

Comparative Discourses on Language variation: A Study on Prostitutes in the Novels of Indo-Pak

Amara Faheem¹, Dr. Akmal Basharat²

<p>Article History:</p> <p>Received: 12 June, 2019</p> <p>Accepted: 18 May, 2020</p>	<p>ABSTRACT</p> <p>The focus of this research is the inspection and dissection of the discourses adopted by different genders to portray the marginalized women, in their novels. It will expose the writers' attitudes towards such females, particularly in the Patriarchal society of Indo-Pakistan. Literature is considered to be an echo of life, so it should present a clear reflection of society. Each writer has peculiar lens to observe various social aspects and thus has different representative styles and specific textual material. It can be more diverse while writing about the looked down upon characters belonging to the outcast segment of society i.e. the prostitutes. The difference in gender may give rise to a different social opinion about fallen women. On the other hand, the society of Indo-Pakistan has some antagonistic points of view as compared to other societies because of the patriarchal order. This research will examine the particular difference of social ideas about the social perception of prostitutes. So, when different writers paint the fallen women personages, what type of language they use? What would be the selective tools and thoughts behind presenting them? How they paint a whore? The foundational framework for this research is based on the paradigm of critical analysis into the downgraded characters. This research is purely qualitative using the constant comparative procedures of qualitative inquiry.</p> <p>Key Words: Gender differentiation, selected novels, marginalized women, patriarchal society, and writing style</p>
---	--

1. Introduction

The Italian word 'Cortigiano' refers to a well-educated and independent woman, who attends the court. She may be a trained artist or artisan of dance and singing. She associates herself with the upper-class society which provides her power, luxuries, and status in exchange for entertainment and companionship. But with the passage of time, courtesans started lowering their image and became sex providers and became ill-reputed

^{1,2}Lahore Leads University - Lahore

characters. Such female characters have remained part of the society at every stage of history. Literature is replete with characters of fallen women who are considered to be a social and moral stigma on society.

British involvement and bloody riots in Indo-Pakistan forced many creative minds to depict the circumstances and describe them, particularly the declined status of courtesans in their fictions. The social critique heralded the prostitute-courtesan courtesy (and more generally, the lower orders of society, the *ajlaf* (low caste) of which she remained apart), as ethical figures struggling against the undue social organization and the ethical dictatorship of the self-appointed spokesmen of community. All through the late nineteenth century, Muslim social reformers expressed the condition of women in society; ethical (*Akhlaq*) literature was reformulated for the sake of correcting the social values.

Many novels of the nineteenth century focused on the need of educating respectable women. Otherwise, it was widely surmised that the female world (women's quarters) would have dark, ignorant and susceptible influences on women belong to the lower classes; who moved between the domestic sphere and the public markets. It would become upper-class women proper wives and mothers, inspired by the revolutionary trendsetting of educator Sir Syed Ahmed Khan. This is epitomized also by Nazir Ahmed's novel, 'Mirat Ul-Arus'; idealizing the educated housewife, having knowledge about arithmetic, reading, writing, and religious scriptures (Quran), thus enabling her to manage a household skillfully and be considered a socially respected woman.

According to Sharar (1991), the institution of prostitution in Oudh developed throughout the sovereignty of Shuja-ud-Daula (1975, 34-35). In the nineteenth century, during the reign of Amjid Ali Shah and Wajid Ali Shah, it acquired the status of a highly acclaimed form of civilization with its peculiar social values. According to Russell, In these ages, besides the sex workers of Umrao Jaan's period, choruses and dancers were also extremely qualified in the conversational philosophy (1992,107).

This was corroborated in newspapers such as *Oudh Akbar* which noted that ‘under British rule, the traffic (prostitution) is somewhat lessened; the plan adopted by bawds now is to go into independent states, where they can act as they please. In some cases, the demi-monde tawaif (a whore) married into the respectable family as they transitioned into gaanewale (professional female singers): Malka pukhraj as well as Akhtari Bai. Throughout the first two decades of the twentieth century, tawaif (a whore) played a central role in the development of new media and technologies, from the advent of the theatre to radio recordings. In fact, Gramophone Company’ made the first recording in 1903 by Gauhar Jaan, an upper-class courtesan of Calcutta. Between 1890 and 1910, she continued to sing and dance at the homes of wealthy Zamindars (Landlords). This ideology is not separated from its medium language of Urdu in Victorian society.

Fashionable and painted women, champagne, violin’s sighing, and a Negro dance with the sentimental quiver of a heart-breaking ballad were all, a spectacle of the days before the war of 1857. Some British soldiers were playing the violin, acknowledging the applause of the crowd with glittering smiles remained as cold as marble. Prostitute, a charming woman, creates a scene of attraction and applauding. A common feature of the genre in the early twentieth century was the sexual fantasies, taboo subjects, or fantasized on the theme of prostitution, which may or may not is expressed in explicit language. (Kronhausen, 1969).

Though Prostitutes performed many valuable roles in the past, the declining status of prostitutes has been the hot topic of the early decades of the twentieth century. Different authors reflect their characters with different perspectives or as their innovative perceptions were. This paper represents the portraits of the prostitutes by writers of different genders with a different opinion and thought about the downgraded character in the novels of Indo-Pakistan.

Language is a conduit that helps to perform many social concerns in front of the public or in private places. Deprivation, deficiency, and scarcity of resources are the steepchases to which the social animal has to learn about.

