There are some instances of judgments as well. For example, “excellences, beleaguered people of Palestine, we the representatives,” etc. are used. Thus, it shows that speakers were very concerned about the situation created by Israel’s attack upon the Palestinian people in the occupied Palestinian lands. His focus was on the incident, and he also wanted United Nations representatives to do some measurements to solve this ongoing and never-ending conflict.

Attitude resources used by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi

The overall results show that both speakers used a greater frequency of Attitude Resources Appreciation in their speeches than Affects and Judgement. As far as their comparison is concerned, Noam Chomsky has used much Appreciation than Judgment and Affect. The same is the case with Qureshi’s speech. He also used Appreciation more than other attitudinal resources as Judgement and Affect, as shown in figure 1.

Appreciation is the quality of an appraised entity or how people praise something or any event. Chomsky, in his speech, emphasises the importance of peace by negotiating, and the same is done by Shah Mahmood Qureshi, as he also wants United Nations representatives to fulfill their responsibility and take effective measures to solve this issue. For instance, “determined and decisive,” “restore credibility,” “great resistance,” etc. Chomsky further, through the use of appreciation, recognises the injustice done by Israel to Palestinians as well as the US role in the continuation of injustice, such as “one flaw,” “shame and discredit,” “increased substantially,” “stringent restriction,” “actual support,” “infuriated,” “overwhelming,” “taken over” etc. Following appreciation, both speakers use more instances of affect in their speeches. Here are examples taken from the text of speeches produced by Shah Mahmood Qureshi, such as “It is therefore imperative to initiate bold steps,” “should be activated,” “Present time,” etc. whereas Chomsky used words or phrases related to Affects like “very well”, “pretty soon”, “what’s happening is not a secret” etc. Thus, it shows the speaker’s feelings toward this ongoing incident. However, Shah Mahmood Qureshi used the highest number of judgments than Noam Chomsky as he discussed problems faced by Palestinians. For instance, “devastated Palestinian population,” “beleaguered people of Palestine,” etc., whereas Chomsky also uses some instances of judgement while quoting leading historians such as Nathan Thrall and Idith Zertal. Thus, it shows that the major concern of both speakers was the events and actions, not human behavior. That is why judgments are less used in this speech, as through judgments the speaker can only explain human behaviour concerning social norms. Whereas, affect and appreciation are related to feelings and evaluations of things or events.
The attitudinal analysis of speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi at United Nation of Wah University of Social Sciences Volume 6, Issue 1, June 2023, pp. 97-111

**Figure 1**: Showing Attitude resources used by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi (Comparison)

Sub-sets of Attitude resources used by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi

Figure 2 contains the combined results with respect to the sub-sets of attitudes presented in the speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi. It shows the comparison of how two different speakers belonging to two different religions and countries were very concerned by the situation produced by Israel’s attack upon the Palestinian people in the occupied Palestinian lands. According to Martin and White (2005), the speech role between the speakers and listeners and whereas writer and readers are most important because the function of exchange can be understood through these roles.

Figure 2 shows that various resources are used by speakers to convey attitudes and negotiate a relationship. After the analysis of attitudinal resources; subtypes of Chomsky’s and Qureshi’s speeches from the perspective of Appraisal theory are identified that there are some differences in the use of subtypes of attitudinal resources by both speakers. First, we will discuss similarities that appear in the text, and then we will analyse the differences with examples. Realis and Irrealis are sub-types of Affect. Realis is found in the text as it is about people’s feelings or emotions. It involves what a person is offering to the public now or what they will be promising in the near future, which is irrealis. As this element is mostly found in political speeches, our analysis is also on speeches by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi so in the selected text of speeches number of Affect are used as “Pleasure”, “World’s problems”, “May recall”, “I'm quoting” “my own opinion”, “will not be silenced”, “as we speak”, etc. The use of realis shows the feeling of the speaker, and through this, the speaker talks about the present situation. The highest use of appreciation and affect in the text speeches is just because both speeches were about the Israel and Palestine conflict issues, and the speaker provided details about the incident and why this is happening again and again. Whereas the difference can be seen through the figure that Chomsky used more...
instances related to Realis affect whereas in Qureshi’s speech more instances of irrealis affect are presented. Both speakers talked about the current situation, but Qureshi’s focus was mostly on the resolution, as he wants Representatives of the United Nation to take certain measures and try to end this ongoing conflict in the region. Apart from this, it can be seen that Chomsky in his speech gave facts and figures to show the real face of Israel and Americans as he discusses America’s policies toward the Palestinian issue. Thus, it shows that Chomsky talks more about the present situation, whereas Qureshi’s speech also highlighted the present situation, but his main concern was the future state.

Next, both speeches use the number of instances related to judgements, as, through judgements, human beings are evaluated in terms of social esteem and social sanction. Social esteem deals with social behaviour whereas social sanction talks about moral qualities. Thus, both speakers use several judgments while quoting other leading historians and also Palestinians. The figure shows that Chomsky uses judgments related to social esteem as he uses the term or phrases “respected”, “Leading historian”, etc. but the highest instances related to social esteem are used in presented in Qureshi’s speech such as he used phrases like “our first priority”, “beleaguered and occupied Palestine people”. In Qureshi’s speech, he talks more about social behaviours, whereas only one instance related to social sanction can be seen in Qureshi’s speech. Thus, Chomsky uses more social sanctions than Shah Mahmood Qureshi, but judgments are less present in both speeches as these speeches were about actions and events, not about any human entity or behaviours.