The sources, connections, bridges, and resources are the elements of steps to stairs. Without gaining the art of language, the expressions of emotion, movements, and assumptions remain silent and quiet things considered as dead and deceased. It means that words, actions, and thoughts, everything needs some form of language for its expression. Low-class creatures, enslaved and the fallen-women in the patriarchal society fall in the social category, which has no fixed rights to express their feelings. For Hindu nationalists, the middle-class national narrative has been interpreted as representing a decadent Muslim subject that is antithetical and anti-chromatic to the national project in contemporary India. For South Asian Muslims of the extent of Mughal heartland, it proposes an approach to generate wisdom of this very position by beckoning to a luxurious and lavish past while also maintaining a historically positioned and distinct Muslim cultural identity.

The status and existence of Courtly Dancers have been the cultures in Indo-Pakistan who have a significant role in educating the manners and etiquette to reasonable families. It would be an honor for such families to get the art of learning from the characters that afterward became fallen. Their status shifts from the executives and lavished life to the ill-reputed characters and became the stigma for the society, which has been a topic of discussion for many writers. But the criteria, observation, and perception of different writers vary, and the purpose of this paper is to check and investigate this varies from a different perspective by the writers of both genders; male and female.

2. Literature Review

From Reynolds's Rosa Lambert to Hamid's Moth Smoke, there are a number of examples of those women who got dishonor from society. It was a favorable motif after eighteenth-century English narratives to talk about such characters. In these representative stories of prostitutes, the writers not only portrayed the character of a whore but of a chaste

woman also, with the comparison of the dual female personality: fallen woman and the virtuous home lady. These courtesans would have a reputable position in the culture, in contradiction with the fallen women, who are specified sex workers (Watt, 1984, 3). This disposition towards prostitution, which emerged because of the puritanical Victorian ethics, was one of the elements that had constantly happened in the civilization of Indo-Pakistan. In various societies: lifestyle and customs, from the hetaerae of early Athens to the Courtesans of medieval times, occupied a position of prestige somewhere in society. They had highly remarkable information about poetry, music, drama, and dance skills in the manner of the court which engaged a lofty place in society for hundreds of years.

According to a Biographer's account, "her arrow never missed its mark and thereof such that even the best horseman could not keep stride with her". By the twentieth century, the tawaif (a whore) had literally become the 'Fallen Woman' (Waheed, 2011). As a Public woman, the tawaif (dancer, a whore) became the subject of raising the moral regulation from the mid-twentieth century onwards by the emerging Indian middle classes. By the third decade of the 20th century, there appeared some new ways of communicating and describing the 'Fallen Women' regarding the social impact and literary images.

Jyotsna Singh witnesses that Dancing girls or sex workers had remained an article of both Hindu-Muslim societies and the culture sustained till the nineteenth and smoothly to the twentieth century until the previous remnants of wealthy nobility were embossed out (Alison, 2008). According to colonial observers, 'those girls had high knowledge and training and also got government protection'. At that time, they were allowed to be spare from any disgrace, documented as a separate qualified class, and have to give tax bestowing to their finance. The place they engaged in culture was outside the inland sphere and even ends to the influence cores of the privileged class. Breds depicts their positions well, "At the courts of the various Indian rulers, the courtesans were accepted as a very influential group" (ibid).

Courtesans did have associations with princes, noble families, and merchants and had value and authority. They used to issue commands on the laws of manner, decorum, melody, and dancing sessions. They entertained the esteem of the court, It was also a custom for young noblemen to visit frequently the most famous Kothas (establishment) to learn good manners, the art of conversation and to improve a taste for poetry (ibid).

This paper reflects the opposite side of the respectable character when they appeared as the stigma for the society and the man warned their wives to have a distance to the fallen women, as in *The Courtesan's Quarters*. But there might be different perceptions and various representative styles to depict and represent such ill-reputed characters of the society. This research is the analysis of such variations in representations by both genders; male and female. If male members are using the abusive and rude language for such characters, as in *The Courtesan's Quarters*, *My Son the Fanatic*, etc., whether female writers are also using the same language with the same thought.

In the 'Nana', Emile Zola remarks to sketch the character of her heroine as, "Nana was nude with quiet audacity; she appeared in her nakedness, certain of the sovereign power of her flesh. Some gauze enveloped her, but her rounded shoulders, her Amazonian bazooms, her wide hips, which swayed to and fro voluptuously, her whole body, in fact, could be divided, nay, discerned, in all its form like the whiteness of tilt, beneath the slight fabric she wore" (Zola,1880, p,129).

Nana has taken possession of the public, and now every man was her slave. The prostitute has been an unstable social category and an aesthetic representative's; a window into the cultural politics of nation and community. As a public figure, the fallen women became the subject of the tint of moral regulation from the mid-nineteenth century onwards by the colonial state or by emergent Indian middle classes. The removal of the prostitutes from the local communities by 1910 was due to the emergence of the conservative sexual politics of urban reformers and revivalists who saw the dancing girls and whores as a threat to the new moral order and compassionate marriage, had become the norm.

Different writers use different narrative strategies in order to articulate the unspeakable and to uncover the obfuscation, silence, and omission drive from the society of Indo-Pakistan. 'Social' as a language of excess invites an evaluation and subversion of the cultural construction of sex, class, and gender because of textual and thematic concerns from the cultural mode of fiction, flavored true soil of the society. How does a writer demonstrate a culture of domination and suppression upon a marginalized female; a prostitute in the patriarchal society of Indo Pakistan?

3. Research Methodology

Writers would have different values and criteria to notice and demonstrate the social aspects. Literature, as a reflection of life, has a number of precedents about the changing status of fallen women, from dancing girls to sex workers. Every writer has a different lens to observe the society; patriarchal order, about the whore. It can be more diverse while portraying different genders. The language, terms, motifs, presentation style, etc. of both genders may be altered. This research will help to reveal the variation of thought and presentation of both genders while talking about the living creature of the red-light area; female-prostitutes.

Different discourses and situations upon the discussion of the prostitute by different writers have been the study of this research. What are the differences in the mentioned writing of different writers, particularly about ill-reputed and deliberated bad-character women in the patriarchal societies of Indo-Pakistan? This research is purely qualitative, which will help to analyze the language and diction which male and female authors use for the fallen women; join establishment either because of oppression or for the economy.

This paper refers to attempt the study, to organize the language above phrases and larger linguistic units, such as conventional exchanges or written text. It follows the analysis of discourses that is also concerned with language, in use of social context, and particular with communication or conversation between orators. One of the ways to analyze

the variation in language behavior has been developing since the early 1960s. It isolates various factors in the social situation which influence or interest with kind of language used, and to discuss associated functions which language fills in different situations. Language does not play a constant role across different social situations: It would reveal how unimportant language may be in a certain context!

There are several other ways of informally organized demonstration of discourse. Conversationalists, themselves regularly refer to discourse structure in the course of the conversation, by utterance such as: oh! By the way ...; anyway, as I was saying.....; or that reminds me. "In everyday situations, conversationalists are aware that not anything can follow anything: some utterances require to be peered by such ensconce or a claim of reverence. (Cf. Schegloff and sacks, 1973). This way of communication would help to investigate the writers' style of delivering the dialogue or portraying the characters of the prostitutes.

This research is purely qualitative research where no statistical data is required or available. The research will focus on the language used by different writers for the character of prostitutes. This will be a comparative study of the writings and thought of two different genders, talking about the fall-down grading character of the society, particularly patriarchal order in Indo-Pakistan. This research will be a content analysis of the exploratory way of investigation, which assists to explain the social or a mutual thought of men and as well as women embedded in the discourses they used.

4. Discourse Variation

A conversation is wholly syntactic: its unity depends on numerous quite different types of mechanisms, e.g. social interaction. The category 'Prostitute' remained a tenuous one, since 'singing and dancing girls' were included in the category of such 'Objectionable Persons' of towns and localities. Even sharing train compartments with such women, was considered to be a problem for the bearers as fears in the *Nasim-i-Hind* in 1896 about

‘contamination with fallen women’. Railway authorities were called upon to ‘warn station masters against permitting bad women to sit in the special carriage, expressly reserved for the accommodation of respectable native females.

Throughout the early 20th century, Urdu novellas and chapbooks repeatedly warned readers to remain distant from prostitutes, lest they fell into debt, disease, and disrepute. In the 1903 novel, “Shah Begum”: the story of a Bazar beauty, a former cantonment prostitute who moves into the city with her mother, seduces the hero, Pyare Lal, by inventing a ‘Tale of Woe’. The author ends the story by informing the reader that had Pyare Lal is not ventured near the mischief-making Shah Begum, as he would not have had to pay so dearly by not only contracting a venereal disease, but lacking money to pay for his cure (Sevgi O. Aral, Mead Over, Lisa Manhart, and King K. Holmes, 1993).

Discourses should in principle be analyzable terms of syntagmatic constraints of a possible sequence of utterance. ‘Ice Candy Man’, ‘The Courtesan’s Quarters’(A translated version of Bazar e Husn), ‘Moth Smoke’, ‘Umrao Jaan Ada’ etc. by male writers are the novels of particular sequence; Paraphrase-able which have different motifs turn around the lives of prostitutes. It is both apt and significant, and also somewhat absurd. There are many examples of odd juxtaposition in the novels written by male writers while talking about such relegated individuals, such as in the story of “The Bed Number Twelve” by Mitra. He mentioned,

“But here it is not necessary to know in this respect as to who is really a man and who is a woman. Is the difference in the physical sex the only criterion in this matter? Many people are recognized as men, due to their physical signs, but with respect to ideas, emotions, and actions; they are worse than even animals, leave alone the women”.

Such juxtapositions not only occur at the syntactic level but also at the level of discourse. Umrao Jaan (a fallen woman) was a whore from Lucknow, but within a matter of days, the entire neighborhood was talking of her beauty and talent. she seated herself as the embodiment of refinement, (and said) ‘our profession is such, that even if we grab ourselves with the Quran, even then, no one believes in us....whether or not you choose to believe me, I come from an honorable family” (p.160).

The novel, ‘Umrao Jaan Ada’ starts with an image of Feudal Lucknow’, which evaluates a previous age sustained in a depraved milieu of Nawabs (Lords) and Tawaifs (prostitutes) in an impressive but delicate tenure of harmony and poetry. (Mukharjee, 1985.91). As the novel endures, we understand the decline and near the expiration of this debauched nation.

Asaduddin (2001) describes Lucknow as having been ‘ravaged’ at the end of the book; reverberations. Khurshid-ul-Islam’s proposal (1957) is that “read idol of the ‘Umrao Jaan Ada’ is the city of Lucknow and its culture and that the novel is an elegy on its demise”. She (Umrao) consumed several years achieving her melodic range.

Bholi Bas tells Suman, “you don't really need to know classical forms and raags (kinds of music), popular ghazals are fashionable here”. (p.78). Ruswa’s and other writers' amid, the conversation is polygenic; that is, its coherence depends on several natures of devices, such as repetition of events, structural markers, fine synchronization in time, and an underlying hierarchical structure relating sequences of discourses acts. There are two points, one is descriptive; stories in conversation are structured, they have recognizable and describable beginnings, middles, and endings with proper motifs. And the second is methodological.