Moreover, the use of appreciation and its type of reaction draw the emotional impact of certain actions, events, and things on the reader. So, as observed in the analysis of the speeches, figures show that Chomsky and Qureshi both draw United Nations officials and other world attention to the Israel-Palestine conflict. As, can be seen with the help of example “taking over”, “misleading” etc. are words to grab the general public and world’s attention. Whereas, the second type of appreciation is less used in text and is known as composition. Words like “uninhabitable”, “Dispossessed”, “Huge”, “Brutal”, “Destructive” etc. But attitudinal resources’ reaction is less used in Qureshi’s speech as he is not just showing reaction towards issues but he is also concerned with the organization of the events or things. For instance, “almost run out”, “Gaza is plunged in darkness”, “one of the most powerful”, and “a military occupier and an occupied people”. He does not just show his reaction to this ongoing conflict, but as a political figure, he evaluates things and events. However, as a famous political figure and activist, both speeches were a combination of formal and informal and were also well-prepared speeches that highlight the ongoing problems. They simply want to draw attention by making and providing facts and figures about the Israel and Palestine conflicts.
Discussion

As the study aimed to explore the attitudinal resources of speeches Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi delivered on 2014 and 2021 respectively at United Nation discussing the Israel-Palestine Conflict. The study aims to investigate similarities and differences in the Speeches delivered by Noam Chomsky and Shah Mahmood Qureshi. The present study conducted the analysis by using appraisal theory by Martin and White (2005).

The overall results show that both speakers used a greater frequency of Attitude Resources Appreciation in their speeches than Affects and Judgement. As far as their comparison is concerned, Noam Chomsky used much Appreciation 61% than Judgment and Affect which is 8% and 31% respectively. The same is the case with Qureshi’s speech. He also used Appreciation 57% more than other attitudinal resources as Judgement 13% and Affect 30, as shown in Table 1 and 2.

Chomsky highlighted the Israel-Palestine conflict by adding smaller events that were the main causes of this ongoing problem. Chomsky in his speech, points out, certain events are the root cause of the events that are happening today. Qureshi whereas discusses the event as a religious matter of Muslim world. While discussing any event or incident, appreciation is mostly used by the writers or speakers (Zagorcic, 2015). Chomsky's use of different appreciations in his speech highlights the reaction and rightly recognises the incidents that are happening even today.

This finding is supported by the study conducted by Zagorcic (2015). He studied the portrayal of the Israel and Palestine issue in the newspaper by using appraisal theory. His findings show that the writer uses more appreciation toward event Israel and Palestine, and then judgement and last affect are used less by the writer as writers or journalists describe the scenario on both sides with images of dread and insecurity sentiments. Ailan (2017) also found in her study that Barack...
Obama used appreciation while emphasizing on the importance of the election campaign and the power of democracy. Obama used appreciation and affect resources to show the positive tone of his victory speech, and he used judgement resources to glorify the great role of his supporters.

Chomsky and Qureshi use judgments for various reasons. Judgments are less present in both speeches as these speeches were about actions and events, not about any human entity or behaviours. In Qureshi’s speech, he talks more about social behaviours, whereas only one instance related to social sanction can be seen in his speech. But Chomsky uses more social sanctions than Qureshi. Findings of Sangka (2017) show that judgments were mostly used by Michelle Obama in her speech as she was talking about presidential candidates Trump and Clinton. Michele Obama gave priority to Hillary Clinton by using positive judgments, and she also thinks that Clinton is more capable of being the president of the United State of America.

Whereas Qureshi, being a representative of the Muslim world, wants the United Nations to solve this problem and he also believes that the actions of Israel are unjustified. He also highlights that if this problem is not solved, then the world will see Muslim aggression here as this place is sacred to them. So, a solution should be provided and peace should be maintained in the region. A significant point that is evident from the speech is objectivity on the part of the speaker. Another important point about the speech delivered by Chomsky is that he has not discussed the Palestine issue concerning religion, although the land of Palestine and the Al-Aqsa Complex are holy for three major religions in the world, that is, Islam, Judaism, and Christianity, from different perspectives. What may be the reason for not talking about religion in the speech is that the speaker sees the Palestine issue as not being related to religion, but rather a political issue with aggressions being carried out by Israel, or he believes that religion is another perspective on the Palestine issue which cannot be discussed in the current situation.

Politicians utilise a variety of approaches, tactics, and strategies to influence their audience. Chomsky, as being American, does not support American policies; he targeted American policies in his speech, and he simply shows a negative attitude towards American support for Israel. It is due to American support that the Israeli bombardment in Gaza is still going on. As pointed out by Zagorvic (2015) in his study, the United States is regarded as a close economic and political supporter of Israel, and this is still happening today. Chomsky also clearly mentions that this problem is not new but that the "unremitting and decisive support of the US" to the Israelis is making them strong enough to make this their land, as they have already occupied major areas.