Labov (1927 d) defines narrative structures as a sequence result in the change of narrative events. For natural conversation; as spontaneous, unplanned, and casual, these terms are opposed such as artificial, contrived, invented, introspective, intuitive, and hypothetical. And both of them can clearly observe in any novel; narration about character and the author, as a storyteller makes it a narrative structure with the spontaneous flow of narration and somewhere with the planned and intentional story. Manto commented in one of his afsany, 'Banjh' to a boy, Naeem, 'he always forgets his romantic stories and afsany because they are fabricated and not have the tint of sincerity. They are only for fulfilling his sentimental need (p.155). Like Manto, Ruswa's selection of vocabulary and structure make his novel, "Umrao Jaan Ada" an artificial story.

Though history gives a shred of evidence on the life of Umrao and the suffering in Indo-Pak after 1857 and then the lifestyle, motifs, pieces of advice, are elaborated Umrao's beauty, etc., all these indications turn to fabrication. The opinion of Javed Siddiqui; a writer who wrote Muzaffar Ali's Umrao Jaan (1981), "There have always been two opinions. I believe she never existed in this world. If she existed where is her grave? No one knows until this date. "Umrao Jaan Ada" of Ruswa became a famous Urdu novel that everyone believes it a novel of real character, though it is not a fact. Amaresh Misra, author of "Lucknow: Fire of Grace" believes Umrao Jaan really existed. "Ruswa met Umrao in 1882 when she was reduced to penury," utters Misra. "She was living as a destitute and she told her life story to him." Amaresh has persuaded that evidence that is mentioned factual, because of some historic signs and indications support the novel.

Writers' reaction and behavior may be automatic, oneself, unconscious, and in that sense spontaneous, yet nevertheless deeply organized in ways that generally unrecognized by users, particularly while talking about the ill-reputed character of the

prostitute. Ochs (1979) provides a very useful discussion on the distinction between planned and unplanned discourse; she defines unplanned discourse as talk which is not thought out prior to its expression. Sociolinguist covers a wide range of study of how language is used in the social context, but all the studies have one thing in common: they deal with language variation. They emphasize how malleable language is and how its form and function change across different social situations within one culture. The aim is off-course to find systematic patterning within the variation. Various social factors determine the individual speaker's use of language. All speakers are multidialectal or multi-stylistic, in the sense that they adapt their style of speaking to pursuit the social situation in which they find themselves.

As Alfred Schutz states: "Successful communication is possible only between persons, social groups, nations, etc., who share a substantially similar system of relevancies. The greater the differences between their systems of relevancies lead to fewer chances for the success of the communication. Complete disparities of the systems of relevancies make the establishment of a universe of discourse entirely impossible".

John Locke (1663) argues that a person, who would enslave to another person, should be regarded as a potential threat to life and liberty at all. In this respect, Manto says in 'The Woman in the Red Raincoat', 'Gangs of young men were still on the prowl and abductions of helpless and terrified girls were common' (p.36).

These kinds of texts warned their readers in poetic form as well, 'Do not love for a prostitute's sake, protect your life and youth for God's sake (Kar na chah tawaif key liay, Bachao Jan o javani varz-e- Khuda k liay). The Kotha (Establishment) can never simply be the world of courtesan alone but is the residence that is occupied at different moments

by the cities' varied inhabitants. As Khurshidul Islam (1957) has pointed out, Ruswa closes Khanum's salon because this shop contained all kinds of commodities and its customers came from far and near, and from all classes of society. The level of their cultural refinement was different from one another. Among them were the connoisseurs of the fine arts as well as barbarians. It was the vantage point from where Ruswa could witness the vast decay. In one of her afsany, the mother-in-law of Naheed says, 'It is the duty of men to visit outside. Our Youngsters are very beautiful that's why girls die for their love. They are not gays so if they meet with girls then what is the issue?' (p.73)

Ruswa, unlike Manto, was an intentional writer who did not speak in a direct way. The text *Umrao Jaan Ada* is a narrative performance, gradually giving shape to *Umrao Jaan* through a double narration, narrated by Ruswa who is himself a writer and an actor in performance, while the *Umrao Jaan* is indulged in self-praising. Ruswa expresses a detailed description of her physical features, her character, lifestyle, and visitors; high forehead, large eyes, good figure, and her silk pajama, fine muslin dupatta, gold necklace, and gold nose pin (pp.19, 20)...“They were like queens holding court, with young handsome noblemen about them as courtiers to keep them amazed” (p.54). Ruswa takes her innocent and virtuous soul and states also her game of love with visitors. He raises voice against the late marriages and shares some reasons to join the brothel but, like a social man of the patriarchal order who admires her through the mouthpiece of *Umrao* herself.

The novel is written by Ruswa, considers the alleged biography of *Umrao*; tells the story of *Umrao* with a clear environment of passive discourse by him. The first-person narrative (somewhere he or *Umrao* herself) is frequently interrupted by remarks made by the fictive listener, who stretches the boundaries of the personal narrative into the impersonal, critical, and objective. In that case, the novel becomes as much the chronicles

tales as considers the biography of Umrao. The text of the novel gives clear indications of the self-consciousness of the author is trying to construct this story as authentic and convincing.

There are many other instances revealed by male writers to decorate the marginalized women such as, in the novel 'Bazar-e Husn' ('The Courtesan's Quarters'), Premchand (1919) articulates the story of a husband (Gujadhar) and his wife (Saman). In this novel 'Bazar-e Husn' Gujadhar feels the pride to join brothel because many of the elite go there but on the other side, he scolds his wife to have socialization with the prostitute and warns her, 'honor and dignity do not come with wealth'. This may be the policy of men of double standards in society that can clearly be observed in their writings. Such as the writer Steve Martin observes that sex is one of the most beautiful, natural, wholesome things that money can buy (Samuel A. Nigro, 2000).