Qureshi's view is more clearly represented through his speech as he is not showing his reaction to this event but pointing out the true events and things. Apart from that, he (Qureshi) wants the United Nations and other peace-keeping organisations to play their part and maintain peace in that region as it is their responsibility. He also points out to the United Nations that it has failed to maintain peace in certain areas of the world, and now they have to take certain measures to maintain peace in the world as peace is more important than freedom, which is everyone's right.

Thus, the study and the findings show the speakers' stance about the event their and different opinions on the same issue. Both view Israel-Palestine issue as brutal and illegal. Chomsky blames the US for supporting Israel's actions in Palestine. He shows how Israel has attacked and why they did it. He explains his own opinion and tries to convince the public about what will happen in the future. Whereas Qureshi believes the actions of Israel are unjustified. His concern was more
about the solution to this conflict, as being a representative of the Muslim world, he wants the United Nation to solve this problem.

**Conclusion**

This research concludes that various resources are used by speakers as they evoke attitudes and address them to share values. It also shows how language is used to express the speaker’s opinion towards a particular event or thing. The study further reveals how both speakers use language is used to show their feelings and relationship with the listener. Both speeches highlight the Palestine conflict in the light of the Israeli aggression that has been occurring there for a long time and is still happening. Both speakers evaluate Israelis’ actions as brutal and illegal. Whereas Chomsky, being American, also condemns the USA’s support of Israel’s actions in Palestine. It shows that he is not providing biased literature but highlighting exact facts and figures related to America. He also shows how Israel has attacked in the last few decades, and he explains why they did it. Finally, he explains his own opinion and tries to convince the readers about what will happen in the future. Whereas Qureshi’s concern was more about the solution to this conflict, as being a representative of the Muslim world, he wants the United Nation to solve this problem and he also believes that the actions of Israel are unjustified. It can be concluded that the language used in political speeches is not simple, but it can build and rebuild opinion towards certain events or actions. Through utilizing linguistic means, speakers not only precisely explain the Israel and Palestine issues but also reveal that the choice of the words attracts the listener’s attention and also evokes their emotions and feelings towards the Israel-Palestine conflict. Speakers mostly employ appreciation and affect in their speeches and use interesting phrases and expressions to prove their main claims, as Qureshi did. Chomsky also used the phrase "mowing the lawn" as Israel is silently occupying the Palestinian lands and this is the aim of Israel in Gaza. Whereas "Mein bhe Hazir hun... I am there for you" is used by Qureshi at the end of his speech, it indicates that Palestine and its people are now not alone, and Pakistan will become the voice of Palestinians. Thus, the choice of the words and phrases shows the speaker's instance and opinion on Israel and Palestine issues, and it also attracts the reader’s attention and evokes their emotions and feelings.
References


Muslim quest for space in India: Prospects and Challenges

Dr. Samina Yasmeen
Associate Professor, Department of Pakistan Studies, AIOU, Islamabad
samina.yasmeen@aiou.edu.pk

Abstract:
For centuries before the British occupation of the subcontinent, the Muslims were the rulers of the land. Being dislodged from the rule and finding themselves as a minority, subjected both to British wrath and Hindu highhandedness, the Muslims found themselves in troubled waters. “There was a strain in Indian Muslim attitudes that gave the communal division a peculiar political importance and objective. From its earliest days, Islam has been a conquering and proselytizing faith. Its tradition in India was one of conquest and empire. The tides and currents of invasion and warfare had flowed to and fro, and great Hindu kingdoms had risen in the wake of periodic Muslim retreats, till the time of the Marhatta Empire. But for hundreds of years, no Hindu Raj had loaded it over Muslims either in India or in the great basins of the Indus and the Ganges.

Key Words: Colonialism, Ahrars, Khaksars, Quest, Separate space

Introduction

British Colonialism in India decided to transform Indian political and socio-economic structures during the 19th century. The process of modernization was initiated, which resulted in a number of structural reforms in administrative, political, and legal structures. The monarchial structures were going to be gradually replaced by representative structures. The legal and constitutional reforms were introduced for the political empowerment of the Indians in different spheres. The Westernisation and modernization of India’s educational and social structures created a new class of Indian nationalists who were aspiring for more political positions, more shares in power, more jobs, and more avenues of participation in different branches of the state. The Muslims remained a backward, underdeveloped, and marginalized community in India. They developed grievances and were looking for some safeguards, including constitutional protections, the reservation of job quotas, and the reservation of seats in representative houses. So, the quest for separate space ultimately resulted in the demand for a separate state. This study is an attempt to explore various stages of this journey.

Development of the Idea for Separate State:

At the all-India level, a search for separate space began as early as the year 1906, when a delegation of prominent Muslims (Syed Razi Wasti, 1993), led by Aga Khan, met the Viceroy. The motive of this meeting, as it was evident from its address, was that "the position accorded to the Muslim community in any kind of representation, direct or indirect, and in all other ways affecting their status and influence, should be commensurate not merely with their numerical strength but also with their political importance" (Tara Chand, 1972).
Muslim quest for space in India: Prospects and Challenges

As the Punjab was given a Legislative Council later than the eastern provinces, awareness of political rights came later. After the introduction of Legislative Councils and the consequent ‘devolution’ of powers, the Muslims in the British Punjab were enjoying power with the help of the Hindus and the Sikhs. The philosophy of the Unionist Party, a tool of the British to secure the province from political upheavals, was functioning in the province; thereby, the gulf between the communities was not being widened. Another very important factor, blocking the segregation among the communities of the Punjab was the absence of any threat of being overpowered or dominated by any other community. It was for this reason that a person who later challenged the idea of Indian nationalism was initially "contributing to the symphony of ‘patriotic’ music with his impartial eulogy of glorious India, Sare Jahan se acha Hindustan humara" (David Page, 1987).