Kuraishi (1994) articulates the extremism of thoughts and ideas on politics, religion, and a prostitute; Bettina, in her story of 'My Son the Fanatic'. Pervez has a friendship with a prostitute and used to share every problem and hope to her. He is worried about the changed behavior of his son. When Pervez trembles in anxiety, then she puts her arms around him and rubs his head. In exchange for love, she enjoys the free cab facility with Pervez. And it was called, 'a ride in exchange for a ride'.

When Bettina wants to discuss this tension of Pervez with his son Ali, he replies to her harshly that if his father loves him, 'then why is he letting a woman like you touch him like that?'. Kuraishi's motif is different; on the subject of the relationship gap but he also expresses some features about Bettina; stood in the rain, wearing high heels, a short skirt, gaudy rings, and ice-blue eye shadows. He not only paints the physical beauty of a

prostitute with the help of the words full of charming but also elaborates on the affiliation of Pervez with a prostitute. Though Ali; another man of the same society is not accepting her, even as a friend of his father.

Kishwer Naheed (1993) said in “Myth and Realities”, ‘women are hired by domestic servants in a few African countries, and female domestic servants are often sexually appropriated by men of the house. Ishfaq Ahmed (2000) wrote some novels on feminist issues and the difficulties they have to face, particularly in the patriarchal society of Pakistan. His fictions appear to be reluctant while personifying the scenes related to the ill-reputed women, but the narration about his heroine is direct and straightforward. He says in one of his novels, ‘Kheal Tamasha’ (Child’s Play) about a fallen-woman and the value of her in a patriarchal order, ‘I take her to the fields of corns. After pushing her shirt aside, I just lay my face on her warm milky chest. She smiles and says to comb my hair with her fingers, ‘tradition in our homes is the same. You are like your brother, Jalal’. I gaze on her but she says after combing with her fingers. ‘For the purpose to which you take me in the fields of corns, your brother also took me for the same cause’. Then the writer goes away from a fallen-girl because of embarrassment.

It is exactly like the hero of ‘The courtesans Quarters’ who joins brothel because the very famous rich personalities go there but feel irritating when talking about a prostitute, because of having a pious soul. This is like a play with words or the true reflection of a patriarchal society. It is the dual standard of a male member in this male-dominated society. Rather in the novel of Umrao Jaan Ada, on one side Ruswa declares her like a whore but on the other side, he notices the virtuous soul and innocent nature of her. In the novel ‘Moth Smoke’ Hamid is the listener of the story of the heroine; Mumtaz, the main character and protagonist, Hamid tries to portray some physical features of

prostitutes as well as of the establishment. ‘A disturbing young girl with long eyelashes brings tea. She bears bells on her ankles that chime as she walks, and I find myself hoping this is the only service she is made to provide, although I doubt it very much. (p.51).

Mohsin Hamid; a Pakistani writer portrays the story of a prostitute in his first novel ‘Moth Smoke’ (2000). Mumtaz (representing heroine of Hamid) was a prostitute before her marriage but now is feeling distressed to adjust in her husband’s home. Hamid says that she is a ‘disturbing young girl, wearing bells on her ankles’. He uses diction while informing her that she has ‘a nice face, good hips, but her breast is not generous, she should eat much’ (p.51). One day Mumtaz goes with her boyfriend to the brothel to meet her old friends. One of her friends (another prostitution) tells him the story of her kidnapping by a man and then to join the establishment (p.52).

He goes with Mumtaz to a Kotha (establishment) and voices the story of one of the whores; Dilaram, who tells Hamid her story to join the brothel. The converse representation by Hamid seems to have sympathy somewhere; he used blunt but discourteous words for them and did not express any praise in a positive sense.

“Sitting hunched over the toilet, I feel the wet smoothness of my skin as my belly doubles over and touches itself. My stomach is so bad that I am passing liquid, it burns. I grab the lota (ewer) and wash. Walking naked to the window of my room, I pulled the curtains and saw an overripe sun swelling on the horizon” (p.23).

There is a liberal and fairly bold sprinkling of allusions: ‘very sexy but not much to drink’ (p.10). He uses bold and direct words for Mumtaz; a protagonist and was a prostitute before marriage, who feels herself a miserable and helpless woman. ‘It’s been a long time since anyone accused me of dressing like a prostitute. What I mean is, we might

attract the attention of the cops' (p.49). The writer made a friendship with Mumtaz and liaison also. Hamid being a banker in the novel says, 'why God gave bankers lips: to kiss up to our clients' (p.19). It has the same narrative strategy as 'Umrao Jaan Ada', 'Khael Tamasha' etc. of 'I' narrative form. Ruswa, Hamid, Ahmed, Premchand, etc. are the audience, participants, observers, authors, and also judges in their novels.

Manto was a short story Urdu writer of Indo-Pakistan, who wrote about fallen women in that society and remained successful to pull the attention of his readers on the subject of the same. In one of his stories, 'The Black Shalwar' he writes, 'most tommies came to her boozed in three or four hours. She managed to cope with six or eight of them and rake in 15 to 20 rupees. He was a brave writer to disclose some hidden painstaking mysteries with bold dialogues when he would tell about his heroine, Sultana's comment to her visitors,' After closing the door he was taking off his coat when Sultana said, 'now come on, give me one rupee extra for milk'. In Manto's other story 'Khushia', he can 'see her standing in front of him naked like a wax figure. Her body was beautiful. For the first time, he had realized the women who rent out their bodies could be beautiful also. This was like a revelation'.

Manto was a literary writer who practiced a number of works on the subject of fallen women and kept suffering a lot of criticism upon his work. His bold style of expression and direct statements made him a popular and courageous writer. In one of his stories, 'Ek Zahida Ek Fahasha' ("A Zahida, a Whore"), he expresses the clear and mirrored statement of men about the fallen women. This is the story of Lahore, before the partition of 1947. Javeed insists his friend Saadat meet his lover Zahida, in a garden. By mistake, Saadat stopped a tonga (a light horse-drawn two-wheeled vehicle) to welcome Zahida, but the horse keeper said to Saadat, 'please go away from this woman, she is a

whore... she plays tricks with Youngsters and gentlemen' (Hazoor is orat sy bach k rahen...is ka kam yehe hy k shareef or nujawan larko ko phansti hy). And on reply, Saadat says, 'by the Grace of God, leave the woman on her base spot, and ensure her about my unwillingness to go' (Khuda k liay isy wahan chor ao, jahan sy laiye ho...kah dena k me os k st jana nahi chahta).

In the novel 'Shehre Lazawal, Abad Werany (Endless City, Populated Barrens) Darakhshanda, a prostitute, says to Phool Wanti about her lover Muner. She says, "Male has nothing to give the female. Your Muner will come to you, depends only to what extent his body may touch your boundaries, and then he will go back" (p. 27). She (Darakhsahnda) then says to begum Mukhteyar, "it is the instinct of a man. He cannot be patient with one lady only, he needs variety. His sex function demands this" (p.38). In one of the other novels, Raja Gidh, Bano Qudsia says, "every man has all secrets of power in function of his sex so he turns to the red-light area" (p. 154).

Although the assigning of men purely to the public space is not entirely correct, as men were able to occupy or inhabit both the public and the private space. Daniela Bredi's analysis (2002) of the courtesan's position, says that this is able to participate in the social life of men and she has a precise accurate social position which is blamable on the theoretical planes but recognized and honored on the realistic one, comprising as it does the means that permits this type of society to remain intact. According to this logic, respectable women belong to the internal, private space which is their domain, and they must not be mixed up with those who, like men, belong to external, public space (2001, 112). Rejecting the idea of art for art's sake, a writer of the modern era is convinced that, given the social and political circumstances all the time, literature needed to serve as a

social purpose. This decision according to Swan had been made from 1907 to 1920 and is clearly reflected to 'Bazaar-e-Husn' too. Manto said in his story of "Khushia", "The naked body of Kanta (a prostitute) stood in front of him like a melted statue and is crossing inside of him. Her body was beautiful. It was the first time; Khushia could realize that body seller may have a healthy physique' (p.177).

Khushia takes Kanta as a shameless creature, and thinks, "she must do shame, though a little...it is accepted, what she is a whore? But prostitutes do not stand naked" (p.178). Manto endorses Khushia's and says, "he is a man and he expects it with senselessness that either woman is pious or public, he should be taken only as a man" (p.179). Khushia reminds one of his childhood memories when a lady tells him to fetch the bucket of water while taking a bath, and then said him to keep in the bathroom, in front of her, "the naked woman says, come here and keep the bucket near to me. I have got soap on my face" (p.180).

Ismat Chughtai, a Pakistani female writer discusses the subject of marginalized women with joy and toy. She takes this subject very lightly. In her novel 'Sorry Mummy', she deliberates about some young and teenage girls who play tricks with their boyfriends, on the other way, there would another option to choose someone else. She says that Mrs. Machal (Mummy) enjoys the rock and roll scenario in her Bangla. She teaches new girls how to trap the young rich boys and not to attach seriously with anyone. She communicates them with the game of love. Chughtai does not seem to elaborate on it an immoral act, rather a part-time entertainment to uplift life at a young age. They are not ashamed of their lifestyles.

The novel begins with the verse of Iqbal from his poem 'Complaint to God', Ice-Candy-Man takes her to the bazaars of prostitutes (Hira Mandi). Ice-Candy-Man's mother was also a prostitute and he is a pimp. After the abduction of Ayah by the Muslim mob, Lenny (a young girl) remains sad and dejected. She finds Ice-Candy-Man a changed man. The day he saw the mutilated bodies of his Muslim brethren, he became a different person. His beloved Ayah becomes a Hindu (a non-Muslim) for him. "They drag Ayah out. They drag her by her arms stretched tautly, and her bare feet that want to move backward, are forced forward instead." This vision evidences a traumatic for poor Lenny and she atones for telling the truth to Ice-Candy-Man. He notifies that Ayah is married to him and has been putative in the family of dancers. Godmother scolds him for ill-treating Ayah, but he raped her. He confesses, "I am a man! Only dogs are faithful! If you want faith, let her marry a dog." But Godmother responds madly by saying, 'you're the son of pigs and pimps!"

They reach an establishment (Hira Mandi) in a tonga. They have approached a well-decorated room with the fragrance of sprinkled flowers. Ice-Candy-Man brings Ayah; his Mumtaz dressed as a bride. Lenny is upset to see grief in Ayah's eyes and Lenny observes, "Where have the radiance and the animation gone? Can the soul be extracted from its living body? Her vacant eyes are bigger than ever: wide-opened with what they have seen and felt. She buries her head in me and buries me in all her finery and, in the dark and musky attar of her perfume."