The Montagu-Chelmsford Reforms drew the prospects of democratic rule closer. This development caused a strong stir among the Muslim ranks. "The enlarged opportunities were, however, taken seriously by all three communities" of the Punjab. Mian Fazl-i-Hussain’s efforts to uplift the Muslim community helped it come on par with other communities in the province. An interesting development of this period was that the Sikhs reorganized politically. They liberated their gurdwaras from the Hindu mahants, thereby establishing themselves as a distinct community.

In the post-Montague-Chelmsford Reforms period, two other important developments occurred. Indian politics witnessed the Lucknow Pact in 1916 between Congress and the League. Although, this pact opened new avenues for cooperation, it soon culminated with the end of the Khilafat Movement. Congress denied all those agreements that it had accepted under the Lucknow Pact. Similarly, Congress did not accept the suggestions put forward by Jinnah under the Delhi Proposals. Thus, soon the future politics based on separate spaces for each community began to emerge.

It was at the annual session of the All India Muslim League in December 1930 that Dr. Iqbal delivered his famous address. He challenged the idea of Indian nationalism in an unprecedented way. He pointed out that a common and united Indian nation might have emerged "if the teaching of Kabir and the divine faith of Akbar had seized the imagination of the masses of this country.” But it could not happen. On the contrary, he noted that experience, however, shows that the various castes and religious units in India have shown no inclination to sink their respective identities into a larger whole. Each group is intensely jealous of its collective existence. (Bhaghat Kabir and Mughul King Akbar)

Iqbal’s analysis of communal relations was piercing, but it was undeniable too.

Iqbal did not take an apologetic stance in defence of his Muslim nationalistic views. His brand of communalism was in fact in stark contrast to the narrow concept of communalism, which gets its inspiration from ill feelings towards other communal groups. In fact, his brand of communalism was based on the principle that each group is entitled to freely develop along its own lines. He opined that there was a Muslim India within India because, to him, India was a sub-continent and its units were not territorial as they were in the case of European countries. Based on this principle, he declared that "I would like to see the Punjab, Northwest Frontier Province, Sindh, and Baluchistan amalgamated into a single state. Self-government within the British Empire or without the British Empire; the formation of a consolidated North-West Indian Muslim state appears to me to be the final destiny of the Muslims, at least of North-West India.” (Iqbal’s 1930 Presidential Address).
Being a Punjabi Muslim and having a deep understanding of his native province's politics, he was aware of the aftereffects of the creation of such a state, on the nature of communal relations among different religious communities in the province. Therefore, he was not hesitant to add that the exclusion of Ambala division and perhaps some districts where non-Muslims predominate will make it less extensive and more Muslim in population. He also took certain exceptions to some provisions of the Lucknow Pact and stressed that if territorial redistribution was not accepted, the Muslims of the Punjab would not be satisfied with a "less than clear majority" in the provincial council.

As the theory of 'every action has a reaction' is also applicable in politics, the reaction was expected in the press, particularly the Hindu press, which termed it a "recipe for permanently involving India in civil war." (A. R. Tariq, 1985) It also labelled this address as a "deadly poison for the peace of India." The reaction from the Muslim press was favourable, as one paper noted that Dr. Iqbal rejected the idea of Hindu-Muslim unity, so far considered indispensable for the freedom of India. Not Hindu-Muslim unity, but Hindu-Muslim adjustment, is the only key to the situation. From the Hindu point of view, Iqbal's address was a destabilizing factor for Hindu-Muslim relations. They were very concerned about it. There is hardly a Hindu who has not spat venom against the address. Actually, the address is the first successful attack on the Hindu conception of 'nationality' or the establishment of the Hindu Raj in India. Sir Muhammad Iqbal removed the mask from the secret and hideous moves employed to set up a purely Hindu Raj in India and impose Hindu rule on all non-Hindus, especially the Mussalmans. He did not want to grab the country of the Hindus from them and make it over to the Mussalmans. The Hindu community could not meet Sir Muhammad Iqbal's argument and was atoning for its helplessness by using abusive language towards him.