Fouzia Saeed is a social activist, feminist, folk culture advocate, TV commentator, and writer. She is the author of a well-regarded book on the ethnographic look at prostitution in Pakistan, "TABOO". The nonfiction material of this research exposes the hidden culture of the brothel area. She expounds the inclusive conversation on the lives of

prostitutes, why do they join brothel and how they scheduled the whole day with visitors! Saeed seems to get agree with Ruswa that they (prostitutes) are the unlucky souls to adopt the gifted atmosphere from their mothers, no matter, either they are interested to entertain their customers or have some other plans. But like Maha of *Dancing Girls of Lahore*, they have to suffer if they try to reject that source of receiving money; the only friend of the prostitute, as Umrao, also accepts. In other words, they are to have relations for their earning. Saeed in this book of 'Taboo', used general features of the language, not harsh words, even at some places, she gives the impression while using soft and respected words for the whore. She takes it as only their adopted profession. She does not target their characters which supposed to disagree in fiction. There is no comparison of their personalities with social norms of forced occupation.

Qudsia, a Pakistani Urdu female writer wrote about the life and physical beauty of prostitute. She never faces criticism on her elaborated characters. In her book of *Shehre Lazawal*, *Abad werany*, she said about the beauty of one of the whores that her body was making an appearance, with the deep neck and sleeveless frock of Nailon (a type of cloth), as someone would be making to and fro the branch of ripped peach behind the flowing water (p.08). Her spokesperson is also a prostitute, who is confident to say, 'In my profession, there is no deficiency of helping hands. Until I made objections to someone's wife, her husband used to meet me, and he may change. Some of the times, a newly married young man wants to have experienced before marriage, and I become get ready for him (p.14).

Conclusion

The language a writer uses for the prostitute, particularly in a patriarchal society, is no doubt, bold and direct but there is a difference in language representation because of gender biases or differentiation. A female usually talks in a natural and unconscious way, uses praiseworthy language for demonstrating the charm, and represents them as the innocent and helpless creature. They never use the sarcastic type of sentences rather they believe men to be responsible for it. The researches of Fouzia Saeed and Louis Brown declare prostitute the miserable and alienated women of society; who if want to get rid of the profession of prostitution, society does not accept or allow them as genuine normality. They have become the unacceptable second female gender of society.

The stuff provided by a male writer is totally different. His language may vary with the mood of the society. A Male writer held men guilty to some extent. But his used language is the product of self-consciousness and flowery. He seems to admire her physical beauty while uses abusive terms for her character. For instance, in the novels of 'Umrao Jaan Ada' and 'Moth Smoke', Ruswa admires the heroine; Umrao (a prostitute) but in the first form of speech. Umrao does herself deliver the dialogues of her beauty (self-admiration), and not by the writer (Ruswa). Kuraishi is not feeling guilty to have a friendship with a prostitute in his story but his annoyed son targets him upon this act, in My Son the Fanatic.

A female writer, most of the time focuses on the prostitute's inner soul that seems virtuous and blames man to be accountable for her state in a brothel as in 'Ice Candy Man', Moth Smoke, Umrao Jaan Ada, researches done upon prostitutes, etc. Hamid 's statements about sex are a communicational bridge between the prostitutes, he himself does not get involved in the discussion. Naheed, in her book of "Women, Myth, and Realities" remarks that men are driven by nature to have abuse and domination upon women, which may be based on their sense of marginality or emptiness. We don't know its roots while men are

making no effort to discover it. Men's longstanding war against women is now in reaction to women's movements across the world.

Female writers focus on the reasons and causes which force fallen-women to join the establishment. Ruswa and some other writers may have reasons to discuss in their stories but male writers approach the direct conclusion and just give attention to the physical and apparent beauty of girls in the brothel. Female's research is somewhat different as Saeed in her book of "Taboo" focuses on the life and lifestyle of prostitutes in Shahi Muhalla. She asked a prostitute (Faiza) the reason to come into the brothel, she remarked, 'it's a male-dominated system where men are at the center (p.300)...I did make a good thinking plan for my future...Basically, if we want to analyze patriarchy in relation to the sex trade, we could ask the question, 'who does this system serve?' To answer would be the men who are in power, right? (p.302) ... Ethics are for women, but nobody worries much about the boundaries of standards for men's behavior (p.303) ...No one considers that the man who harassed her could be at fault (p.304). It is men who become the cause of disrespect or dishonor of women, either through rape or Karo Kari, and become the stigma (p.309).

It can be said that female writers use formal writing with features of possessive-pronoun and adjective, and shows self-involvement, while on the other side, male writers use non-formal writing which may be informational as the bold expressive writing style of Ruswa, Manto, Premchand, etc. Time may change but the thought prevailed in a patriarchal society does not accept the change. Louis Brown, a British writer who did research on the lives of the prostitutes in Diamond Market (Red light area in Lahore). She says that the traditional culture of Lahore always spoils whore women. But the ancient institution of prostitution has some elements of protection which have mixed in the new and advanced damn life of the sex market in Lahore.

A century passed but the place of a prostitute in the Patriarchal society of Indo Pakistan is confined with fixed rules; same representation style and same thought of men:

immoral, unethical, and obviously illegal, though women are also not in the favor to legalize it. Female writers publically are not in favor of the whores but in literature, their descriptions are full of sorrow and having pity for those women, except some who joined this profession only to get more and more money.

Manto, Hamid, Ruswa, Kuraishi, Ahmed, and Premchand, all-male writers focus on the work of sentimentalism and their nostalgic projects related to the character of prostitutes. They inform readers about the shameless character of sex workers. On the other side, female as Chughtai, Sidwa, Fauzia, Kudsia, Kishwar, and Brown discuss the suffering lives of fallen-women. They all try to become the voice of this social aspect.