Iqbal fully understood the repercussions of his proposal on the nature of communal relations, particularly in Punjab. Therefore, he suggested partitioning the province on communal lines. In the early 1930s, such talk of a separate state, or states, for the Muslims of the subcontinent seemed like a far-fetched idea. But the vision was prophetic. However, the Muslim community itself was not yet prepared for a parting of ways. In fact, the stage had not come, and Congress had not shown greater interest in accommodating the League's claim of representing Muslims. The Congress displayed unnecessary impatience in its lack of accommodation vis-à-vis the League. (Kesari, 1931). Iqbal stressed a new solution, changing his thinking on nationalism. He shifted from 'communal unity' to 'communal settlement' between two equal parties or nations—Hindus and Muslims. The idea presented by him was forceful and had momentum in itself. Chaudhary Rahmat Ali, a student at Cambridge hailing from the
Punjab, came up with the name "Pakistan" in a pamphlet titled "Now or Never: Are We Live or Perish Forever?" He pleaded for the thirty million Muslims "living in the areas of Pakistan who were being sacrificed on the altar of Hindu nationalism." Rahmat Ali's works depict the first forceful assertion of what later came to be known as the two-nation theory. Separating the Muslims from the Hindus, he argued, "In the five northern provinces of India, out of a total population of about forty million, we the Muslims constitute about thirty million [seventy-five percent]. Our religion, culture, history, tradition, economic system, and laws of inheritance, accession, and marriage are basically and fundamentally different from those of the people living in the rest of India. These differences are not confined to the broad basic principles; far from it, they extend to the minute details of our lives. We do not inter-dine; we do not inter-marry. Our national customs and calendars, even our diet and dress, are different." (Aitzaz Ahsan, 1996). Rahmat Ali declared that the constitutional safeguards, being offered to the Muslims at that time could never be a substitute for the "loss of separate nationality." (Inqilab, 1931).

Some Muslim leaders extended cooperation to the Simon Commission, like the Jinnah-led faction that appraised it. Congress also opposed the Simon Commission, like the Shafi League, and greeted its members with a general strike when they landed in Bombay in February 1928. The Congress Working Committee attempted to achieve a consensus on constitutional documents by organizing an All Parties’ Conference in February and again in May of the same year. To break the stalemate on communal issues, Congress formed a special committee under the chairmanship of Moti Lal Nehru in May 1928. (K.K.Aziz, 1978).

In this report, popularly known as the Nehru Report, a joint electorate was proposed instead of a separate electorate. Thus, it was a complete departure from the already agreed-upon terms of the Delhi Muslim Proposals and even the Lucknow Pact of 1916. It was, therefore, a disturbing development for the Muslims. A handful of Muslim politicians were willing to accept the proposals, provided some concessions were made. The concessions demanded by these leaders included that the representation in Punjab and Bengal should be proportional to the population. Moreover, reforms in the NWFP and Baluchistan were demanded, as was the separation of Sindh from Bombay. In addition, it also asked for one-third Muslim representation in the Central Legislative Assembly, against the 25 percent recommended by the Nehru Report.

But the provisions of the Nehru Report not only rejected a separate electorate but also refused to accept the reservation of seats in Punjab and Bengal. As the impasse was not broken, Jinnah tried to convince Congress at the All Parties’ Convention held in December 1928 to reconsider the Nehru Report. But Jinnah's efforts could not succeed. This failure was indeed a parting of ways. The Nehru Report was termed "the end of the road for Hindu-Muslim unity". (David Page, 1987). From that point onwards, communal relations in the Punjab and in India could not remain the same as they were in old times—fighting with each other but still living together. Thus, the efforts of the Nehru Committee to close the communal breach had, in fact, widened it, and as it later turned out, permanently”. Jinnah, as a reaction to the Nehru Report, came up with his Fourteen Points. This sonnet of Jinnah could be termed the charter of the Muslim quest for a separate identity within India. The Punjab, with its highly communal character, was much more prone to these changes. The immediate impact of these quick developments was the unification of the Shafi and Jinnah factions of the All India Muslim League in March 1929. Referring to the demands by the Muslims for separate electorates and higher weightage in provincial and central governments as well as in civil services, "It was not yet Pakistan, but almost its early embryo, within a weak federal womb" (Stantly Walpert, 2003).
The years 1928 and 1929 witnessed more political upheaval. Activities in the constitutional arena on the one side, and revival of terrorist activities on the other. Punjab became the staging ground for such activities. In December 1928, Bhagat Singh and his companions shot dead a British officer. They also carried out an attack on the Central Assembly in April 1929. They were apprehended and prosecuted. The case was known as the Lahore Conspiracy Case. Bhagat Singh and his companions were hanged in March 1931. These terrorist activities or confrontations convinced the British government that India needed much more than the Simon Commission. Therefore, in October 1929, Lord Irwin announced the setting up of a Round Table Conference.

The Round Table Conference paved the way for a federation of princely states and British Indian provinces. On the question of safeguards, the Muslims made it clear that their community would not accept any constitution without safeguards. (I. H. Qureshi, 1965). The acceptance of the principle of federalism was an important achievement for the Muslims of the Punjab and Bengal because it made it possible for them to envision autonomous provinces within the federation. But as the Muslim majority in both the Punjab and Bengal was marginal, they demanded constitutional safeguards as well. While the Hindus were willing to offer constitutional safeguards to the Muslims in minority provinces, they were unwilling to offer them to the Muslims in Muslim majority provinces, Punjab and Bengal. To make headway, Sir Shafi proposed that Muslims do not insist on 56 percent and agree to have 49 percent of the seats of the Punjab provincial legislative council through electorates while having the right to contest two percent of the special seats. The Hindus felt that it was perhaps the best possible option to prevent the deadlock; therefore, they did not offer "uncompromising opposition to the proposal. But the deadlock persisted as the Sikhs were not prepared to accept less than 24 percent representation, which would leave only 27 percent for the Hindus—a ridiculously low percentage for a community that constituted 32 percent of the population. (S.Qalb-Abid, 1992)

The Punjab's communal problem was not only a Hindu-Muslim affair; the Sikh factor made it a complex triangle. The Sikh reaction to the Muslim demands was very aggressive. One Sikh paper demanded that either the Muslim majority areas be detached from the Punjab or central Punjab be made a separate province if representation was to be given on communal lines. By March 1931, the Gurumukhi language paper, Akali, was demanding 30 percent representation for the Sikhs, which was in fact 6 percent more than the actual population of the community in the province. The Sikh paper went to the extent of declaring that the Sikh community will never tolerate the "rule of the Muslims and will strain every effort to destroy such a rule." For the Muslims, the invention of the Sikh problem owed its origins to the Hindus. A Muslim paper wrote that the 'Sikh problem' is only an invention of the Hindu mind. It was one of the cleverest tricks ever devised in the history of India to deprive the Muslims of their political power. (Mashirul Hassan, 1994)

The second session of the Round Table Conference continued from September 7, 1931, to December 1, 1931. New arrivals included Gandhi, Dr. Iqbal, and Madan Mohan Malaviya. This session was important in the sense that it decided on matters like provincial status for NWFP and Sindh, yet the question of minority rights and federal structure remained unresolved. Gandhi asserted that communal disputes should be put aside and the formulation of the constitution should be continued. All the leading minority communities' representatives, including the Muslims, the Depressed Classes, the Indian Christians, the Anglo-Indians, and the resident British Community, concluded with Congress' scheme of eroding separate electorates and announced a joint statement supporting separate electorates. Gandhi's claim that Congress represents all groups in India was not acceptable to many participants in the conference.
Parleys were held between Gandhi and the Muslim delegates. Iqbal, in one of his statements, recalled what exactly occurred during those parleys. He stated that Aga Khan even offered to be Gandhi’s camp follower in the political struggle against the British, if he agreed to the Muslim demands. Gandhi, in turn, imposed many conditions. First and foremost was his dubious willingness to accept the Muslim demands in his personal capacity without giving any guarantee that his party would also accept them.

Second, he demanded that the Muslims oppose the right to a separate electorate for the ‘untouchables. These conditions put forth by Gandhi were not in favour of the Muslims, therefore, negotiations failed. On his return to India, Gandhi restarted the non-cooperation movement.

The British government announced the communal award in August 1932. (Sachin Sen, 1974) It gave Muslims 48.8 percent, while Sikhs were offered 18 percent representation in the Council. Although the Muslim representation was far less than the population percentage of 57 in Punjab, the Muslim population was 16,217,242 out of the total population of 28,488,819, yet they were compensated by being allowed to compete on ten special seats, reserved for landholders, universities, and labour. The Hindu press apprehended that more than half of those reserved seats would go to Muslims, making them the majority as per their demand. (K. L. Tuteja, 1995)

The Muslim media argued that the Muslim members would still require the support of non-Muslim members of the Council to have a working majority. The Sikhs were very disappointed in the award. Khalsa Review commented, “There was nothing left for us now but to raise a standard of wholesome agitation and protest against this partisan award, which reduced us to a state of utter subservience to a community whose record of tyrannies was written in letters of blood.

Towards the end of 1932, the third session of the RTC was held, but because of the absence of Congress and Jinnah, it turned out to be a non-event. This session built upon the work already done and finalizing the details, as new initiatives could not be started without the participation of an important stakeholder like Congress. The proposals arising out of the three sessions were published as a white paper in March 1933. After its approval by the parliament, a Joint Select Committee was setup to make recommendations, on the basis of which a bill was to be drafted. It was finally on the basis of the report of the committee that a bill was introduced in parliament, which, after its approval, became the Government of India Act 1935. This Act did not modify the separate electorate for the Muslims, nor did it change the communal distribution of seats already laid out in the Communal Award. After enactment of the new Act, the Muslim correspondent of the Civil and Military Gazette commented on the issue in the following words: “Within reasonable limits, Muslims were prepared to turn the future, but they refused to allow any safeguards that existed for their protection to be destroyed at this stage. Though they would only be delighted if the occasion for the use of these safeguards never arises and they become a dead letter through rejection.

The Punjab, being the home of divergent communities, was the key province for the competition for power. The deep communal divide, which was revealed by the constitutional debates about the future, The state of Muslim politics has been described in these words: by the end of the 1930s, “All India Muslim politics had become in essence the sum of the politics of Muslim provincialism, and all the Indian Muslim politicians without a provincial base had either to withdraw from politics or submit to these forces.” (David Page)
The decade of the 1930s witnessed great changes in Hindu-Muslim relations. Not only were there communal riots on a large scale, but there were also demands for partition on communal lines, along with debates on constitutional rights for each community. Due to the execution of Bhagat Singh, Raj Guru, and Sukh Dev in 1931, however, communal sentiments subsided temporarily. Even those who were opposing such activities were shaken by their execution. Zamindar, a Muslim paper, noted, It is gratifying to note that those who were bitterly opposed to the line of action adopted by Sardar Bhagat Sigh and his companions have been moved by their sacrifice.