The priority of male writers is to portray and discuss the apparent beauty of marginalized women and female writers inclined to explore the reasons to join brothel and what type of life they have to lead. In books, 'Dancing Girls of Lahore', and 'Taboo', both female researchers have recorded the biographies of some prostitutes who want to get rid of that curse and to get marry with honor. The male character, Gujadhari in 'Bazar Husn' is feeling the pride to join brothel because it is the symbol of dignity, and Gauhar Jaan, a boy in Brothel of Umrao Jaan Ada is singing well. Ruswa does use, not a single word for Gauhar in a bad manner.

In other sense, it approximately may say that a male writer becomes biased while writing about another male member of the society, as having a scene of rape in Umrao Jaan Ada, or the contention between husband and wife in Bazar e Husn, while on the other side, a female plays with prejudice when discusses the other woman, even about an obnoxious woman, no matter, what is going on in patriarchal society about her.

Male writers victimize them only as prostitutes while females portray them as helpless creatures. "Women's fiction reflects an experience radically different from men's because our drive towards growth as persons is thwarted by our society's prescriptions concerning gender", Annis Pratt writes. From a woman's point of view, Male writers have not fabricated much fiction exclusively. Some causes may be that, male authors are really

unable to make a script from the womanly perception or that, they have a dread that, they will be faced or encountered with too much cynicism and skepticism; Williamson's declaration that female are doubtful about feminist interpretations in men's narration.

References

Ahmed, Ishfaq. "Kheal Tamasha". Sang-e-meel publishers, Lahore, 2000.

Ain't I am Woman? Bell Hooks publishers, 1981.

Barry, Kathleen. "The Prostitution of Sexuality". NYU Press, 1995, Google Books.

Beauvoir, Simone, de. "The Secondary Sex". Translated by Constance Borde and Sheila Malovany-Chevallier, 1949.

Bloor, M., and Bloor. T. "The Practice of Critical Discourse Analysis; an Introduction". London; Hodder Arnold, 2007.

Bredi, Daniela. "Fallen Women: A Comparison of Rusva and Manto. *The Annual of Urdu Studies*" 16(1):109ñ127. 2001.

Brown, Louis. "Dancing Girls of Lahore". 2001.

Butler, Judith. "Gender Trouble". Paperback, US, 1990.

Coelho, Paulo. "Eleven Minutes". 2003.

Clark, Welborn, Thomas. "The Novel in India: It's Birth and Development". University of California Press, 1970.

Fairclough, "N. Language, and Power". Longman, London, 1989.

<http://www.feministezine.com/feminist/philosophy/Introduction-to-Marxist-Feminism.html>

<https://www.brainyquote.com/quotes/quotes/s/stevemarti122807.html>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mirza_Hadi_Ruswa

Ibanez, V. Blasco. "A Serbian Night; *the World's Greatest Short Stories*".

Mitra Vishwa. *"My Ladies: Pak Vs Hindustan"*. Print, 2002.

Naheed, Kishwar. *"Woman's Myth and Realities"*. Published by Haawa associates, Lahore,
Printed by combine printer, Lahore, 1993.

O. Brien Dennis. *"Abortion: Maxims for Moral Analysis"*

Pandey, V. K. *"War Feminism and International Relations"*.

Pratt, Annis. *"Archetypal Patterns in Women's Fiction"*. Bloomington, *The University of
Indiana Press, 1981.*

Premchand, Munshi. *"Bazaar-Husan"*. Translation as *"Courtesans Quarters"* by Amina
Azfar forward by Ralph Russel, *Instruction by M. H. Askari, Oxford University Press.*

Premchand, Munshi. *"Sevasadan"*. 1919.

Rossiaud, Jacques. *"Medieval prostitution"*. Print, Wiley, 1998.

Ruswa, Hadi. *"Umrao Jaan Ada"*. 1899. *Translated by Khushwant Singh, 1970.*

Saadawi, Nawal. *"The Hidden Face of Eve"*. *Zed Books Publisher, 1980.*

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *"The Respectful Prostitute"*. 1946.

Shamsie, Kamila. *"A God in Every Stone"*. 1974.

Sharar, Abdul Haleem *"The Lucknow: the Last Phase of an Oriental Culture"*, translators
and Editors, *E.S. Harcourt and Fakhir Hussain (New Delhi: OUP, 2001), "The
Omnibus Addition", 45.*

Stubbs, Michael. *"Discourse Analysis; the Sociolinguistic Analysis by Natural Language"*.
Basil Blackwell, Oxford, 1983.

Tendulkar, Vijay. *"Sakharam Binder"*. 1972.

Umrao Jaan Ada” in Khurshheed-ul-Islam, Tanqeedein, (1957) *Aligarh Educational Publishing House, 1977*

Veena, Oldenburg. “*The Making of Colonial Lucknow: 1856-1872*”. New York, 2001.

Wodak, R. “Language, power, and Ideology”. *Studies in Political discourse, Amsterdam, Benjamins, 1989.*

Wodak, Reds. “Gender and Discourse”. *London; Sage, 1997.*

Wolf, Naomi. *The Beauty Myth*. Print, Publisher; William Morrow and Company, *Yale University, 1990.*

Woolf, Virginia. “A Room of One’s Own”. *Lecture Editions, London, 1929.*

www.urdustudies.com/pdf/24/05SafadiEssay.pdf

www.durrenajaf.com/upload/51310fee618da.pdf

Zola, Emile. “Nana”. Good books, France, 1880 “*A Essay on Law of Nature*” (1663) *John Lock*