In 1931, a Hindu police constable insulted the Holy Quran in Kashmir. This led to disturbances there. Majlis-i-Ahrar, organized mainly by urban Muslims and the ulema, took the opportunity to launch an agitation. Ahrar termed the defence of Kashmiri Muslims "the defence of Islam. Majlis sent people to support Muslims physically against the Hindu Maharaja. For Hindus, it was a great conspiracy by the Muslims to destabilize the Hindu Raja. The Hindu press wrote that "under the cover of Muslim rights, a mentality is developing, the sole aim of which is to injure the Hindus." Another paper wrote that Kashmir was a Hindu state and that certain nasty Muslim agitators from the Punjab were responsible for the distress. The Tribune went even further and deeper to bring 'the pick of the branch' argument, which stated that at the bottom of this engineered agitation there were two menacing ideas. One was to divert attention from the burning issues of India's constitutional deliverance. The other was to further the professed aim of the Iqbal School to have a chain of provinces and states under the Muslim Raj in north-west India. Considering the strength of the agitation and the support of the Punjabi Muslims, Hindu papers demanded that there be no attempt to communalize the administration of Kashmir or politically empower the communal majority. They argued that if such developments took place in Kashmir, Hindu India could not stay aloof and would be bound to intervene as an all-out majority in the country.

In early 1932, the Ahrar Movement started losing momentum, yet the religious and emotional idealism initiated by it could not be curbed. The Ahrar movement had a radical impact on communal relations in the Punjab. In December 1931, Hindu-Muslim riots broke out in Lahore. Ahrars were held responsible for the origin of the riots by the Hindu press, while the Muslim press linked the beginning of the riots to the Mahasabhi mentality of the Hindus. These attacks and counterattacks were having a spiralling effect on deteriorating communal relations. The following quote from a Muslim paper (Muslim Advocate, 1933) depicts how communally charged the atmosphere of the province was at that epoch of history:

Anything done to injure the cause of a minority is called nationalism in the Hindu lexicon. If you want to be a nationalist, sell your man at the hands of Gandhi, live on Congress stipends, revolt against your religion, crucify the interests of your community, wear Khuddar, and delude the world with the false name of ‘nationalist.’ If you cannot do so, you are a traitor, a communist, a Tory, and what not. The nationalism of a Hindu is to aggrandize his community, but the same ‘ism’ with a Muslim means self-aggrandisement, treason with the community, and support for the abominable Congress’ cause to exploit the Muslims with the aid of British bayonets.

Ironically, for communal relations, the Hindus too mirrored these views. The Hindus, the most advanced and industrious community of the Punjab, believed that they were confronted with a majority that was "lay" because it had been "spoon-fed, slow to change, egocentric, and educationally backward." In fact, Muslims were behind both in economic and educational fields. For that very reason, they demanded separate communal representation even in higher services, but such Muslim demands were termed "monstrously iniquitous" by the Hindus. So when the
Home Department issued a resolution in 1934 regarding the representation of Muslims and other minorities in the services, the Hindu press was quick to criticize it. Targeting the Muslims directly, Hindu papers named Iqbal and Haji Rahim Bakhsh and wondered whether they were willing to pay taxes in the same proportion in which they demanded representation in the services.

The atmosphere was so highly charged in the Punjab that it facilitated moots from both sides for partitioning the province on communal lines. The Hindus wanted to divide the province in such a way that the majority of Muslims could be neutralized. The Eastern Times was severely critical of a proposal from Mahasabhist Hindus to detach some eastern districts from Punjab and form a new province with Delhi as its capital. The Hindus, of course, were ‘blaming’ the Muslims for conspiring to establish ‘Pakistan’. An interesting proposal, however, presented by the daily Herald, surfaced in 1935. The paper concluded that the solution to the communal problem lay in the partitioning of the province. However, it was proposed that Muslim majority districts of Derajats should be inducted into the NWFP and the rest of the province should be given to Hindus and Sikhs. The Muslim reaction to this novel proposal was quite harsh. A Muslim paper made it vividly clear that either the “whole of India will split up in hundreds of parts” or the Punjab will remain intact and "Hindus will have reluctantly accepted the Muslim majority."

There was practically no representative voice for the Muslims in such a gloomy period. The All India Muslim League had split into two factions. M. A. Jinnah, leader of the League, was so disappointed by the situation that he quit India to settle in England. In the meantime, there was a growth of regional Muslim parties like Ahrar-i-Islam, the Khaksa, and the KhudaiKhidmatgar. Khaksa's activities had grown to such an extent that the government considered notifying it as an unlawful association in Punjab. Although these parties further weakened the already fragile position of the League, despite that, they infused a spirit and pride of Muslimhood in the community. They also provided experience with political organization and agitation of their own. Unlike the Khilafat Movement, this time the Muslims were themselves masters of their fate. In turn, the League successfully utilized the spirit and experience of these regional parties in later years.

Apart from these parties, some individuals also worked to infuse spirit among the almost-dead crowd of Muslims. Maududi was notable among those who gave intellectual leadership to the Muslims. As the Congress was propagating the slogans of Indian nationalism, socialism, and atheism, Maududi was keen to know and describe the outcome of it for the Muslims of the subcontinent. He opined that "we cannot support the nationalists in their struggle for freedom because it is more cursed than the slavery of the English people." Despite his later leaning towards the Congress, he pointed out that the Congress’ claims for democracy and Indian nationalism were poisonous for the Muslims, as these referred to a united democratic India where the Muslims would always remain subjected to the Hindu majority rule. "The rule of democracy as conceived and practiced by the Indian National Congress would forever give three votes to the Hindus and only one vote to the Muslims.” He considered that a combination of democracy and Indian nationalism was not workable in India. He opined that Hindu nationalism and Indian nationalism should not be merged together. A democratic system in which two nations of different complexions are united will obviously lead to the assertion of hegemony by the bigger nation over the smaller one. The bigger nation will be self-determined, while the smaller will be helpless. So far as the Muslim nation was concerned, they should have political power because, without it, no society could keep itself intact. All the political and religious leaders of the Muslims had failed to understand the real problems of the Muslims. Those who were
Muslims and wanted to remain Muslims should give up the idea of nationalism. They must disassociate themselves from the movement that wanted to dissolve Islamic nationalism into territorial nationalism.

Maududi not only identified the problem but also proposed certain alternatives to meet the challenges. He proposed that to produce a democratic state on sound footings in India, an international federation or a state of federated nations should be established, or autonomous states should be demarcated within India for different nations. He also identified certain areas that should be given to Muslims under this scheme. Moreover, if both earlier options were not applicable, then there should be separate national federal states, one for the Hindus and the other for the Muslims. In the last of the mentioned options, he had roughly recommended a nation-state for the Muslims of India. This was along the same lines that were lately followed by the Muslim League in Pakistan Resolution, though in a roundabout way. Maulana Moududi also criticized the ulema and other Muslim leaders who were in support of Congress, for their shortsightedness.

The Hindus wanted to keep Punjab and India intact. From the Muslims point of view, a democratic India without the presence of the British was a horrible scene to imagine. They were well aware of the Hindu mind. They considered it right that the process set by the British would continue even after their departure. The Muslim leaders thought that then they would be at the mercy of the Hindus. Although they were a majority in Punjab, their number was not much more than the combined opposition of the Hindus and the Sikhs. Therefore, a feeling had developed that if Punjab remained united and independence was awarded to India, there could be no functional majority of Muslims even in this province. Moreover, the Muslim government of the province would also have to face the government of the Hindus in the centre. The search for separate space was exclusively a Muslim drive, but the Hindus, through their attitude towards Muslims, provided the propulsive power for it. Jawahar Lal Nehru, wrote that the essential spirit of Hinduism was that the Muslims wanted to coexist with the Hindus, but their bad experiences after the 1857 War of Independence taught them hard lessons. They experienced that practically, ‘to live and let live’ was non-existent in Hinduism. The genuine fear of Hindu dominance had pushed the Muslims to look for safeguards and eventually to search for separate space. Having witnessed the Hindu attitude during the functioning of the Congress ministries, the Muslims believed that their real fight was against the Hindus. Conscious of the fact that only forty five million British had practically swallowed the whole world by becoming powerful, they feared that if these 22 crore Hindus, who are equally advanced in learning, intelligence, and wealth as in number, became powerful, then they would swallow Muslim India and gradually even Egypt, Turkey, Kabul, Mecca, Medina, and other Muslim territories (B. R. Ambedkar, 1976).

Conclusion:

Muslims’ quest for a separate state started with the demand for job quotas and the reservation of separate seats in different representative institutions. The Minto-Morley reforms of 1909 provided a separate electorate for Muslims, which resulted in active Muslim political participation. In 1916, through the Lucknow Pact, the Indian National Congress also accepted Muslims’ right to separate representation and promised to provide one-third representation to central legislatures. The pact further facilitated communal harmony, and Hindus and Muslims joined hands during the Khilafat movement. The short-term harmonious relationship started deteriorating in 1922, and the introduction of the Nehru committee report largely reversed the political consensus between Congress and the League. The promised
concessions and guarantees were largely reversed, and Congress refused to entertain Muslims’ amendments presented by Jinnah in his fourteen points. The failure of roundtable conferences further widened the gulf between the two communities. The 1936–37 elections reflected these political polarizations. Although Congress won the elections and emerged as the majority party, it failed to win Muslims’ confidence. The conduct and behaviour of Congress ministers further sharpened the cleavage, and Muslims’ perception of Congress as Hindus representatives’ party largely gained wider acceptance. Ultimately, Muslims were forced to demand a separate homeland for themselves in Muslim majority areas to safeguard their political, economic, and social concerns. So, the Muslims’ political journey from the demand for a separate electorate culminated with the demand for a separate Muslim state in Pakistan.

References

A R Tariq, Speeches and Statements of Iqbal, p. 12 (Lahore, Sh. Ghulam Ali 1973, p.23)


Dhillon, Singh, Gurdarshan, “Truth about Punjab: SGPC White paper, (SGPC: 1996), University of

Dr. B R Ambedkar, Pakistan or the Partition of India (Lahore: Book Traders, 1976), p.265.

Dr. Sachin Sen, Birth of Pakistan, (Lahore: Book Traders, 1978), p. 114


I H Qureshi, A Struggle for Pakistan, (Karashi: University of Karashi, 1965), p.200


Latif Ahmed Sherwani (ed.), Speeches, Writings and Statements of Iqbal, compiled (Lahore: Iqbal Academy, 1977 (1944), 2nd ed, pp.3-26


Sir Muhammad Iqbal’s 1930 Presidential Address to the 25th Session of the All-India Muslim League Allahabad, 29 December 1930. (http://www.jinnahofpakistan.com/2010/04/allama-iqbals-presidential-address-at.html)


